

UNITED STATES SENATE

COMMITTEE ON HOMELAND SECURITY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

- - - - -x

INTERVIEW OF: :

CATHERINE ANN NOVELLI :

:

- - - - -x

Room SD-342 and via Webex

Dirksen Senate Office Building

Washington, D.C.

Tuesday, August 18, 2020

9:42 a.m.

INTERVIEW OF CATHERINE ANN NOVELLI

APPEARANCES:

For the Witness:

STUART G. NASH, ESQ.

CHRISTOPHER J. ARMSTRONG, ESQ.

Holland & Knight

800 17th Street, N.W., Suite 1100

Washington, D.C. 20006

For Senator Johnson:

JOSEPH C. FOLIO, III, Chief Counsel, HSGAC

SCOTT WITTMANN, Senior Professional Staff Member, HSGAC

BRIAN DOWNEY, Senior Investigator, HSGAC

LYDIA WESTLAKE, Senior Advisor, HSGAC

SARAH SMERLING, Professional Staff Member, HSGAC

WILLIAM SACRIPANTI, Professional Staff Member, HSGAC

For Senator Grassley:

JOSHUA FLYNN-BROWN, Deputy Chief Investigative Counsel,

Finance Committee

QUINTON BRADY, Investigative Counsel, Finance Committee

APPEARANCES: (Continued):

For Senator Peters:

ZACHARY SCHRAM, Minority Chief Counsel, HSGAC

ALAN KAHN, Minority Chief Investigative Counsel, HSGAC

SOUMYALATHA DAYANANDA, Minority Senior Investigative  
Counsel, HSGAC

VALERIE SHEN, Investigative Counsel, HSGAC

For Senator Wyden:

DAVID BERICK, Minority Chief Investigator, Finance  
Committee

DAN GOSHORN, Minority Senior Counsel, Finance Committee

JOSH HEATH, Minority Investigator, Finance Committee

For the Department of State:

WILLIAM K. KILLION

Bureau of Legislative Affairs

KENNETH A. THOMAS

Office of the Legal Advisor

MAJORITY EXHIBITS	MARKED
1) Washington Examiner article, 4/25/14	25
2) Email, Tramontano to Novelli, 05/16/14	73
3) Email, Jenkins to Duncan and Heidt, 04/17/14	75
4) Email, Malik to Tramontano, 08/20/14	79
5) Email, Redacted to Duncan, Heidt, Sabeen, 11/17/14	83
6) Email, Novelli to Redacted, 10/21/15	85
7) Email from Redacted to Brink, 10/28/15	88
8) Email from E Duty Secretary to Duncan and Dodman, 10/29/15	89
9) Email from Painter to Novelli and Tramontano, 11/6/15	110
10) Email from Redacted to Redacted, Duncan, and Dodman 02/18/16	111
11) Email, Redacted to Redacted, 02/17/16	118
12) Email, Redacted to Redacted, 02/29/16	128
13) Email, Redacted to Bhardwaj, Dodman, Duncan, Haverkamp and other Redacted, 02/29/16	131
14) Email, Redacted to Bhardwaj, Dodman, Duncan, Haverkamp and other Redacted, 09/28/16	148
15) Email, Redacted to Bhardwaj, Dodman, Duncan, Haverkamp and other Redacted, 10/12/16	149
16) Email, Novelli to Redacted and Duncan, 10/24/16	150
17) Email, Nuland to Pyatt, 03/30/16	154
18) Email, Tramontano to Novelli, 10/24/16	159



EXHIBITS (Continued)

MARKED

19) Email, Tramontano to Novelli, 11/07/16	162
20) Email, Tramontano to Novelli, 12/02/19	164
21) Email, Novelli to Tramontano, 12/03/19	164

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 MR. FOLIO: Good morning, everyone. This morning we  
3 are here for a transcribed interview of Ms. Catherine  
4 Novelli that's being conducted by the Senate Committee on  
5 Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs and the Senate  
6 Committee on Finance.

7 This interview was requested by Chairman Ron Johnson  
8 and Chairman Charles Grassley as part of the Committees'  
9 investigation of whether there were any actual or apparent  
10 conflicts of interest or any other wrongdoing with regard to  
11 the Obama administration's Ukraine policy or Burisma  
12 Holdings, as well as related matters.

13 On December 18th, Chairmen Grassley and Johnson  
14 requested Ms. Novelli's appearance for a voluntary  
15 transcribed interview and certain categories of documents.  
16 In response, her counsel has notified us that there were  
17 approximately a dozen documents through a spread sheet. We  
18 have requested production of certain documents, which they  
19 provided to us on Thursday.

20 Ms. Novelli, can you please state your full name for  
21 the record?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Catherine Ann Novelli.

23 MR. FOLIO: Thank you. My name is Joseph Folio. I'm  
24 the Chief Counsel for the Homeland Security and Governmental  
25 Affairs Committee. I'm going to, in order, ask everyone

1 else that's on the line to introduce themselves. I'm going  
2 to start by introducing the folks that are in the room with  
3 me. We're in the Committee hearing room.

4 In the hearing room for Chairman Johnson's staff, I'm  
5 joined by Scott Wittmann, Brian Downey, Will Sacripanti, and  
6 Sarah Smerling.

7 I'm going to ask Chairman Grassley's staff to introduce  
8 themselves next.

9 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Good morning, Ms. Novelli. My name's  
10 Josh Flynn-Brown. I'm Deputy Chief Investigative Counsel  
11 for Chairman Grassley. Today I'm joined by my colleague  
12 Quinton Brady.

13 MR. FOLIO: And now I'm going to ask the staff from  
14 Ranking Member Peters' office to identify themselves for the  
15 record, please.

16 MR. SCHRAM: Good morning. This is Zack Schram, Chief  
17 Counsel for Ranking Member Peters. Ms. Novelli, the  
18 minority's participation today is not an endorsement of the  
19 investigation. As the Ranking Members have said publicly,  
20 we believe this investigation advances a Russian  
21 disinformation campaign and is intended to interfere in our  
22 2020 Presidential election.

23 Chairman Johnson has repeatedly admitted that this  
24 investigation is targeted at influencing voters and hurting  
25 Vice President Biden's Presidential candidacy. In March

1 2020, hours after Joe Biden became the top Democratic  
2 contender, Chairman Johnson stated, "And if I were a  
3 Democrat primary voter, I'd want these questions  
4 satisfactorily answered before I cast my final vote."

5 Last week, in describing the investigation, Chairman  
6 Johnson said, "I would think it would certainly help Donald  
7 Trump win reelection and certainly be pretty good, I would  
8 say, evidence about not voting for Vice President Biden."

9 We are conducting this interview remotely because we  
10 are in the midst of a pandemic that has created an  
11 extraordinary public health crisis in the United States.  
12 The Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs Committee has  
13 jurisdiction over pandemic preparedness and response, and  
14 yet this Committee has now spent more time on the record  
15 interviewing witnesses in this investigation than it has  
16 spent on all of its COVID hearings combined.

17 Ranking Member Peters believes that this investigation  
18 is a misuse of Committee resources and does not advance the  
19 health, safety, or economic security of Americans consistent  
20 with our Committee's mission. We have a right and  
21 responsibility to be here, and we will do our best to ensure  
22 that you are treated fairly, the record is accurate and  
23 complete, and that the national security interest of the  
24 United States is protected.

25 I am joined by my colleagues Alan Kahn, Soumya

1 Dayananda, and Valerie Shen.

2 MR. FOLIO: Ranking Member Wyden's staff, please  
3 introduce yourselves for the record.

4 MR. BERICK: Dave Berick. I'm the Chief Investigation  
5 for the Democratic staff on the Senate Finance Committee. I  
6 am joined by Dan Goshorn and Josh Heath, who are  
7 investigators on the Committee staff.

8 I'm going to associate the minority Finance views with  
9 those of Mr. Schram and Ranking Member Peters' staff. I  
10 just would put in two data points which I'm going to  
11 introduce in every subsequent interview. We are now 77 days  
12 from the November 3rd election, and we have had 167,000  
13 deaths from COVID during the pendency of this investigation.

14 Dan?

15 MR. GOSHORN: Nothing further.

16 MR. FOLIO: I think we're making a habit of this, but  
17 just to respond briefly to the Ranking Member's staff,  
18 Chairman Johnson and the Committee have held a number of  
19 hearings on the COVID pandemic, and we continue to do work.  
20 The Committee has multiple tasks and we have wide  
21 responsibilities. One of them is Senate oversight. The  
22 core responsibility of the Committee is investigating  
23 conflicts of interest or apparent conflicts of interest.  
24 That's what we are doing and we will continue to do. It  
25 doesn't mean we're not doing [inaudible.]

1           Is someone from the State Department on the line? And  
2 if so, can you please introduce yourself for the record?

3           [No response.]

4           MR. FOLIO: So Will Sacripanti tells me that someone  
5 from the State Department has dialed in and understands that  
6 Bill Killion is joining us.

7           MR. KILLION: Sorry. Can you hear me now?

8           MR. FOLIO: Yes.

9           MR. KILLION: Oh, sorry. I spoke and maybe I wasn't  
10 unmuted. Yeah, Bill Killion with State Leg. Affairs is  
11 here.

12          MR. FOLIO: Thank, Bill.

13          Ms. Novelli, I will now explain how the interview will  
14 proceed. The Federal Rules of Civil Procedure do not apply  
15 to any of the Committees' investigative activities,  
16 including transcribed interviews. The way questioning  
17 proceeds is that we will alternate between the majority and  
18 minority staff for 1 hour each. The majority staff will  
19 begin and proceed for an hour, and then the minority staff  
20 will have an opportunity to ask questions. And we will  
21 rotate back and forth until there are no more questions, and  
22 then the interview will be over.

23          During the interview we will do our best to limit the  
24 number of people who are directing questions at you during  
25 any given hour. That said, from time to time a follow-up or

1 clarifying question may be useful, and if so, you may hear  
2 from other staff members. Given the fact that this is a  
3 virtual interview, I will ask everyone to just take their  
4 time, speak clearly to make sure Ms. Gray's recording who is  
5 speaking and what they are saying.

6 Ms. Irene Gray is the court reporter. She is online  
7 with us, and she is going to create a verbatim record of  
8 what we discuss today. With that in mind, Ms. Novelli, it's  
9 important that you respond to questions verbally. The  
10 reporter cannot properly record nonverbal responses or  
11 gestures. Do you understand this?

12 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

13 MR. FOLIO: We encourage witnesses that appear before  
14 the Committee to freely consult with counsel. Ms. Novelli,  
15 do you have counsel present with you today?

16 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

17 MR. FOLIO: And for the record, can your counsel please  
18 introduce themselves?

19 MR. NASH: Good morning. This is Stuart Nash on behalf  
20 of Ms. Novelli. I understand that Chris Armstrong is on the  
21 line, too. [Inaudible] indicates that apparently he cannot  
22 be heard, so he is here listening in.

23 MR. FOLIO: I'm sorry. Ms. Gray, are you able to hear  
24 Mr. Nash? We're having difficulty hearing him.

25 MR. NASH: [Inaudible] because I need to be here in Ms.

1 Novelli's physical presence to consult with her, we are  
2 outside.

3 MR. FOLIO: Stuart, it's still very difficult to hear  
4 you. I'm assuming Ms. Gray is having--

5 MS. NOVELLI: Maybe that's [inaudible].

6 MR. NASH: I don't have headphones that fit this  
7 computer. I don't anticipate talking a lot, but I just  
8 wanted to say we are outside and socially distanced, and  
9 that's the reason why you're hearing birds and outside  
10 sounds. [Inaudible.]

11 MR. FOLIO: Other counsel for Ms. Novelli?

12 MR. NASH: Chris Armstrong said he was on the line but  
13 could not be heard.

14 MR. FOLIO: So just to repeat for Ms. Gray, you're  
15 saying Chris Armstrong from your firm is also joining us  
16 today?

17 MR. NASH: Correct. He cannot make the audio work. He  
18 cannot be heard.

19 MR. FOLIO: Anyone else from your firm, Stuart?

20 MR. NASH: No.

21 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, we ask that you please answer  
22 our questions in the most complete and truthful manner  
23 possible. We're going to take our time. If you have any  
24 questions or do not understand our questions, just let us  
25 know, and we'll be happy to clarify. Do you understand?



1 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

2 MR. FOLIO: This interview is unclassified, so if the  
3 question calls for any information that you know to be  
4 classified, please state that for the record, as well as  
5 your understanding for its classification. And then once  
6 you've clarified to the extent possible, we'll ask you to  
7 respond with as much unclassified information as possible.  
8 If necessary, we can have a classified session at a later  
9 time. Do you understand?

10 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

11 MR. FOLIO: It's the Committees' practice to honor  
12 valid common law privilege claims as an accommodation to a  
13 witness or party when those claims are made in good faith  
14 and accompanied by sufficient explanation so the Committees  
15 can evaluate the claim. When deciding whether to honor a  
16 privilege, the Committee weighs its need for the information  
17 against any legitimate basis for withholding it.

18 This interview is occurring without prejudice for any  
19 future discussions with the Committee, and we reserve the  
20 right to request your participation in the future for  
21 interviews or to compel testimony.

22 Ms. Novelli, if you need to take a break, please let us  
23 know. We will ordinarily take a 5-minute break at the end  
24 of each 1-hour session. But if you need to take a break  
25 before that, let us know and we'll be happy to accommodate

1 you.

2 MS. NOVELLI: I understand.

3 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, you're required to answer  
4 questions before Congress truthfully. Do you understand  
5 that?

6 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

7 MR. FOLIO: This also applies to questions posed by  
8 congressional staff in an interview. Specifically, 18  
9 U.S.C. Section 1001 makes it a crime to make any materially  
10 false, fictitious, or fraudulent statement or representation  
11 in the course of congressional investigations, and this  
12 statute applies to the statements you make in this  
13 interview. Do you understand that?

14 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

15 MR. FOLIO: Is there any reason that you are unable to  
16 provide truthful answers to the questions we ask today?

17 MS. NOVELLI: No.

18 MR. FOLIO: Finally, we ask that you not speak about  
19 what we discuss in this interview with anyone else outside  
20 of who's here in the virtual room today to preserve the  
21 integrity of our investigation, and we also ask that you not  
22 remove any exhibits or any other Committee documents from  
23 the interview. Do you understand and agree?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

25 MR. FOLIO: Do you have any questions before we begin?

1 MS. NOVELLI: No.

2 MR. FOLIO: I'm going to turn the questioning over to  
3 my colleague Brian Downey.

4 MR. DOWNEY: Good morning, Ms. Novelli. My name's  
5 Brian Downey. I'm a Senior Investigator for Chairman  
6 Johnson and will start our 1 hour at 9:55 a.m.

7 Ms. Novelli, what is your current place of employment  
8 and your job title?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I am an adjunct professor at Georgetown  
10 University.

11 MR. DOWNEY: What was your most recent role at the  
12 State Department?

13 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. You were breaking up.

14 MR. DOWNEY: What was your most recent role at the  
15 State Department?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I was Under Secretary of State for  
17 Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment.

18 MR. DOWNEY: And did you serve in that role from  
19 approximately April 2014 to January 2017?

20 MS. NOVELLI: February 2014 to January 2017.

21 MR. DOWNEY: Had you previously worked at the State  
22 Department?

23 MS. NOVELLI: No.

24 MR. DOWNEY: What were your roles and responsibilities  
25 in this position as Under Secretary of State for Economic

1 Growth, Energy, and the Environment?

2 MS. NOVELLI: I reported to Secretary of State John  
3 Kerry. I was responsible for the Bureaus that were  
4 underneath the Under Secretary, which included the Economic  
5 and Business Bureau; the Oceans, Environment, and Science  
6 Burisma, OES; and the Energy Department was not a formal  
7 Bureau.

8 MR. DOWNEY: Could you talk more about what the  
9 Economic and Business Bureau entailed and how as Under  
10 Secretary you ran or oversaw that Bureau?

11 MS. NOVELLI: The Bureau had an Assistant Secretary who  
12 was Charles Rivkin, and it engaged on issues with other  
13 countries that had to do with economic issues, everything  
14 from trade to it helped devise the Iran sanctions. It  
15 worked on the sanctions that were put in place with regard  
16 to Russia after Russia invaded Ukraine. It worked on issues  
17 that would involve the IMF and the World Bank; worked on  
18 promoting investment into the U.S. by, you know, foreign  
19 companies, direct investment; worked on issues involving  
20 international telecommunications. It was, you know, all  
21 sort of economic activity that the U.S. would engage in  
22 international, basically.

23 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Who did you work most closely at  
24 your time at the State Department from February 2014 to  
25 January 2017?

1 MS. NOVELLI: Well, I had a direct staff. Those are  
2 probably the people I worked with on a daily basis. They  
3 rotated, so they were mostly career Foreign Service officers  
4 and so they would rotate on a yearly basis. And I worked--I  
5 worked with whomever I needed to work with depending on what  
6 the issue was. And then I worked with Secretary Kerry. I  
7 worked with whomever was the Deputy Secretary at the time.  
8 I worked with other Assistant Secretaries for the Regional  
9 Bureaus. I would interface with the Chief of Staff. And  
10 it's hard to say, like, an individual. There was really no  
11 one individual outside of my, you know, direct staff because  
12 it depended on what the issues were.

13 MR. DOWNEY: During your time as Under Secretary at the  
14 State Department from February 2014 to January 2017, who was  
15 the Chief of Staff at the State Department?

16 MS. NOVELLI: There were two Chiefs of Staff. Sorry.  
17 I'm just blanking on the names of the two Chiefs of Staff.  
18 I'm sorry.

19 MR. DOWNEY: David Wade?

20 MS. NOVELLI: David Wade was the first Chief of Staff.  
21 Thank you. And the second one was--I'm sorry. I'm just  
22 blanking on his name.

23 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Can you describe how much you  
24 interacted with Secretary John Kerry at your time at the  
25 State Department?

1 MS. NOVELLI: Again, it would depend on the issue. He  
2 held staff meetings when he was in town every Monday, when  
3 he was in town, so I attended those. They were for the  
4 senior staff. And then if he was having a particular  
5 meeting that was under my area of responsibility, I would  
6 attend that.

7 I interacted with him a great deal when we were  
8 planning the first Our Ocean Conference that brought  
9 together foreign ministers and economy ministers and  
10 philanthropists and scientists and all kinds of other  
11 people. And he was--had been very involved in protecting  
12 the ocean for his whole career, and so I interacted with him  
13 a great deal on that subject.

14 MR. DOWNEY: Understood. So as Under Secretary of  
15 Econ., in that role were you involved in Ukraine policy?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I was involved in certain aspects of  
17 Ukraine policy, things that fell underneath my jurisdiction.  
18 And at the senior staff, the Assistant Secretary responsible  
19 for Europe would report on what was going on in Ukraine,  
20 among many other things.

21 MR. DOWNEY: During that time at the State Department,  
22 from 2014 to 2017, who was the Assistant Secretary for  
23 European Affairs?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Victoria Nuland.

25 MR. DOWNEY: Can you describe how your role as Under

1 Secretary for Econ. blended into the larger Ukraine policy  
2 for the United States at the State Department?

3 MS. NOVELLI: Well, one of the main things that I  
4 focused on there was when, shortly after I arrived at the  
5 State Department, Russia invaded Crimea, and so we had to--  
6 we concluded that we needed to take sanctions against  
7 Russia, and part of that was figuring out what sanctions to  
8 take, and we looked very hard at how we could do things that  
9 would have an effect on Russia economically and coordinate  
10 with Europe so that it wouldn't be something that would be a  
11 hole in the dike in the sense that if we said we won't help  
12 you on, you know, various things, that the European  
13 companies would then just go do it themselves. And so we--  
14 so I spent a great deal of time on that particularly in the  
15 beginning when we were first devising things, and then we  
16 would add to those sanctions, including looking at them,  
17 revising them, working with the Europeans. So that was one  
18 thing that had to do with Ukraine.

19 The other sort of aspect had to do with the sort of  
20 financial side of Ukraine and what it was doing in terms of  
21 righting its own economy. Ukraine obviously was having a  
22 lot of difficulty and not just because of the Russian  
23 investigation but in general, and so it had a program with  
24 the IMF, and the IMF was negotiating with the Ukrainians  
25 about what they needed to do, what specific actions they

1 needed to take in order for the IMF to release funds.

2       The State Department was also responsible for releasing  
3 economic stabilization funds, ESF, and the people who worked  
4 on that were underneath my Under Secretary division. And so  
5 those people were watching very carefully what was going on,  
6 and they were also the people who had to process all the  
7 paperwork to get the funds released.

8       MR. DOWNEY: Who made up your team?

9       MS. NOVELLI: My staff?

10      MR. DOWNEY: Yeah.

11      MS. NOVELLI: Well, as I said, they rotated every year,  
12 so there were three different sets of staff. There were  
13 approximately 12 people each year. That included the Chief  
14 of Staff and the ostensible Deputy Chief of Staff, plus  
15 three administrative assistants. So I don't have a list of  
16 every single staff person at my fingertips. I would have to  
17 go back and provide that if you need the list.

18      MR. DOWNEY: That's fine.

19      So you mentioned some of the issues that you dealt with  
20 when you came into the role at the State Department in 2014.  
21 Ms. Novelli, to what extent were you aware of the U.S.'s  
22 anticorruption efforts in the Ukraine?

23      MS. NOVELLI: I knew that there were anticorruption  
24 efforts. I was not actively engaged in working on the  
25 anticorruption efforts.



1 MR. DOWNEY: Can you detail what you knew about the  
2 anticorruption efforts?

3 MS. NOVELLI: I knew that there was corruption in  
4 Ukraine. I knew that we were trying to seek more  
5 transparency that was one of the things the IMF was seeking.  
6 I really do not have detailed information about the U.S.'s  
7 anticorruption efforts in Ukraine.

8 MR. DOWNEY: From 2014 to 2017, as an Under Secretary,  
9 do you know who at the State Department was leading the U.S.  
10 anticorruption efforts in regards to Ukraine?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Do you mean who on a sort of daily basis  
12 or who was ultimately responsible?

13 MR. DOWNEY: Well, who on a daily basis, but what Under  
14 Secretary or Assistant Secretary was in charge of those  
15 anticorruption efforts in Ukraine?

16 MS. NOVELLI: That would be Victoria Nuland who was the  
17 Assistant Secretary for Europe.

18 MR. DOWNEY: Thank you.

19 And did you ever discuss those efforts with Ms. Nuland  
20 while you were at the State Department?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall having a specific  
22 discussion about anticorruption efforts in Ukraine with  
23 Victoria Nuland.

24 MR. DOWNEY: Could you detail why you thought Ukraine  
25 was corrupt?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I don't think it's accurate for a  
2 statement for me to say I thought Ukraine was corrupt. That  
3 is not an accurate statement. I knew--I knew that there was  
4 corruption in Ukraine. It was something that--as I said,  
5 there were staff meetings with Secretary Kerry. There would  
6 be reports about what was going on. That there was  
7 corruption in Ukraine was in the newspaper. It was just  
8 sort of general knowledge, but it is a different statement  
9 to say there is corruption in Ukraine than Ukraine is  
10 corrupt.

11 MR. DOWNEY: During your time as Under Secretary, did  
12 you understand the corruption problems within Ukraine? Did  
13 they reside in certain sectors of Ukraine society?

14 MS. NOVELLI: I was not an expert on corruption and  
15 where it resided in Ukraine. As I said, I did not focus on  
16 corruption in Ukraine in my job.

17 MR. DOWNEY: As Under Secretary from 2014 to 2017, were  
18 you ever briefed or attended meetings with Victoria Nuland  
19 where the topic of corruption within Ukrainian society was a  
20 topic of discussion?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I am not aware that there was general  
22 discussion of corruption in Ukrainian society as a writ  
23 large.

24 There were certain--what I am aware of and not in  
25 detail is that there were certain individuals who were not--

1 who were corrupt. I can't remember the names of any  
2 individuals. I am sure that there was some discussion of  
3 that in meetings that I attended.

4       Particularly, one of the things that we did was put  
5 sanctions on individuals. I cannot remember the names of  
6 who those individuals were, but in the discussion of putting  
7 sanctions on those individuals, corruption was something  
8 that was part of that discussion.

9       MR. DOWNEY: Earlier, you mentioned some of the  
10 financial channels that was used to, I believe, assist  
11 Ukraine--the IMF and ESF--in the sovereign loan guarantee.  
12 Can you please explain what role each of those played?

13       MS. NOVELLI: Played in what?

14       MR. DOWNEY: In U.S.-Ukraine relationship and policy,  
15 what was the goal of each of those?

16       MS. NOVELLI: I can't say that there were separate  
17 goals for each one of those. The general goal was to make  
18 sure that Ukraine could stay economically viable as a  
19 country.

20       There was a great deal of concern that Ukraine already  
21 was having difficulties before Russia invaded Ukraine, and  
22 then after the invasion, that concern deepened. And so  
23 there was an absolute worry and concern about making sure  
24 that Ukraine could stay economically viable, and so each one  
25 of the pieces was part of looking at that.

1 MR. DOWNEY: Understood.

2 Ms. Novelli, during your time as Under Secretary, what  
3 role did Vice President Joe Biden play in formulating U.S.-  
4 Ukraine policy?

5 MS. NOVELLI: I don't have direct knowledge of Vice  
6 President Biden's role in formulating Ukraine policy.

7 MR. DOWNEY: As your role--sorry about that. Go ahead.

8 MS. NOVELLI: Interaction on Ukraine was largely within  
9 the State Department and then with my peers on the economic  
10 side that were gathered together by whomever was at the  
11 National Security Council oversee economic policy at the  
12 time.

13 MR. DOWNEY: Who was on the National Security Council  
14 who dealt with the economic side that you liaised with?

15 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember who was there at that--  
16 you know, any given time, but different people chaired  
17 different meetings. Some of them were from the National  
18 Economic Council. Some of them would be from the--reported  
19 to Susan Rice. So there were various different people, and  
20 I'm sorry. I just can't remember everyone's name.

21 MR. DOWNEY: Did you interact with members of Vice  
22 President Biden's team on Ukraine policy?

23 MS. NOVELLI: No. Unless there was somebody from his  
24 staff who would possibly attend one of these meetings in the  
25 Situation Room, and it's possible there was someone from his

1 staff there. But there would usually be 10 or 15 people  
2 there, and so I did not interact directly.

3 MR. DOWNEY: Understood.

4 Were you aware of reports in April 2014 that Vice  
5 President Biden was considered a lead official with regards  
6 to U.S.-Ukraine policy?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Not specifically.

8 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. We're going to enter in our first  
9 exhibit, and this will be Exhibit 1.

10 And it's Tab 1, Will.

11 [Novelli Exhibit No. 1 was  
12 marked for identification.]

13 MR. DOWNEY: Ms. Novelli, we'll allow you to hopefully  
14 see this document that's been pulled up on the screen and  
15 allow you to review it, and then when you're ready, please  
16 let me know. Thank you.

17 [Pause.]

18 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. I've read the first three  
19 paragraphs. Are there more?

20 MR. SCHRAM: Brian, this is a publicly available  
21 document. Why wasn't it provided to Ms. Novelli in advance  
22 so she had a chance to review a hard copy instead of try to  
23 follow along on the screen?

24 MR. DOWNEY: Zack, this is how we have been doing most  
25 of these interviews, and we'll leave it at that.

1 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. I've finished what's on the screen  
2 now.

3 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Thank you.

4 So--

5 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. I haven't read the whole  
6 document. I just finished those few paragraphs. So I'm  
7 still reading.

8 [Pause.]

9 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. You can page down some more.

10 [Pause.]

11 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. You can page down some more.

12 [Pause.]

13 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. I've read--I think I've read the  
14 whole thing now.

15 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Thank you, Ms. Novelli.

16 So according to this Washington Examiner article from  
17 April 25th, 2014, Vice President Biden had become the public  
18 face of the administration's handling of Ukraine. At that  
19 time, of April 2014, you had just, I think, arrived as Under  
20 Secretary of Econ.

21 Was this an accurate representation of Vice President  
22 Biden's role regarding U.S.-Ukraine policy?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I can only speak to my own experience,  
24 and as I said, I was interacting within the State  
25 Department. And then when we started to take sanctions,

1 interacting in the interagency process to look at what those  
2 were, I just didn't have any interaction with Vice President  
3 Biden or directly his staff other than if they attended  
4 these interagency meetings.

5 I do not recall a great deal of discussion in that  
6 context of Vice President Biden.

7 MR. DOWNEY: Did Vice President Biden's staff routinely  
8 attend those meetings when they were at the State  
9 Department?

10 MS. NOVELLI: Well, the meetings would have been  
11 interagency meetings, not meetings at the State Department.  
12 They did not attend State Department meetings that I  
13 participated in.

14 The interagency meetings, I honestly do not recall. I  
15 can't say. I don't remember exactly who attended. It  
16 wasn't something that I noticed that, oh, somebody from Vice  
17 President Biden's office is at this meeting.

18 MR. DOWNEY: Understood.

19 Ms. Novelli, are you aware of the Ukrainian company  
20 Burisma Holdings?

21 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

22 MR. DOWNEY: How did you become aware of Burisma  
23 Holdings?

24 MS. NOVELLI: I became aware of it because of a meeting  
25 or request--because of a meeting that was occurring with

1 regard to Burisma. Prior to that, I had no knowledge of  
2 Burisma.

3 MR. DOWNEY: When did that meeting request occur?

4 MS. NOVELLI: The meeting request?

5 MR. DOWNEY: Or the meeting occur with--the first time?

6 MS. NOVELLI: The meeting itself occurred in March of  
7 2016.

8 MR. DOWNEY: Would you agree that Burisma has a  
9 reputation for engaging in corrupt activity?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know anything for myself about  
11 Burisma and did not know anything before that particular  
12 meeting.

13 MR. DOWNEY: Are you aware of Burisma's owner, Mykola  
14 Zlochevsky?

15 MS. NOVELLI: No.

16 MR. DOWNEY: What do you know about allegations of  
17 corrupt activity by Burisma?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I really don't know any details about  
19 allegations of corrupt activity by Burisma. It was nothing  
20 that I focused on when I was at the State Department.

21 MR. DOWNEY: Were you ever briefed or made aware of  
22 Zlochevsky bribing Ukrainian government officials?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall being briefed or made  
24 aware of that.

25 MR. DOWNEY: Are you aware of reporting that while



1 Burisma's owner, Zlochevsky, was Ecology Minister of  
2 Ukraine, he issued licenses to oil and gas companies that  
3 belonged to him?

4 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. Not aware.

5 MR. DOWNEY: It's 10:24, and I'm going to turn this  
6 over to Josh of Chairman Grassley's office.

7 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Ms. Novelli, can you hear me okay?

8 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

9 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Great. Thank you for your time  
10 today. Before we get too far afield here on one of the  
11 topic that we discussed earlier I want to go back to your  
12 interactions with Victoria Nuland.

13 MS. NOVELLI: Mm-hmm.

14 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Can you tell us how often you  
15 interacted with Ms. Nuland regarding Ukraine policy?

16 MS. NOVELLI: If you mean interacted as in I was in a  
17 meeting where she was speaking about it, as I said--

18 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: I'm sorry. I can't hear you.

19 MS. NOVELLI: Can you hear me now? Hello?

20 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: There we are. That's much better.  
21 I'm sorry. I did not hear you. Could you restart your  
22 answer?

23 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. I'm not sure what you mean by  
24 "interacted." If you mean meetings, you know, the meetings  
25 that the Secretary held with the senior staff where people

1 would report on what was going on, there were probably, I  
2 would say, in those meetings 30 people, and we would just  
3 report on what was going on. There wasn't really  
4 interactions. So I would see her when those meetings  
5 occurred, which were not every week because the Secretary  
6 was traveling, and she was traveling, and I was traveling.  
7 But at those meetings I interacted with her when we were  
8 looking at the sanctions issues, and we would both attend  
9 the meetings that were held at the situation room, the  
10 interagency meetings. Those were really the main  
11 interactions I had with her about Ukraine.

12 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: During the course of any of those  
13 interactions did you discuss Burisma or its owner, Mykola  
14 Zlochevsky?

15 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my remembrance.

16 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Now as part of that interagency  
17 process, what agencies were involved in that?

18 MS. NOVELLI: Commerce Department, Treasury Department--  
19 -I'm trying to think who else--us, sometimes the U.S. Trade  
20 Representative's Office, sometimes the Justice Department,  
21 people, staff from the National Economic Council, staff from  
22 the National Security Council, sometimes staff from the UN  
23 representative's office. I'm trying to think who else.  
24 Those are sort of the main--they were the main, usually the  
25 main economic agencies, plus a few others who would be

1 involved in trying to think about getting other countries on  
2 board to do the same sanctions so that we were all acting  
3 together.

4 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So during the course of those  
5 meetings, with all those agencies and all those personnel,  
6 you don't recall Burisma ever coming up?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall that.

8 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And you don't recall its owner coming  
9 up?

10 MS. NOVELLI: No, I do not recall that.

11 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Did you guys generally discuss  
12 corruption in Ukraine during the course of those meetings?

13 MS. NOVELLI: No. We generally did not discuss  
14 corruption. We generally discussed what could we do that  
15 was going to have an economic impact on Russia that could,  
16 one would hope, cause the Russians to change their behavior  
17 with respect to Crimea.

18 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So those meetings that you described,  
19 it seems like, you know, corruption within Ukraine and  
20 possibly even Burisma, specifically, should be a topic of  
21 conversation. Would you disagree with that?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Yes, I would.

23 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And why is that?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Because we were focused on Russia. We  
25 were focused on putting sanctions on Russia.

1 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So when you were Under Secretary,  
2 what was your understanding of the State Department's  
3 position with respect to Burisma and Zlochevsky?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. You cut out at the last thing  
5 you said.

6 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: I'll just restate the question in  
7 full. As Under Secretary, what was your understanding of  
8 the State Department's position with respect with Burisma  
9 and Zlochevsky?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I had no understanding of it.

11 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And with respect to your interactions  
12 with the National Security Council, do you recall any of the  
13 individuals that you regularly interacted with during the  
14 course of the interagency meetings?

15 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember the names of all these-  
16 -of the individuals, no.

17 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Does the name Elisabeth Zentos come  
18 to mind?

19 MS. NOVELLI: No. That name is completely unfamiliar  
20 to me.

21 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Are you aware of whether or not the  
22 Vice President's office was made aware of concerns relating  
23 to Burisma's or Zlochevsky's reputation in Ukraine for  
24 corrupt activity?

25 MS. NOVELLI: I have no awareness.

1 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Do you believe the Vice President's  
2 office should have been made aware of those corruption-  
3 related concerns, in light of the Vice President running  
4 Ukraine policy for the Obama administration?

5 MS. NOVELLI: I can't--because I don't have any real  
6 detailed knowledge of Burisma I can't say one way or the  
7 other. I don't feel qualified to answer that.

8 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: At this point I am going to pass the  
9 microphone back to Brian. Thank you.

10 MS. NOVELLI: Sure.

11 MR. DOWNEY: Ms. Novelli, as Under Secretary, were you  
12 aware that Vice President Biden's son, Hunter, had joined  
13 the board of Burisma in May of 2014?

14 MS. NOVELLI: I only became aware of that as a result  
15 of the meeting that I had in March of 2016. I was not aware  
16 of that before that time.

17 MR. DOWNEY: So for nearly two years you didn't have  
18 knowledge that Hunter Biden had joined the board of Burisma?

19 MS. NOVELLI: No.

20 MR. DOWNEY: What was your reaction when you learned  
21 that Hunter Biden was on the board of Burisma?

22 MS. NOVELLI: I had no reaction. I didn't know  
23 anything about Burisma, so I had no reaction.

24 MR. DOWNEY: Do you know why Hunter Biden joined  
25 Burisma's board?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I have no idea.

2 MR. DOWNEY: Are you aware of Hunter Biden's  
3 responsibilities when he was on the board of Burisma?

4 MS. NOVELLI: No.

5 MR. DOWNEY: As Under Secretary, were you aware of  
6 other Americans that were on Burisma's board?

7 MS. NOVELLI: No, unless there was somebody else that  
8 was mentioned in the meeting that I had in March of 2016.

9 MR. DOWNEY: Who is Devon Archer?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I have no independent knowledge of who  
11 Devon Archer is. I have read in the press that he was a  
12 partner of Hunter Biden, but I have no independent knowledge  
13 of Devon Archer.

14 MR. DOWNEY: When did you learn that Hunter Biden  
15 joined Burisma's board?

16 MS. NOVELLI: At some--I don't know the precise date,  
17 but in preparation for the meeting I had on March 1 of 2016,  
18 I was--and I don't remember how I was made aware, but I was  
19 made aware that he was on the board of Burisma.

20 MR. DOWNEY: So in March of 2016, when you said you  
21 learned that Hunter Biden had joined Burisma's board, did  
22 you have any concerns about potential conflicts of interest  
23 relating to Hunter's role on Burisma's board, given Joe  
24 Biden's diplomatic responsibilities in Ukraine?

25 MS. NOVELLI: I didn't really give it thought. I

1 didn't know any detailed information about Burisma. I  
2 didn't really give it thought.

3 MR. DOWNEY: At any time after learning about Hunter  
4 Biden being on Burisma's board, did you communicate any  
5 concerns to anyone at the State Department?

6 MS. NOVELLI: About him being on the board?

7 MR. DOWNEY: Correct.

8 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember communicating a concern  
9 about that.

10 MR. DOWNEY: So you did not communicate any concerns.

11 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember communicating any  
12 concern about that.

13 MR. DOWNEY: Would there be someone within the State  
14 Department that you could register concerns with as an Under  
15 Secretary?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. I'm not totally understanding  
17 what you mean.

18 MR. DOWNEY: So if you have concerns about an issue  
19 that you're dealing with when you were Under Secretary, who  
20 would raise those concerns to? What avenues within that  
21 government role did you have?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Well, it would depend on what the concern  
23 is. If it was a concern about something--

24 MR. DOWNEY: A concern about conflict of interest.

25 MS. NOVELLI: --if it was a concern about conflict of

1 interest, someone inside the State Department. I would  
2 raise the concern with the Office of the Legal Advisor.  
3 There were people there who dealt with those questions. So  
4 that's where I would go if I had a concern about conflict of  
5 interest.

6 MR. DOWNEY: So just to be clear, in March of 2016,  
7 when you first learned that Hunter Biden was on the board of  
8 Burisma, you did not do anything with that information, or  
9 raise any concerns about learning of that information.

10 MS. NOVELLI: Raise a concern about a conflict of  
11 interest?

12 MR. DOWNEY: Correct.

13 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall doing that.

14 MR. DOWNEY: As Under Secretary, were you aware of  
15 other State Department officials expressing concerns about  
16 conflicts of interest or appearances of conflicts of  
17 interest regarding Hunter Biden's role on Burisma's board?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I am not aware of that.

19 MR. DOWNEY: After learning, in March of 2016, that  
20 Hunter Biden was on Burisma's board, did you think it was  
21 problematic that Hunter served on a board while his father  
22 was leading U.S. Ukraine policy?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I did not give it any thought.

24 MR. DOWNEY: Did you think it was problematic that  
25 Hunter Biden served on Burisma's board and there were



1 allegations of corruption related to its owner, Zlochevsky,  
2 while the State Department was pushing anti-corruption  
3 measures?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I was not--I do not recall being aware of  
5 allegations of corruption against Zlochevsky. I was not  
6 intimately involved in the details of the anti-corruption  
7 efforts, and, therefore, did not give any thought to Hunter  
8 Biden being on the board of Burisma.

9 MR. DOWNEY: So to be clear, you don't think there is a  
10 conflict that Hunter Biden was on Burisma's board?

11 MS. NOVELLI: I don't have a view about that.

12 MR. DOWNEY: Why not?

13 MS. NOVELLI: As I tried to explain, I didn't really  
14 spend a lot of time on the corruption efforts that the U.S.  
15 Government was doing with regard to Ukraine. That just  
16 wasn't one of the things that I was focusing on. There were  
17 lots of other people working on that. So I didn't really  
18 have a view about this.

19 MR. DOWNEY: But as you stated, you took a meeting  
20 about Burisma in March of 2016. Correct?

21 MS. NOVELLI: So when the meeting request came in to  
22 me, the meeting request--and I believe you have all the same  
23 documents I do--the meeting request did not reference  
24 Burisma. It didn't reference the name of anybody. I didn't  
25 reference anything except asking for advice. And I agreed

1 to that meeting, and at that time there was no mention of  
2 Burisma. There was not mention of any names of anyone when  
3 the meeting request came in.

4 MR. DOWNEY: In that preparation for that March 2016  
5 meeting, was Hunter Biden's name raised or discussed?

6 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall. I believe the meeting  
7 request came in at the end of February or middle of  
8 February, and the meeting was on March 1. I had normally  
9 meetings back to back from, you know, 8:30 in the morning  
10 until 6:00 or 7:00 at night, often with very little breaks,  
11 if any. And so I focused on the meetings that were in front  
12 of me and not the ones that were coming up. And so I don't  
13 really spend time worrying about this particular meeting.  
14 It was not--and so I wouldn't be having a lot of discussions  
15 about a meeting like that in any kind of usual situation,  
16 because I was busy reading my briefing papers for the  
17 meetings I was having like that day or the next day.

18 MR. DOWNEY: During your time as Under Secretary, from  
19 2014 to 2017, how many meetings did you take that were  
20 Ukraine-centric?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know. I couldn't tell you. The  
22 meetings that I took about Ukraine were largely meetings  
23 that had to do with financial things, like I had a meeting  
24 with Citibank, who talked about what was happening in Russia  
25 and what was happening in Ukraine. I had meetings with the

1 finance ministers of Ukraine. There were various of them.  
2 They would come through. Those were the type of meetings.  
3 I can't tell you how many.

4 MR. DOWNEY: As time as Under Secretary, from 2014 to  
5 2017, were you involved in meetings or discussions about  
6 Ukraine's Prosecutor General Office, the PGO?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Not that I'm aware of.

8 MR. DOWNEY: What do you know about Ukraine's  
9 Prosecutor General's Office?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I don't--from the time as an Under  
11 Secretary I had no detailed knowledge of the Prosecutor  
12 General's Office of Ukraine.

13 MR. DOWNEY: Did you take any meetings where the  
14 Prosecutor General's Office of Ukraine was a topic of  
15 discussion?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall. I do not recall having  
17 specific meetings about the Prosecutor General's Office of  
18 Ukraine.

19 MR. DOWNEY: But did you have meetings where the  
20 Prosecutor General's Office was a topic of discussion?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I don't recall having meetings where the  
22 Prosecutor General's Office was a main topic of discussion.

23 MR. DOWNEY: In March of 2016, the Prosecutor General  
24 of Ukraine was Viktor Shokin. Do you know who Viktor Shokin  
25 is?

1 MS. NOVELLI: Well, you're telling me he was the  
2 Prosecutor General of Ukraine. That's about as much as I  
3 know.

4 MR. DOWNEY: Do you remember, during your time as the  
5 Under Secretary, that U.S. officials were calling for  
6 Shokin's firing in the beginning of 2016?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Honestly, it just wasn't something I  
8 focused on. I just did not focus on this aspect of Ukraine  
9 policy.

10 MR. DOWNEY: Were you aware of any allegations of  
11 corruption by Viktor Shokin?

12 MS. NOVELLI: Not specifically, no.

13 MR. DOWNEY: As Under Secretary, were you aware of Vice  
14 President Biden linking U.S. loan guarantees to the removal  
15 of Viktor Shokin?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall that from my time. I've  
17 read since then that that happened, but I do not recall that  
18 from my time there.

19 MR. DOWNEY: Do you remember when the linking of U.S.  
20 loan guarantees to the removal of Shokin, when that policy  
21 was discussed--

22 MS. NOVELLI: No.

23 MR. DOWNEY: --at the State Department?

24 MS. NOVELLI: No, I do not. I was not involved in that  
25 specifically.

1 MR. DOWNEY: Do you know when Vice President Biden made  
2 this demand?

3 MS. NOVELLI: No, I do not.

4 MR. DOWNEY: As Under Secretary, what was your  
5 awareness of Ukraine's prosecutor general office's  
6 investigation into Burisma and Zlochevsky?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I've had no awareness of this other than  
8 whatever was in the briefing paper for the meeting that I  
9 had on March 1, and I have not had access to that paper.  
10 And I don't have any specific memory of it.

11 MR. DOWNEY: I'm going to turn it over to Josh of  
12 Chairman Grassley's office for one minute. Then probably go  
13 to Joe Folio.

14 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Thank you, Brian.

15 Real quick on a follow-up questions on one of the  
16 answers that you gave Brian. I think you mentioned that  
17 some of your meetings--I don't want to put words in your  
18 mouth, so please correct me if I get this wrong. But some  
19 of your meetings during the interagency process involved  
20 discussions with banks, and I believe you mentioned  
21 Citigroup or Citibank. Did I hear that correctly?

22 MS. NOVELLI: No, you did not. Those were not  
23 interagency meetings.

24 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: I'm sorry. That cut out. Can you  
25 restate your answer?

1 MS. NOVELLI: You did not hear it correctly. The  
2 meetings I was talking about were not interagency meetings.

3 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Okay. So which meetings were the  
4 ones where you had discussions with the banks? Were those  
5 just you and the banks?

6 MS. NOVELLI: There were occasionally--people would--  
7 representatives, U.S. representatives of the banks would  
8 bring some of their people who were working in Russia who  
9 were also responsible for Ukraine to my office to just give  
10 me the lay of the land as like a background of what was  
11 going on, and so that was the type of meeting I was talking  
12 about. Those were not interagency meetings.

13 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Okay. So these meeting, then, did  
14 you discuss with the banks suspicious financial transactions  
15 within Russia?

16 MS. NOVELLI: Not in detail, no. We discussed more of  
17 what was generally the scene of people in Russia, not  
18 specific transactions.

19 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So what do you mean by scene of the  
20 people in Russia?

21 MS. NOVELLI: What were people thinking about--what  
22 were people thinking about the invasion of Crimea, how was  
23 business going, general kinds of things, not specific  
24 financial transactions.

25 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Within your purview while you were at

1 the State Department, were suspicious financial transactions  
2 a part of your job duties when it came to Russia?

3 MS. NOVELLI: Not specifically, no.

4 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Okay.

5 MS. NOVELLI: That would have been more--

6 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And with respect--

7 MS. NOVELLI: --the Treasury Department.

8 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And with respect to the meetings you  
9 had with the bank representatives regarding Russia, did you  
10 have the same discussions with bank representatives  
11 regarding Ukraine?

12 MS. NOVELLI: The particular meeting that I'm recalling  
13 was a meeting with someone who was posted to Russia, based  
14 in Russia, worked for Citibank, but also responsible for  
15 Ukraine, did not live there. And we did not have specific  
16 discussions about suspicious financial transactions. That  
17 was not the nature of that particular meeting.

18 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: At any point during your employment,  
19 did that become the topic of discussion in any of your  
20 meetings with respect to specifically suspicious financial  
21 transactions in Ukraine or Russia?

22 MS. NOVELLI: You mean individual, specific financial--

23 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Sure.

24 MS. NOVELLI: --transactions?

25 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Yes. Sure.

1 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall having meetings about  
2 individual, specific financial transactions in Ukraine or  
3 Russia.

4 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Thank you.

5 I'm going to pass this over to Brian.

6 MR. FOLIO: Hi, Ms. Novelli. This is Joe Folio. Just  
7 a few more questions to round out our first line of inquiry.

8 So you mentioned before that there were different types  
9 of financial packages provided to Ukraine. We discussed  
10 economic stabilization funds, IMF funds, sovereign loan  
11 guarantees.

12 One way or another, did those financial issues fall  
13 within your purview?

14 MS. NOVELLI: Fall within my purview meaning that--I  
15 certainly wasn't the main--excuse me--the main person  
16 responsible for the IMF. That was the Treasury Department.  
17 You know, I had situational awareness.

18 But the people who were working on the ESF, economic  
19 stabilization funds--and I am not certain about the loan  
20 guarantees, whether those came from us or a different  
21 agency, but the people who were focused on that were  
22 underneath the--they were in the Economic and Business  
23 Bureau, which was part of the Under Secretary's  
24 organization, I guess.

25 MR. FOLIO: And recognizing that there are different



1 parts of the government at play here, how would you describe  
2 the role of your bureaus in working on those parts of U.S.  
3 policy towards Ukraine?

4 MS. NOVELLI: Well, people followed those and--to know  
5 what was going on, and really our main role on those was  
6 processing paper. We didn't really--our bureau didn't  
7 really have a huge say in the policy, you know. Like, we  
8 were processing the paper to make the funds be released.

9 MR. FOLIO: What I'm trying to understand is that we  
10 discussed how in--or around in early 2016, the third \$1  
11 billion U.S. sovereign loan guarantee was allegedly  
12 conditioned on anticorruption reform, specifically the  
13 removal of Mr. Shokin.

14 And you told us earlier that in your several  
15 interagency meetings, generally, anticorruption never came  
16 up. So I'm trying to understand that if anticorruption was  
17 never something that came up in the interagency process,  
18 then how all of a sudden did it become the condition under  
19 which the United States was potentially going to withhold \$1  
20 billion in a sovereign loan there?

21 MS. NOVELLI: So, as I explained, the interagency  
22 meetings I was referring to were about sanctions against  
23 Russia. They were not about Ukraine specifically--they were  
24 about Ukraine because we were taking sanctions against  
25 Russia because they invaded Crimea, but they were focused on

1 taking sanctions against Russia. I did not participate in--  
2 that I remember, anyway--meetings about conditioning made to  
3 Ukraine on one thing or another thing.

4       There were people who worked underneath me who may have  
5 participated in meetings, but that was not something that I  
6 recall spending a great deal of time doing. So I can't  
7 really speak to what was and wasn't discussed in those  
8 meetings.

9       MR. FOLIO: You previously described these package of  
10 economic--different economic packages as something that was  
11 basically necessary to keep Ukraine as a viable country.

12       MS. NOVELLI: Right.

13       MR. FOLIO: If the United States was going to condition  
14 a billion-dollar sovereign loan guarantee, do you think  
15 that's something that would have risen to your visibility as  
16 Under Secretary, to your level?

17       MS. NOVELLI: I can't tell you--I can only tell you  
18 what I recall, and I just don't recall the specifics of the  
19 particular conditionality that you're talking about. It's  
20 possible that somebody told me about it, but it's not  
21 something that I was focusing on.

22       MR. FOLIO: Given your role as Under Secretary, would  
23 you be surprised if something as significant as conditioning  
24 a billion dollars worth of sovereign loan guarantees  
25 occurred and you were not made aware of it?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know how to answer that. I don't  
2 think it's a question I can actually properly answer.  
3 Whether I would have been surprised, it's very speculative.

4 MR. FOLIO: So in the course of your duties, would the  
5 withholding of \$1 billion of sovereign loan guarantees been  
6 the type of issue that should have been brought to your  
7 attention? Would you have expected to have heard about  
8 that?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know that it would have been  
10 brought to my attention other than as an aside, but  
11 certainly not--because we were just really processing the  
12 paper. The policy was really being made by Victoria Nuland  
13 and the people that she interacted with at the White House,  
14 not us.

15 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, we've concluded our first hour  
16 of questioning. So, normally, what we would do now is we  
17 would turn it over to the Minority, but I wanted to see if  
18 you'd like to take a five- or ten-minute break at this  
19 point.

20 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah. I'd love to take a five-minute  
21 break, a bio-break.

22 MR. FOLIO: Zack, what time would you like to  
23 reconvene? Do you want to say?

24 MR. SCHRAM: Well, do you want to say 11:05 or 11:10?

25 MR. FOLIO: Whatever Ms. Novelli would prefer.

1 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah, five minutes is enough.

2 MR. SCHRAM: Okay. Let's--

3 MS. NOVELLI: I could do a quick bio-break.

4 MR. SCHRAM: Let's make it 11:05.

5 MS. NOVELLI: Okey-doke.

6 MR. FOLIO: Thank you.

7 [Recess.]

8 MR. SCHRAM: Okay, going back on the record.

9 Ms. Novelli, I appreciate your time this morning and  
10 appreciate your service to this country, your public  
11 service. In the first hour, the majority had seemed  
12 surprised that you were not more actively involved in  
13 anticorruption efforts in Ukraine or more focused on those  
14 efforts in Ukraine. What was your focus?

15 MS. NOVELLI: As I said, my focus for--for Ukraine or  
16 in general?

17 MR. SCHRAM: Let's do both. Start with general, and  
18 then speak to Ukraine, please.

19 MS. NOVELLI: My focus was looking at--on the  
20 environment side, looking at questions of setting up better  
21 communication between scientists in the U.S. and scientists  
22 in other countries, and the ability of scientists to be able  
23 to talk on a forward-going basis about what was coming down  
24 the pike that we should all be worrying about.

25 My focus was on looking at successfully convincing

1 China to stop its ivory markets because elephants had 10  
2 years left from being extinct in the wild, and we had  
3 succeeded in doing that.

4 My focus was on getting part of Antarctica declared a  
5 marine protected area which required the agreement of many  
6 countries in the world and succeeded in doing that. On  
7 pulling together sort of a worldwide effort on ocean  
8 conservation, so that was on the environment side.

9 On the economic side, my focus was on looking at  
10 working with developing countries, particularly in Southeast  
11 Asia and Africa, on how they could--how they could plug into  
12 globalization in a way that both allowed them to have viable  
13 economic activity and also be transparent, protect  
14 intellectual property, and set up solid regimes for how  
15 workers were treated in their countries and set up  
16 transparent customs processing, efficient customs  
17 processing.

18 I also focused on questions involving the Internet,  
19 things like issues of privacy sort of in other countries and  
20 how they were regulating that. We also started a push to  
21 look at how we could bring broadband access in the  
22 developing world, partnered with the World Bank on a study  
23 that showed that a 10-percent increase in broadband  
24 penetration in a developing country actually resulted in a  
25 1- to 2-percentage-point increase in GDP. And so we really

1 tried to push with finance ministers and with development  
2 banks the idea that broadband was really infrastructure just  
3 like roads, that that was the modern road, and that that  
4 could help all kinds of people and their society participate  
5 both in their own economy and in the global economy. And  
6 there were a number of other issues about access to the  
7 Internet from a technological point of view that I focused  
8 on. And then focused on, as I said, sanctions against  
9 Russia because of their invading of Ukraine, and, you know,  
10 many other kind of more issues that would involve solid,  
11 transparent financial decisionmaking and solid  
12 decisionmaking especially by the development banks that--  
13 including looking at environment as a criterion for the  
14 impact on the environment.

15       The other thing that I spent a great deal of time  
16 focusing on was China, and there were many, many, obviously,  
17 and still are, questions about China, their economic  
18 activity, their adherence to trade rules, their--and then I  
19 worked with them also on some questions of aviation, some  
20 questions of environment. And then there was another large  
21 issue involving subsidization or alleged subsidization of  
22 carriers in the Middle East that U.S. carriers said were  
23 hurting them, and so we had to look at that and see what we  
24 could do about that.

25       So I focused on--I tried to focus on questions that

1 were uniquely within the purview of our realm, and if things  
2 were not within the purview of our realm and were being  
3 handled elsewhere, I didn't really want--I only had so many  
4 hours in the day, so I spent my time focusing on the things  
5 where I could actually have an impact and not things that  
6 were somebody else's, in someone else's silo.

7 MR. SCHRAM: It sounds like an enormously broad  
8 portfolio and one of great consequence. It sounds like you  
9 had a lot of success in your missions. Can you describe  
10 very generally the proportion of your responsibility, the  
11 proportion of your focus that was related to Ukraine?

12 MS. NOVELLI: It was a relatively small, very small  
13 proportion. I don't know how to give it an exact number.  
14 As I said, my primary responsibility for Ukraine was looking  
15 at these sanctions and then making sure that when the funds  
16 were supposed to be released for the economic stabilization  
17 or a loan guarantee, that that happened, you know, the  
18 machinery actually happened that was supposed to happen.  
19 And then there were some conversations with Ukrainian  
20 finance ministers about sort of more writ large, sort of  
21 what was happening in Ukraine and what they were doing to  
22 try to stabilize the country.

23 MR. SCHRAM: So a very small part of your enormous  
24 portfolio related to Ukraine, and if I understand you  
25 correctly, the part that did focus on Ukraine was largely

1 related to the sanctions on Russia as the invasion of  
2 Crimea.

3 MS. NOVELLI: That is for myself. There were certainly  
4 some staff people who followed--you know, followed more  
5 closely what was going on. But for myself, that is correct.

6 MR. SCHRAM: So what proportion of your focus on  
7 Ukraine personally was with respect to anticorruption  
8 reform?

9 MS. NOVELLI: Well, I can't really say zero, but it's  
10 about as close to zero as you could get.

11 MR. SCHRAM: Ms. Novelli, the majority has stated that  
12 the purpose of this investigation is to determine "whether  
13 certain officials within the Obama administration had actual  
14 or apparent conflicts of interest, or whether there was any  
15 wrongdoing because of Hunter Biden's role in Rosemont Seneca  
16 and related entities and as a board member of Burisma  
17 Holdings."

18 Did you take any actions related to U.S. policy in  
19 Ukraine intended to benefit Hunter Biden?

20 MS. NOVELLI: No.

21 MR. SCHRAM: Are you aware of any U.S. official who  
22 took any action related to U.S. policy in Ukraine intended  
23 to benefit Hunter Biden?

24 MS. NOVELLI: I am--I have no awareness.

25 MR. SCHRAM: Are you aware of any wrongdoing by the



1 Obama administration related to Hunter Biden's position on  
2 the board of Burisma?

3 MS. NOVELLI: I have no awareness.

4 MR. SCHRAM: Ms. Novelli, was the foreign policy that  
5 Vice President Biden pursued in Ukraine intended to advance  
6 the interests of the United States of America?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Everybody who worked on Ukraine was  
8 trying to advance the interests of the United States of  
9 America, to my knowledge.

10 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, was the foreign policy  
11 pursued by the State Department in Ukraine corrupt?

12 MS. NOVELLI: Was the foreign policy pursued by the  
13 State Department corrupt?

14 MR. SCHRAM: Correct.

15 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

16 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, was the foreign policy  
17 pursued by Vice President Biden in Ukraine corrupt?

18 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

19 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, did the State  
20 Department change foreign policy toward Ukraine in an effort  
21 to assist the Vice President's son?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

23 MR. SCHRAM: Did Vice President Biden change foreign  
24 policy towards Ukraine to assist his son?

25 MS. NOVELLI: I have no knowledge of that.

1 MR. SCHRAM: The majority contends that Blue Star  
2 Strategies used Hunter Biden's name to obtain meetings with  
3 you. Is that accurate?

4 MS. NOVELLI: That is not accurate.

5 MR. SCHRAM: Was it in your practice to meet with  
6 lobbying firms on issues that are in your portfolio?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

8 MR. SCHRAM: Did you take any personal action to change  
9 U.S. policy toward Ukraine because of your meetings with  
10 Blue Star representatives?

11 MS. NOVELLI: No.

12 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, did the State  
13 Department take any action to change U.S. policy toward  
14 Ukraine because of Blue Star's influence?

15 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

16 MR. SCHRAM: Did you take any action to change Ukraine  
17 policy because of Hunter Biden's position on Burisma's  
18 board?

19 MS. NOVELLI: No.

20 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, did any State  
21 Department official change Ukraine policy because of Hunter  
22 Biden's position on Burisma's board?

23 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

24 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, did Vice President  
25 Biden change Ukraine policy because of Blue Star's

1 influence?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

3 MR. SCHRAM: To your knowledge, did Vice President  
4 Biden change Ukraine policy because of Hunter Biden's role  
5 on the board of Burisma?

6 MS. NOVELLI: I have no knowledge.

7 MR. SCHRAM: In your opinion, is there any merit to the  
8 narrative that Vice President Biden's actions in Ukraine  
9 were corrupt?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I have no knowledge of--specific  
11 knowledge of Vice President Biden's actions in Ukraine, so I  
12 can't really proffer an opinion.

13 MR. SCHRAM: Are you aware of any current actions taken  
14 by U.S. officials with respect to the U.S. Government's  
15 policy in Ukraine?

16 MS. NOVELLI: No.

17 MR. SCHRAM: And that would include the Vice President?

18 MS. NOVELLI: That would include all U.S. officials.

19 MR. SCHRAM: Ms. Novelli, as you may have gathered from  
20 the first hour of questions, the Chairman insinuates that  
21 Hunter Biden was a central consideration of the Obama  
22 administration's policy in Ukraine. Is that accurate?

23 MS. NOVELLI: Not to my knowledge.

24 MR. SCHRAM: The Chairman alleges that Hunter Biden  
25 needed a favor, and Vice President Biden decided to

1 intervene to change U.S. policy in Ukraine, and the whole  
2 foreign policy apparatus of the United States, the EU, and  
3 the IMF turned on a dime to serve his needs. Is that how it  
4 works?

5 MR. FOLIO: Hey, Zack, if I could interject here,  
6 you've now twice said what Chairman Johnson alleges. I  
7 don't think you're quoting from anything, so I'd ask you to  
8 refrain from characterizing anything Chairman Johnson has  
9 said or what he has alleged unless you're reading an exact  
10 quote.

11 MR. SCHRAM: I decline from refraining from  
12 characterizing Chairman Johnson's allegations. Chairman  
13 Johnson has a long record speaking on these facts in  
14 multiple news settings, including revealing information from  
15 the ongoing investigation, including on--in media such as  
16 the One America Network, and there's no way to quote at  
17 length the many allegations that he's made. I will indicate  
18 that these are my characterizes of Chairman Johnson's  
19 allegations and insinuations.

20 MR. FOLIO: Just for the record, to be clear, no one's  
21 talking about leaks here. We're talking about you  
22 mischaracterizing a la Adam Schiff off the cuff what  
23 Chairman Johnson seeks to find or what Chairman Johnson has  
24 said without quoting him. So we believe these are gross  
25 mischaracterizations, and we'll state that for the record.

1 Again, insofar as you want to attribute anything to Chairman  
2 Johnson, it should be a direct quote. Otherwise, you should  
3 focus on the facts.

4 MR. GOSHORN: Joe, I just want to flag if we're going  
5 to start correcting each other's characterizations of what  
6 other people said, it's really going to slow down this whole  
7 process. I mean, I think there were several times we could  
8 have stopped you all during your questioning where you're,  
9 you know, characterizing the facts in a way that really  
10 weren't accurate. So--and we can move on from this, but I  
11 don't think this is necessarily a great road to start going  
12 down.

13 MR. SCHRAM: Do you dispute my characterizations? Then  
14 this entire investigation would be unnecessary, because this  
15 is what the Chairman has characterized in the public record  
16 and insinuates and alleges for the purpose of interfering in  
17 an election. So if you want to say that they're inaccurate,  
18 then the entire investigation could be completed.

19 MR. FOLIO: Again, it's a simple request. Rather than  
20 make things up, if you're going to talk about Chairman  
21 Johnson, you should read his quotes. Again, we're asking  
22 questions based on documents, questions about facts, what  
23 happened and didn't happen. They're straightforward.  
24 Again, it's a simple request. Please don't characterize the  
25 intent of our investigation. It is our investigation, not

1 yours. If you're going to refer to Chairman Johnson and  
2 what was in his mind, the only way you can do that with any  
3 accuracy, any sense of accuracy, is to read quotes. But I  
4 think I've made my objection and your gross  
5 mischaracterization clear. So please go ahead.

6 MR. SCHRAM: So here's something that Chairman Johnson  
7 said on the One America Network this week: "The media has a  
8 mantra about Joe and Hunter Biden that there's no evidence  
9 of wrongdoing or illegal activity. I could not disagree  
10 more."

11 Ms. Novelli, are you aware of illegal activity with  
12 respect to your decisions on Ukraine policy?

13 MS. NOVELLI: No.

14 MR. SCHRAM: Are you aware of illegal activity with  
15 respect to any member of the State Department's policy  
16 decisions on Ukraine?

17 MS. NOVELLI: I have no awareness.

18 MR. SCHRAM: Are you aware of illegal activity by the  
19 Vice President?

20 MS. NOVELLI: I have no awareness of that.

21 MR. SCHRAM: The central allegation of the majority's  
22 investigation is that the Vice President intervened on  
23 behalf of Hunter Biden, decided to change U.S. policy in  
24 Ukraine, and that the whole foreign policy apparatus of the  
25 United States, European Union, and the IMF turned on a dime

1 to serve his needs. Is that how it works?

2 MR. FOLIO: I'll just again object and note that you're  
3 mischaracterizing our investigation.

4 MR. SCHRAM: That's not how objections work, Joe, in a  
5 Committee interview. If you would like for me to object  
6 every time you make a characterization, this is going to be  
7 a 4-day interview.

8 Ms. Novelli, you're muted.

9 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. I was just speaking with my  
10 counsel. Could you be more specific? It's hard--it's a  
11 long question, and when you say, "Is that how it works?"  
12 what do you mean by, "Is that how it works?"

13 MR. SCHRAM: Sure. You talked a bit about the  
14 interagency process and the State Department policy process.  
15 And you spoke about the involvement of the Vice President's  
16 team in that process, so let me ask that other question.  
17 How involved was the Vice President's team in your policy  
18 decisions with respect to Ukraine?

19 MS. NOVELLI: So as I--my main job with respect to  
20 Ukraine was to make sure that, you know, the papers got  
21 processed, and then, you know, we had governmentwide cleared  
22 talking points that we would use when we would meet with  
23 Ukrainian officials. Those governmentwide cleared talking  
24 points were the result of an interagency process that  
25 involved numerous departments, and those were usually

1 provided by Victoria Nuland's cone of people. And so I--  
2 that's how the process worked with respect to what I was--my  
3 intersection with policy towards Ukraine.

4 MR. SCHRAM: So you were not getting instructions from  
5 the Vice President's office to change policy?

6 MS. NOVELLI: That is correct. I was not getting  
7 instruction from the Vice President's office directly.

8 MR. SCHRAM: Ms. Novelli, in the majority's theory of  
9 events, your meeting with Blue Star Strategies was a key  
10 moment in the maneuvering of U.S. policy to serve Hunter  
11 Biden's interests. Is that what happened?

12 MS. NOVELLI: No.

13 MR. SCHRAM: That's it for us, Joe.

14 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, do you need to take a break  
15 for about 20 minutes or would you like to keep going?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I think we can keep going, for--you know,  
17 it would be good to take a break every hour, but I think I  
18 can manage after 20 minutes.

19 MR. FOLIO: Okay. We'll get started and you just let  
20 us know if you need a break before the house.

21 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Thanks.

22 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, when you were Under Secretary  
23 at the State Department did you take any ethics training?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

25 MR. FOLIO: And how regularly did you take ethics



1 training?

2 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. How what?

3 MR. FOLIO: Regularly.

4 MS. NOVELLI: I think we were required to take it once  
5 a year, and because I was an Under Secretary I had somebody  
6 come and brief me.

7 MR. FOLIO: And from your perspective, what was the  
8 purpose of this ethics training?

9 MS. NOVELLI: The training was to make sure we were  
10 aware of the law with regard to our own behavior, you know,  
11 what we were or were not allowed to do, and to make us aware  
12 of who, within the State Department, we should consult, you  
13 know, if we have questions.

14 MR. FOLIO: And who were you made aware of that you  
15 should consult in the State Department if you had questions?

16 MS. NOVELLI: About my own issues, what I should and  
17 should not do? The Legal Advisor's Office.

18 MR. FOLIO: And as part of your ethics training, was  
19 there any part that addressed your responsibilities with  
20 regard to your staff or people to whom you reported?

21 MS. NOVELLI: Can you--sort of what do you mean by that  
22 exactly? You mean if somebody on my staff was acting in an  
23 unethical way?

24 MR. FOLIO: Did you feel any sense of responsibility to  
25 report unethical behavior by others that you witnessed?

1 MS. NOVELLI: If there was something that somebody on  
2 my staff was doing, I think we would counsel them directly.  
3 I did not encounter anything like that during my time at the  
4 State Department. I didn't encounter anybody on my staff  
5 behaving unethically.

6 MR. FOLIO: Are conflicts of interest part of these  
7 ethical rules and regulations that you were aware of when  
8 you worked at the State Department?

9 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. Those related to like to your own  
10 conflict of interest, you know, like if I had a conflict of  
11 interest. And so yes, there certainly were--there are rules  
12 on conflicts of interest.

13 MR. FOLIO: But what do you understand the general  
14 conflicts of interest of a mission to be?

15 MS. NOVELLI: Well, I'm not an ethics lawyer, but  
16 generally speaking you are not supposed to take a specific  
17 action with regard to a specific matter in which you have a  
18 financial interest.

19 MR. FOLIO: And so if you were taking a specific action  
20 to benefit yourself financially, would that be an ethical  
21 violation?

22 MS. NOVELLI: I believe so.

23 MR. FOLIO: What if you were taking an action that you  
24 believed was in the interest of the United States but it  
25 also had the effect of benefitting your financially? Could

1 that also be an ethical problem?

2 MS. NOVELLI: An action that benefitted you financially  
3 that was in the interest of the United States.

4 MR. FOLIO: Yes.

5 MS. NOVELLI: Could it be a problem? Yes, I would  
6 think so. But again, I am not an ethics lawyer.

7 MR. FOLIO: Yeah. I just want to understand your basic  
8 training at the State Department, your understanding of the  
9 role that conflicts of interest play when, you know,  
10 governing yourself and looking at your staff. And the point  
11 is that it sounds like you're saying that there are direct  
12 conflicts of interest, where you do something to benefit  
13 yourself and not the government, and that would be a  
14 violation, but there are also other conflicts that  
15 potentially could be consistent with U.S. policy, but  
16 nonetheless, based on the employment of your spouse or a  
17 relative, or based on your financial investments, could also  
18 present a potential conflict of interest. Is that right?

19 MS. NOVELLI: As I understand it, the rules are  
20 actually quite specific on what legally is a conflict of  
21 interest as opposed to the appearance of a conflict of  
22 interest. And so your spouse is included in that, but  
23 other--and again, I am not an ethics lawyer--but other  
24 family members who are not your dependents are not included  
25 in that. And the only reason that I--end. That's what I

1 understand. And again, I am not an ethics lawyer, so I am  
2 hardly the authority on this.

3 MR. FOLIO: But when you had ethics questions you said  
4 you would potentially consult the Office of the Legal  
5 Advisor. Were there any other offices in State that you  
6 would speak to about ethics issue?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Were there any other offices? If it was  
8 something that was really serious I could talk to the chief  
9 of staff or my own chief of staff. And these were, just to  
10 be clear, these would be ethics issues that were directly of  
11 State Department employees under my organization, not other  
12 people outside of the State Department.

13 MR. FOLIO: What if you witnessed ethnical issues  
14 involving people outside of the State Department, at other  
15 U.S. Government agencies?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall witnessing anything like  
17 that, so I can't really tell you what I would do.

18 MR. FOLIO: If you had, is that something you would  
19 have felt bound to have told someone or report it?

20 MS. NOVELLI: I never--I do not remember witnessing  
21 anything like that at all.

22 MR. FOLIO: If you had witnessed something at another  
23 agency, do you know to whom you might have reported that?

24 MS. NOVELLI: I probably would--again, this is pure  
25 speculation, but I probably would go to our Legal Advisor's

1 Office and have them handle it with whatever their  
2 counterpart would be in that agency's legal department.

3 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, I would like to spend our next  
4 bit of time on the firm Blue Star Strategies. Do you know  
5 the firm, Blue Star Strategies?

6 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

7 MR. FOLIO: How do you know that firm?

8 MS. NOVELLI: They are a firm that a colleague of mine,  
9 Karen Tramontano, founded, and that's how I know them.

10 MR. FOLIO: And how do you know Ms. Tramontano?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Ms. Tramontano was the deputy chief of  
12 staff in the Clinton administration, and during that  
13 administration I was the chief negotiator for the U.S.-  
14 Jordan free trade agreement, where we had to address labor  
15 and environment questions. So I know of her from that.

16 MR. FOLIO: When did you first meet Ms. Tramontano?

17 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember exactly when I first  
18 met her. I recall meeting her after I left the  
19 administration, in an issue involving the state of Ohio when  
20 I was at a law firm, and there was a panel discussion about  
21 manufacturing in Ohio. I do not recall actually meeting her  
22 before then. I knew of her, because she was working on  
23 labor issues at the White House when I was negotiating this  
24 agreement.

25 MR. FOLIO: And approximately what year was that, when

1 you were negotiating the agreement?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Let's see. When was the--was there an  
3 election in 2000? So it would have been in 2000, I would  
4 guess. It was at the end of the Clinton administration we  
5 negotiated the agreement, and then the Bush administration  
6 actually submitted the agreement to the Congress for  
7 approval. So whatever year that was, that would have been--  
8 I think that would have been in 2000. But I am going to  
9 have to go back and figure out when the Clinton  
10 administration was. It was the last year of the Clinton  
11 administration. I was a career government employee.

12 MR. FOLIO: When did you first learn about Blue Star  
13 Strategies?

14 MS. NOVELLI: I think that I first learned about them  
15 when I was at Apple, and Apple was looking to try to find  
16 some independent--somebody independent who could look at the  
17 questions of labor issues that were arising in its factories  
18 in China, its factories that Apple didn't own but were owned  
19 by an OEM.

20 And so we were looking around trying to see what--you  
21 know, where we could find something like that, and we hit  
22 upon the Fair Labor Association, the FLA. And Karen was, I  
23 believe, on the board of the FLA. I think she helped even  
24 maybe start it. And it was an organization that had been  
25 formed by textiles manufacturers who were concerned about

1 making sure that the plants that they were using were  
2 inspected and that they could--they were brand names and  
3 they wanted to make sure that, you know, the conditions in  
4 these factories were appropriate. And so they banded  
5 together and then they had this organization, sort of higher  
6 independent inspectors, to go in and then report any issues,  
7 you know, that occurred.

8       So we were looking into whether that would be an  
9 organization that we, at Apple, would be a good one for us  
10 to try to be part of so that we could get some independent  
11 inspection going that would be seen as valid. And that's  
12 when I became aware of Blue Star Strategies, because I went  
13 to talk to--or talked to her on the phone. I don't know if  
14 it was in person or on the phone--talk to Karen about the  
15 organization.

16       MR. FOLIO: And what year was that?

17       MS. NOVELLI: Oh, man. I'm sorry. I don't--I would  
18 have to go back and think about it. I don't know what year  
19 exactly that would have been.

20       MR. FOLIO: Can you give us a general range?

21       MS. NOVELLI: Yeah. It would have been in--let's see,  
22 I joined Apple in 2000, so it would have been sometime  
23 probably 2010-ish, but please don't hold me to that exact  
24 date. I don't remember the exact date, but sometime around  
25 then.

1 MR. FOLIO: So when you re-engaged with Ms. Tramontano  
2 around this time, what did she tell you about Blue Star  
3 Strategies?

4 MS. NOVELLI: That it was a consulting firm that she  
5 had started. That's really about it. She didn't really go  
6 into a lot of detail.

7 MR. FOLIO: Do you know Blue Star Strategies' chief  
8 operating officer, Sally Painter?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I've met Sally maybe once or twice.

10 MR. FOLIO: And when did you first meet Ms. Painter?

11 MS. NOVELLI: I believe when I went to talk to Karen  
12 about this Fair Labor Association, I may have gone to her  
13 office, but at some point when I was having conversations  
14 with her about the Fair Labor Association I got introduced  
15 to Sally, as a, "This is Sally, hi, hello" kind of thing.

16 MR. FOLIO: We would like to talk about your time as  
17 Under Secretary and your relationship with Blue Star and Ms.  
18 Tramontano and Ms. Painter then, but before we go, other  
19 than the circa 2010, you, on behalf of Apple, reaching out  
20 to her, do you have any other work or communication with Ms.  
21 Tramontano, Ms. Painter, or Blue Star between that 2010  
22 contact and the time that you became Under Secretary in  
23 2014?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Well, I mean, we certainly talked about  
25 the FLA. Karen started a nonprofit called the Global



1 Fairness Initiative, that was looking at how to help people  
2 in the gray economy, in very poor countries. One example is  
3 that they bought lanterns for people in India who were  
4 picking through the trash so they wouldn't fall into, you  
5 know, giant holes in the trash at night. So they were  
6 trying to do very practical things. So I certainly knew  
7 about that.

8       It was mostly around the FLA or that I would talk to  
9 her. And sometimes we would talk about trade policy too,  
10 because she had that experience from the Jordan agreement,  
11 and I still was very interested in trade policy from my job  
12 at Apple.

13       MR. FOLIO: So between the time you spoke with her  
14 circa 2010, while you were at Apple, and when you became  
15 Under Secretary in February of 2014, approximately how many  
16 times did you see Ms. Tramontano?

17       MS. NOVELLI: I have no idea. It was infrequent.

18       MR. FOLIO: Would it be fair to say that you've known  
19 Ms. Tramontano for years?

20       MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

21       MR. FOLIO: And would you consider yourself having  
22 worked with her over those years?

23       MS. NOVELLI: I would consider her to be a colleague.  
24 I don't know if I would say "worked with her" precisely.  
25 Certainly we--she was really helpful with regard to the Fair

1 Labor Association.

2 MR. FOLIO: Returning to your time as Under Secretary,  
3 did you become aware of attempts by Blue Star Strategies to  
4 meet with you?

5 MS. NOVELLI: At all, or in general?

6 MR. FOLIO: Yes.

7 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. I had some meetings with Blue Star  
8 Strategies on issues that were directly related to my  
9 portfolio.

10 MR. FOLIO: And what were those issues?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Things like--one of the things, as I  
12 explained we were looking at, is how we could look at supply  
13 chain issues. For example, we were doing a summit with  
14 African leaders, and we wanted to think about how they could  
15 engage more in the global economy. And one of the questions  
16 was going to be about how they could do that in a way that  
17 would allow brands, U.S. brands, to feel comfortable there,  
18 and labor issue are obviously one of those things. We  
19 talked to other people besides her about other things, like  
20 customs and intellectual property protection, et cetera.  
21 Because she had spent a lot of time on those sort of labor  
22 issues and she was busy working through her nonprofit on  
23 this, I talked to her about any ideas she might have about  
24 that, as an example.

25 MR. FOLIO: So did you reach out to her on occasion?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I believe I reached out to her about  
2 that, and then she, for example, came in when the head of  
3 the International Labour Organization, Guy Ryder, was in  
4 town, and she--I don't know, she was squiring him around or  
5 whatever. And we talked to him about Ethiopia, and  
6 specifically because a lot of companies were thinking of  
7 going there, which is a good thing because it would help  
8 develop the Ethiopian economy. And, you know, the question  
9 was, was there a way to not have the kind of disasters that  
10 happened in Bangladesh, you know, where factories were  
11 collapsing on people and killing thousands of people. Was  
12 there a way to, if Ethiopia was starting off new, to start  
13 off in a way that would--could make it be a place that would  
14 be really attractive to companies, because there wouldn't be  
15 those kinds of problems.

16 MR. FOLIO: So understanding that she brought issues to  
17 you that she wanted to speak to you about, I'd just like to  
18 focus for a minute on any occasions in which you initiated  
19 contact, in which you reached out to her. You mentioned the  
20 supply chain issue. Were there any others?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I asked if she would be on a panel. We  
22 had to have outside panelists to judge for the Cobb Award.  
23 It was an award for ambassador that had been endowed by  
24 somebody named Cobb, and Mr. Cobb wanted people who had had  
25 titles previously to be on the panel. So knowing that she

1 had had a title, I reached out to her to be one of the  
2 people on the committee.

3 MR. FOLIO: So during in the time that Ms. Tramontano  
4 or Blue Star was reaching out to you, was the International  
5 Labour leader, Guy Ryder, was that one of the times that she  
6 reached out to you?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

8 MR. FOLIO: And in what capacity was she reaching out  
9 to you? Was it in her capacity as CEO of Blue Star  
10 Strategies?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

12 MR. FOLIO: And why did she reach out to you? What was  
13 the purpose of that?

14 MS. NOVELLI: Because she was, I guess--I don't know  
15 exactly her relationship but she knew Guy Ryder very well  
16 and thought that he was somebody that I would benefit from  
17 talking to, because she knew that we were working on these  
18 questions of supply chain and how we could think about them  
19 for developing countries. And Guy Ryder was also thinking  
20 about that as the head of the ILO. So she suggested that it  
21 would be a good meeting.

22 MR. FOLIO: And we'll talk about Blue Star  
23 specifically, but--I'm sorry, Burisma--reaching out to you  
24 about Burisma and its own, Mykola Zlochevsky specifically.  
25 But other than that, were there any other issues or people

1 she reached out to you about, either in her personal  
2 capacity or as CEO of Blue Star Strategies?

3 MS. NOVELLI: Issues or people. Well, I certainly,  
4 again, I looked through all of the documents that you  
5 obtained from the State Department, and it appears that  
6 there were a few other meetings with her. One was with LVMH  
7 to talk about questions of sort of things going on in  
8 Europe, these issues of labor and how to treat workers,  
9 intellectual property. It was sort of a wide-ranging  
10 meeting. And I don't have--the only reason I remember that  
11 is because it was in the papers. It's not something that if  
12 you asked me and I did not have those papers that I would  
13 have remembered.

14 MR. FOLIO: Let's turn to the documents, and I'm going  
15 to ask Will to please pull up our internal  
16 Tab 3, and we're going to mark this as our Exhibit 2.

17 [Novelli Exhibit No. 2 was  
18 marked for identification.]

19 MR. FOLIO: And if you could please scroll down to the  
20 second page, Bates No. 1420.

21 Ms. Novelli, I don't know if you have access to this  
22 document, but just to orient you this is a two-page email,  
23 and then, Will, if you could scroll down to the third page  
24 to show you that pages 3 through 5 are an attachment on the  
25 Global Fairness Initiative. But I would like to ask a

1 question about the email on page Bates No. 1420.

2 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

3 MR. FOLIO: So in this email on March 19, 2014, Ms.  
4 Tramontano emails you and says that "It was great to see you  
5 yesterday, an unexpected pleasure. I know how busy you are  
6 and don't want to impinge on your time, but if you have a  
7 moment in the upcoming weeks to grab a coffee or whatever I  
8 am available."

9 Will, if you would please scroll up to page 1419. You  
10 respond, "It was such a pleasant surprise to see you at the  
11 advisory committee on Wednesday. I would love to get  
12 together and will copy my assistant who can work with yours  
13 to make it happen as soon as humanly possible."

14 So from this email it seems that you all ran into each  
15 other at the advisory committee meeting on Wednesday. What  
16 was the advisory committee?

17 MS. NOVELLI: I have no knowledge of what that was.  
18 There were a million of these advisory committees about  
19 various topics.

20 MR. FOLIO: Can you just give us a general sense about  
21 what a general advisory committee meeting, what it looked  
22 like, just to set the stage for us?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know which specific advisory  
24 committee meeting this was. As I said, everybody had  
25 advisory committees. There were committees to advise about

1 everything from--there was a big advisory committee about  
2 telecom policy, there was a big--there were advisory  
3 committees about all kinds of issues. So I'm not sure which  
4 advisory committee this would have been.

5 MR. FOLIO: So when you saw Ms. Tramontano at this  
6 advisory committee meeting, what did you discuss?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember specifically that  
8 meeting, so I can't really tell you. Usually these kind of  
9 committee meetings had anywhere from like 20 to 40 people at  
10 them. And so, you know, often you would see someone you  
11 would know and say hi. But I don't have any memory of  
12 whatever the advisory committee was that she is referring  
13 to.

14 MR. FOLIO: I'll ask Will to pull up our Tab 2, which  
15 we will mark as Exhibit 3.

16 [Novelli Exhibit No. 3 was  
17 marked for identification.]

18 MR. FOLIO: This is a one-page email, Bates marked  
19 2099, dated April 17, 2014. Ms. Novelli, it purports to be  
20 your schedule for Friday, April 18, 2014, so approximately  
21 one month after your email exchange with Ms. Tramontano  
22 about scheduling time to get to coffee, and on your calendar  
23 is says from 2 to 3 p.m., "Coffee with Karen Tramontano."

24 Did you get coffee with Ms. Tramontano on April 18,  
25 2014?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember what I did on April 18,  
2 2014. That's what the schedule says.

3 MR. FOLIO: Is your schedule usually kept accurately?

4 MS. NOVELLI: It was kept accurately. However,  
5 sometimes meetings would get called, you know, at the White  
6 House, and so everything would be upended. So I don't know  
7 if this schedule was kept accurately or not. You know, I  
8 just don't know.

9 MR. FOLIO: Accurate until it wasn't, right?

10 MS. NOVELLI: You are exactly right.

11 MR. FOLIO: So aside from whether or not you recall  
12 meeting with her on April 18, 2014, did you get coffee with  
13 Ms. Tramontano?

14 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sure that I got coffee with Karen at  
15 some point.

16 MR. FOLIO: And what did you all discuss when you would  
17 meet for coffee?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember the specifics of any  
19 conversation with her, so I can't really tell you.

20 MR. FOLIO: When you met with Ms. Tramontano, were the  
21 conversations personal or about business?

22 MS. NOVELLI: They were sort of a mixture maybe. But  
23 when I met with her in my office, when she would bring  
24 someone in, they were totally about business, whatever the  
25 topic was.



1 MR. FOLIO: So focusing on this coffee that was  
2 scheduled for April 18, 2014, when you would meet for  
3 coffee, what types of business would you discuss?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know that I met with her for  
5 coffee very often. I can't really--honestly, I'm sorry, I  
6 just don't have a specific memory of what we discussed at  
7 that time, and I don't remember meeting with her for coffee  
8 frequently.

9 MR. FOLIO: Approximately how many times did you meet  
10 with her for coffee?

11 MS. NOVELLI: I mean, obviously I met with her for  
12 coffee, you know, according to that schedule, but I don't  
13 remember doing it any other time while I was Under  
14 Secretary. It's not to say it didn't happen. I just don't  
15 remember.

16 MR. FOLIO: But you are saying at least once you met  
17 with her for coffee.

18 MS. NOVELLI: Apparently, and it appears, from all of  
19 the, you know, the emails and things, that we did actually  
20 meet.

21 MR. FOLIO: Now I'd like to turn back to what we marked  
22 as Exhibit 2, that email chain continues. Sorry. Tab 3.

23 So the email chain that we looked at, which is marked  
24 as Exhibit 2, the prior conversations from March 19 and  
25 March 21, 2014, the next email is from Ms. Tramontano to you

1 several months later, specifically on May 16, 2014. And in  
2 that email Ms. Tramontano thanks you for your time, and she  
3 wrote "that it's so great to see you in your new digs and to  
4 have such a delightful and wide-ranging conversation."

5 Did you meet with Ms. Tramontano on or about May 16,  
6 2014?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember it. I would presume  
8 this was related to that coffee, but I don't know. I don't  
9 remember specific dates when I met with Karen in my office.

10 MR. FOLIO: What did you guys discuss in your  
11 "delightful and wide-ranging conversation"?

12 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. I really just don't remember.

13 MR. FOLIO: Other than the coffee, approximately how  
14 many times did you meet with Ms. Tramontano in your office?

15 MS. NOVELLI: A few, from what I can tell from the  
16 documents that I have. I don't remember frequently meeting  
17 with her.

18 MR. FOLIO: But compared to the coffees, would it be  
19 fair to say that most of your meetings were in your office  
20 as opposed to coffee or otherwise offsite, when you were  
21 Under Secretary?

22 MS. NOVELLI: As I said, the only thing that appears to  
23 be a coffee was that one meeting. I do not remember having  
24 coffee with her otherwise.

25 MR. FOLIO: So to orient you around May 16, 2014, this

1 was the same week that Hunter Biden was announced to join  
2 the board of directors of Burisma. Did you discuss Hunter  
3 Biden joining the board of Burisma with Ms. Tramontano?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I am certain I did not discuss that.

5 MR. FOLIO: My colleague, Quinton, from Chairman  
6 Grassley's staff, has a few questions for you.

7 MR. BRADY: Ms. Novelli, can you hear me?

8 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

9 MR. BRADY: My name is Quinton Brady. I am an  
10 investigative counsel for Chairman Grassley. I am using  
11 Josh Flynn-Brown's computer.

12 Will, could you open up the new document? This is our  
13 Tab 4, for us Exhibit 4 as well.

14 [Novelli Exhibit No. 4 was  
15 marked for identification.]

16 MR. SCHRAM: Quinton, is it possible for you to turn  
17 the camera on so we can see who is speaking?

18 MR. BRADY: Sure. Can you see me?

19 MS. NOVELLI: No, I can't see you.

20 MR. BRADY: You cannot?

21 MS. NOVELLI: No.

22 MR. BRADY: Oh, it's because the screen is being shared  
23 with the document that we are presenting you.

24 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

25 MR. SCHRAM: Yeah, I can see you. The camera is

1 working now.

2 MR. BRADY: Okay. Great. In an email dated July 3,  
3 2014, you emailed Ms. Tramontano saying, "It was fun to talk  
4 with you last month." She subsequently asked, Ms.  
5 Tramontano, to serve on the Cobb Awards selection committee.  
6 I believe you mentioned this briefly a moment ago.

7 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

8 MR. BRADY: Can you restate why you asked Ms.  
9 Tramontano to serve on the Cobb selection committee?

10 MS. NOVELLI: As I said, the man, Cobb, Charles Cobb,  
11 who endowed the award, wanted to have people who had had  
12 titles to be on the selection committee. So, for example,  
13 we also asked Dan Sullivan, Senator Sullivan, who I'd worked  
14 at the State Department, if he would serve on the committee  
15 as well.

16 MR. BRADY: Did Ms. Tramontano serve on the Cobb Awards  
17 selection committee?

18 MS. NOVELLI: She did.

19 MR. BRADY: Had she ever served there before?

20 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know.

21 MR. BRADY: Do you know what the criteria is for  
22 someone to sit on the Cobb Award selection committee?

23 MS. NOVELLI: You know, I don't remember the specific  
24 criteria, no.

25 MR. BRADY: Okay, just generally that it was someone

1 with a title?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Yes, who had knowledge of international  
3 issues and was, you know, familiar with the State  
4 Department.

5 MR. BRADY: Who else served on the Cobb Awards  
6 selection committee with you that year?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember the list. I'm sure we  
8 can get it from the State Department.

9 MR. BRADY: Do the names Charles Cobb, Matthew McGuire,  
10 and Carolyn Brehm sound familiar?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. Charles Cobb was the person who  
12 endowed the award, Carolyn Brehm was at Procter & Gamble at  
13 the time, and Matthew McGuire, I don't remember his  
14 credentials.

15 MR. BRADY: Do you recall the topic of conversation  
16 that you reference, that appears took place in either July  
17 or May of 2014, when you sent that email?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. I don't know what you're--the  
19 topic I referenced?

20 MR. BRADY: Yes. In your email you said, "It was fund  
21 to talk with you last month." Do you recall what you spoke  
22 to Ms. Tramontano about?

23 MS. NOVELLI: No.

24 MR. BRADY: Is it possible that the topics of Hunter  
25 Biden or Burisma Holdings came up during those

1 conversations?

2 MS. NOVELLI: I am certain they did not.

3 MR. BRADY: Thank you, Ms. Novelli. That's all from  
4 me.

5 MS. NOVELLI: I think I'm ready for a break if you guys  
6 are okay with that.

7 MR. FOLIO: Sorry. That's perfectly fine. It's 12:05.  
8 Would you like to take a short bio break or would you like  
9 to take a longer lunch break? I think either could be  
10 appropriate now.

11 MS. NOVELLI: How about if we took like a 15-minute  
12 break? Would that be okay?

13 MR. FOLIO: Sure.

14 MS. NOVELLI: That would be enough time to eat  
15 something and come back.

16 MR. FOLIO: Does that work for everyone else?  
17 We will kind of reconvene at 12:20.

18 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Thank you.

19 MR. FOLIO: Thanks.

20 [Whereupon, at 12:06 p.m., the interview was recessed,  
21 to reconvene at 12:20 p.m. this same day.]

22

23

24

25

1 AFTERNOON SESSION

2 [12:25 p.m.]

3 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, I wanted to continue by  
4 turning--

5 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry.

6 MR. FOLIO: Speaking of the dogs.

7 I wanted to begin by turning to a document that is our  
8 Tab 5, but we're going to mark it as Exhibit 5.

9 [Novelli Exhibit No. 5 was  
10 marked for identification.]

11 MR. FOLIO: The last email you discussed was from July  
12 2014. This is going to be a scheduling email for you from  
13 November 17th, 2014, sending out a schedule for November  
14 18th, 2014, and if you scroll down to the 3:00 p.m. to 3:30  
15 p.m. time slot, the entry is ILO Director, General Guy  
16 Ryder, Karen Tramontano, CEO, Blue Star Strategies.

17 Ms. Novelli, is this the meeting that you discussed  
18 previously with the International Labour Organization  
19 director, Guy Ryder?

20 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

21 MR. FOLIO: And did this meeting occur?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

23 MR. FOLIO: And what was the purpose of this meeting?

24 MS. NOVELLI: As I said before, the purpose was that we  
25 were looking at how we could--how we could help or get the

1 ILO to help in developing countries who were trying to  
2 attract manufacturing, you know, to their country and how we  
3 could think about trying to be more proactive--or they  
4 could, those countries could, as they were trying to start  
5 off, countries like Ethiopia. And that was a particular one  
6 that we were thinking about because we thought that there  
7 was an opportunity for those countries to develop  
8 economically if they could, this among other issues, not  
9 just this one, but this happened to be the one that was  
10 under this Guy Ryder's purview, that if they could get  
11 issues like this, issues like intellectual property, and  
12 issues like customs and getting rid of corruption in  
13 customs, et cetera, if we could get those things set better,  
14 that that would help those countries develop.

15 MR. FOLIO: Did Ms. Tramontano join this meeting?

16 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

17 MR. FOLIO: And why was she there?

18 MS. NOVELLI: She, as I understand it--as I understand  
19 it, I don't know if she was representing them. I know that  
20 she knew Guy Ryder personally. So I assume that somehow--I  
21 don't know if Blue Star was representing him or if she just  
22 knew him. I don't know.

23 MR. FOLIO: Did you understand Ms. Tramontano to be  
24 there in her official capacity on behalf of Blue Star  
25 Strategies?



1 MS. NOVELLI: I believe so. I didn't really think  
2 about it, one way or another, to be honest.

3 MR. FOLIO: I'd like to turn to a document we will mark  
4 as Exhibit 6.

5 [Novelli Exhibit No. 6 was  
6 marked for identification.]

7 MR. FOLIO: Oh, I'm sorry. I know we've left that  
8 document, but just one more question about Exhibit 5.

9 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

10 MR. FOLIO: So he was ostensibly with Guy Ryder. Ms.  
11 Tramontano was there. Did your discussion address anything  
12 other than the topics you've described to us today?

13 MS. NOVELLI: I don't--that's what I remember about the  
14 meeting.

15 MR. FOLIO: Did it venture into any other clients that  
16 Blue Star might have had such as Burisma?

17 MS. NOVELLI: Oh, I'm certain Burisma was not  
18 discussed.

19 MR. FOLIO: Just trying to understand, why are you  
20 certain?

21 MS. NOVELLI: Because we were talking about--only about  
22 the questions of labor and how to look at labor norms.  
23 That's what the meeting was about. I do not recall anything  
24 about Burisma being discussed.

25 MR. FOLIO: And in general, was Ms. Tramontano the type

1 of person who might have a meeting with you about Topic A  
2 and then at the end of the meeting say, "Oh, by the way, one  
3 more thing," on something totally different?

4 MS. NOVELLI: That was not the usual types of meetings,  
5 that when she would be involved, we would talk about  
6 whatever the topic was, and then she would leave. And to be  
7 honest, I mean, my schedule, as you can see here, was in  
8 half-hour increments, and so there was no, like,  
9 chitchatting after a meeting. My secretary would have to  
10 basically come in with a hook to, like, move people out  
11 because the next people were already waiting two deep in my-  
12 -you know, in the waiting room.

13 MR. FOLIO: Okay. SO now let's turn to Exhibit 6.  
14 This is a longer document, Bates No. ending in 513 and 522.

15 And on the first page, which is dated October 21st,  
16 2015, the subject line is USGLC Global Initiative. What is  
17 the USGLC Global Initiative?

18 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. The USGLC luncheon?

19 MR. FOLIO: Correct, the luncheon, the attachment.

20 MS. NOVELLI: The GLC--I don't remember what those--  
21 Global Leadership Conference, I think that's what it was  
22 called, or Global Leadership Committee. It's a private-  
23 sector, nonprofit group that is made up of companies that  
24 try to support efforts of the State Department and U.S.  
25 diplomacy for U.S. global leadership. So it's a private-

1 sector group. It's not a government group.

2 And Liz Schrayer is the president and CEO. I think she  
3 still is, actually.

4 MR. FOLIO: So this document is an email, and it's a  
5 memorandum addressed to you. Why did you receive this  
6 document?

7 MS. NOVELLI: You know, I don't know. I can only tell  
8 you what the document says, that I was going to be at a  
9 lunch they were hosting.

10 MR. FOLIO: Did you participate in the GLC luncheon?

11 MS. NOVELLI: If my schedule says I did, I'm sure I  
12 did. I don't have any memory of this luncheon.

13 MR. FOLIO: And--

14 MS. NOVELLI: And could I just say--could I just say if  
15 you looked at my schedule there in half-an-hour increments,  
16 I had thousands of meetings in the time that I was Under  
17 Secretary. So, you know, it's rare for me to remember the  
18 details of any given meeting.

19 MR. FOLIO: So if you were scheduled to participate in  
20 a luncheon, what purpose is served by you getting a memo  
21 like this, like a background briefing memo to familiarize  
22 yourself with the--

23 MS. NOVELLI: I could only see the first, like, few  
24 lines of it. So I don't know what else is in this memo.

25 MR. FOLIO: We can scroll through and show you that.

1 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. You--okay. Okay. Keep going.

2 Mm-hmm. Okay. Okay.

3 So I think the purpose of something like this would be  
4 to sort of say, okay, this is what these folks here who are  
5 going to be here are expecting to hear about. These are the  
6 areas that, you know, we--that they're expecting to hear  
7 about from you.

8 And I think if you go down there, it describes what the  
9 USGLC is actually.

10 MR. FOLIO: Were you aware that Hunter Biden was on the  
11 board of the U.S. Global Leadership Coalition?

12 MS. NOVELLI: No.

13 MR. FOLIO: Have you ever met Hunter Biden?

14 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall meeting him.

15 MR. FOLIO: I'm going to turn to a document we will  
16 mark as Exhibit 7. It's heavy. This is document Bates Nos.  
17 ending in 870 through 878.

18 [Novelli Exhibit No. 7 was  
19 marked for identification.]

20 MR. FOLIO: And, Ms. Novelli, we're going to spend some  
21 time on this document, which is emailing you a background  
22 memorandum for an October 2015 meeting with Blue Star  
23 Strategies, but I wanted to turn to page 873, the contact  
24 sub-header or another purpose from--

25 Stop right there, Will.

1 So this is the attached background briefing memo for an  
2 October 2015 meeting with Blue Star Strategies. I'm going  
3 to spend some time with this in a minute.

4 But if you just scroll down a little bit, Will, to show  
5 the bottom of the contacts paragraph.

6 The last sentence in that contacts paragraph reads:

7 "You last met with Karen Tramontano from Blue Star  
8 Strategies February 2nd, 2015."

9 What was the purpose of you meeting with Ms. Tramontano  
10 on February 2nd, 2015?

11 MS. NOVELLI: I have no idea. I do not remember.

12 MR. FOLIO: We're going to turn to what we will mark as  
13 Exhibit 8. This is a two-page scheduling email, Bates Nos.  
14 ending 965 to 966. Starting on page 966, email were sent on  
15 October 29th, 2015, and on 966, it lists your schedule, Ms.  
16 Novelli, for Friday, October 30th, 2015, as including a 3:00  
17 p.m. meeting with Blue Star Strategies, with Karen  
18 Tramontano and Sally Painter. And it says paper received.

19 [Novelli Exhibit No. 8 was  
20 marked for identification.]

21 MR. FOLIO: When it says "paper received," does that  
22 mean that you've received a background memorandum preparing  
23 you for that meeting?

24 MS. NOVELLI: It means that the staff received a  
25 background memorandum.

1 MR. FOLIO: Received from the party with whom you're  
2 meeting?

3 MS. NOVELLI: No. Background memorandums were prepared  
4 by the--by my staff and in working with whomever the  
5 appropriate people were within the State Department who were  
6 responsible for whatever the topic was, and the way that the  
7 thing worked is that my staff was responsible for--the  
8 person who makes up the schedule was responsible for making  
9 sure that all the papers for the meetings that I had were  
10 compiled together in a briefing book so that I would be able  
11 to look at those papers before the meeting.

12 And, again, you can see that it's kind of a crunched  
13 scheduled--excuse me--and so they--this was their own  
14 notation saying "paper received." I didn't actually see  
15 these kind of documents myself. I would see my schedule,  
16 but these notations that a "paper received" or it says  
17 "agenda received," I never saw that. That was--their job  
18 was to make sure that all the stuff was there that was  
19 supposed to be there for the given meeting.

20 MR. FOLIO: Scroll down a little bit on that page.  
21 Your 4:30 p.m. meeting for that day is a weekly meeting with  
22 Amos Hochstein.

23 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

24 MR. FOLIO: Who is Amos Hochstein?

25 MS. NOVELLI: He was the--I don't know his exact title,

1 but he worked on energy issues. And I'm just smiling at the  
2 "weekly meeting" because we very infrequently met. The  
3 intention was to have a weekly meeting. We very  
4 infrequently met because he traveled a lot.

5 MR. FOLIO: And what was the purpose of your not always  
6 regular weekly meetings with Mr. Hochstein?

7 MS. NOVELLI: It was just for him to sort of bring me  
8 up to speed on, you know, if there was some issue that--or  
9 issues that were something that, you know, for my  
10 situational awareness, basically.

11 MR. FOLIO: I think you said you couldn't remember his  
12 title, but where was he positioned? Did he work in a bureau  
13 underneath you?

14 MS. NOVELLI: He worked underneath, yeah, the Under  
15 Secretary, and as I said, he did energy issues. There was  
16 some fight about whether that was a bureau or not a bureau.  
17 It needed congressional approval, and there were some  
18 Senators who didn't want it to be a bureau. So it--I don't  
19 think it was called a bureau, but that group of people  
20 worked on energy issues. And he was in charge of that  
21 group.

22 MR. FOLIO: I think earlier, this is what you referred  
23 to as the energy department. That was not a bureau?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah.

25 MR. FOLIO: And so was this one of the--we'll just say

1 entities that reported to you as the Under Secretary?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Yes, on paper.

3 MR. FOLIO: Paper. So who was in charge of the energy  
4 department?

5 MS. NOVELLI: Amos Hochstein.

6 MR. FOLIO: So it was Amos Hochstein?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah. For part of the time, I guess, at  
8 that point, yes, him. Before that, it was Carlos Pascual,  
9 and he resigned from the State Department. He was a career  
10 foreign service officer, and he retired from the State  
11 Department. And Amos was his deputy and then assumed that  
12 position.

13 MR. FOLIO: Did you ever discuss Ukraine issues with  
14 Mr. Hochstein?

15 MS. NOVELLI: I don't recall specific discussions with  
16 him about Ukraine, but I would suspect that because he spent  
17 a lot of time working on Ukraine that there were issues that  
18 would come up.

19 Most of the things that we would talk about with regard  
20 to Ukraine were about questions involving the EU and the  
21 EU's access to energy from Russia, and the pipelines went  
22 through Ukraine.

23 MR. FOLIO: When you say "we," you meant you and Mr.  
24 Hochstein? That's what you spent time discussing?

25 MS. NOVELLI: Correct. Well, and he was working on



1 many other issues. He was working on energy in the Middle  
2 East. He was working on questions of--I guess there have  
3 been some big fines of--I don't know if it was oil or gas in  
4 Israel's territorial waters, and so there were--he was  
5 trying to broker some deals that had to do with Israel and  
6 Egypt and Israel and Jordan. Also, there were issues  
7 involving Turkey and whether pipelines of energy that would  
8 be used by the EU would go through Turkey or go through  
9 elsewhere. So they were mostly those kinds of issues.

10 MR. FOLIO: You say he spent a lot of his time working  
11 on Ukraine issues. What were those issues?

12 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know specifically since he was  
13 responsible for energy. I presume they were energy issues  
14 related to Ukraine, but I don't--I didn't really--as I said,  
15 I met with him in frequently because he was traveling, and I  
16 don't know the details of the things that he was working on.

17 MR. FOLIO: Were there any specific things with regard  
18 to U.S. policy towards Ukraine that he brought to your  
19 attention?

20 MS. NOVELLI: I don't recall things that he brought to  
21 my attention. That's not to say he didn't, but I don't have  
22 a memory of precise things that he brought to my attention.

23 MR. FOLIO: So earlier you said that he reported to you  
24 on paper. To whom did he report, I guess, in reality?

25 MS. NOVELLI: He spent a lot of time working directly

1 with Secretary Kerry. He spent a lot of time working with  
2 people at the White House. So he--yeah. So I don't know if  
3 I'd call it "reporting," but he certainly worked with them  
4 quite a bit.

5 MR. FOLIO: And why was that?

6 MS. NOVELLI: Why was that? I don't--I mean, that was  
7 just the way he operated.

8 MR. FOLIO: Was it more of a him decision or a decision  
9 by others? Because, ostensibly, you know, he falls within  
10 your remit.

11 MS. NOVELLI: I did ostensibly fall within my remit. I  
12 think it was--I don't know. I honestly don't know. I mean,  
13 he certainly was very active in his portfolio, and worked--  
14 he worked on his portfolio. And I tried to focus my time,  
15 because I had so many things I was responsible for, on  
16 things where I felt like I could myself make a contribution.  
17 And so I didn't spend that much time on those issues because  
18 he was occupying that space.

19 MR. FOLIO: Did you have awareness as to what he was  
20 working on and how he was coordinating that with Secretary  
21 Kerry in the White House?

22 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know what you mean by  
23 "awareness." I mean, I generally knew that he was working  
24 with the White House, you know, and often, these meetings  
25 that we were supposed to have weekly, did not occur because

1 he was at the White House or someplace else or out of town  
2 or whatever. So I had that kind of awareness. I didn't  
3 really know, on a day-to-day basis, what he was doing.

4 MR. FOLIO: And which issues did he take to Secretary  
5 Kerry and the White House? Was it all of them?

6 MS. NOVELLI: You know, I don't really know. I don't  
7 really know. I wasn't involved in the minutiae of what he  
8 was doing.

9 MR. FOLIO: So I think this is a good point to  
10 transition. We have a couple of minutes left, but we were  
11 going to move to a newer and longer document, so I think  
12 it's probably best for us to hand the proverbial microphone  
13 to Zack or someone from his team to proceed from there.

14 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

15 MR. SCHRAM: Joe, I don't have any questions at this  
16 juncture. Dan, do you?

17 MR. GOSHORN: Yeah. I just wanted to clarify  
18 something. So the majority has asked you about several  
19 meetings you had with Blue Star in 2014 and 2015, so far.  
20 And so to be clear, do you recall discussing Hunter Biden or  
21 Burisma at any of those?

22 MS. NOVELLI: No.

23 MR. GOSHORN: Are you aware of the date on which Blue  
24 Star began its relationship with Burisma?

25 MS. NOVELLI: No.

1 MR. GOSHORN: So according to a document that Blue Star  
2 provided to Committee, Blue Star's relationship with Burisma  
3 began in November of 2015. Were you aware of that?

4 MS. NOVELLI: No.

5 MR. GOSHORN: No. In your experience you said you have  
6 had thousands of meetings, you know, in your role. You  
7 know, if you're meeting a representative for a company or a  
8 lobbyist, is it something that happens frequently that they  
9 mention persons who are not their clients, and raise  
10 interests for people who they have no relationship with in  
11 those meetings? Does that happen frequently?

12 MS. NOVELLI: No.

13 MR. GOSHORN: Okay. That's all I have. Thank you.

14 MR. FOLIO: Okay. Ms. Novelli. We are going to turn  
15 back to what we previously marked as Exhibit 7. Again, this  
16 document, the Bates Nos. end in 870 through 878.

17 The first two pages, Ms. Novelli, and we can scroll  
18 through and show them to you, it's an email requesting  
19 clearance at a BCL for Novelli meeting with Blue Star  
20 Strategies regarding macro financial assistance for Ukraine.  
21 What's a BCL?

22 MS. NOVELLI: It's a briefing memo.

23 MR. FOLIO: And briefing memos are something you  
24 received regularly as part of your work as Under Secretary?

25 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. I would receive briefing memos for

1 meetings that I was having.

2 MR. FOLIO: Okay. And I want to focus on the briefing  
3 memo but I'll ask Will to scroll slowly through the next two  
4 pages, cover emails, which was attached. If there's  
5 anything you'd like to move more slowly on please speak up.

6 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Can you stop right there? Okay.

7 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, sorry. Before we leave that,  
8 this emails says--it starts with an "E has met with them  
9 before." Who is E?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I'm E.

11 MR. FOLIO: Okay. And what does that stand for?

12 MS. NOVELLI: It's stands for the Under Secretary for  
13 Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment. E. E is the  
14 initial. Everybody in the State Department has an initial.  
15 So the Secretary is S, the Deputy Secretary is D, the Under  
16 Secretary for Political Affairs is P, and I was E. And  
17 there were some other alphabet people, and then, you know,  
18 people like EB is Economic and Business, that is underneath  
19 E.

20 MR. FOLIO: I'm still trying to understand why Bill  
21 Killion, who is on the phone, works at H. That means  
22 Legislative Affairs.

23 MS. NOVELLI: I know. I've never understood why H is  
24 Legislative Affairs either.

25 MR. FOLIO: And I think this is addressed in the memo,

1 but looking at that second bullet point, that second bullet  
2 points starts--and again, this is a reflection of issues  
3 that Blue Star would like to raise in their meeting with  
4 you--

5 MS. NOVELLI: Mm-hmm.

6 MR. FOLIO: --it says, "Knowing of Under Secretary  
7 Novelli's critical role in Ukraine loan agreement, we would  
8 like to learn more about U.S. capacity to grant greater  
9 economic aid to Ukraine."

10 MR. SCHRAM: Joe, sorry to interrupt, but as is  
11 tradition, because you didn't identify exhibits for us in  
12 advance, it will take us a moment to find this document. So  
13 if you could please hold your questioning until we have it.

14 MR. FOLIO: Oh, sure, thanks. Sorry. We talked about  
15 this about 10 minutes ago so I think you'd already--

16 [Pause.]

17 MR. SCHRAM: Okay. Thank you.

18 MR. FOLIO: So on that second bullet point, Ms.  
19 Novelli, they are referring to, again, I think their term is  
20 the critical role you play in Ukraine loan agreement. From  
21 your perspective, to what is that referring? What part of  
22 your roles and responsibilities?

23 MS. NOVELLI: Well, I think I went over this, where we  
24 basically process the paperwork to release the funds, you  
25 know, the ESF funds or the loan guarantees. That was people

1 underneath me who did that. So, presumably, whoever sent  
2 this email understood what our function was.

3 MR. FOLIO: So it said that from their perspective they  
4 wanted to have this meeting so that they could learn more  
5 about the U.S. capacity to grant greater economic aid to  
6 Ukraine.

7 MS. NOVELLI: Mm-hmm.

8 MR. FOLIO: So by asking for a meeting with you were  
9 they coming to the right place?

10 MS. NOVELLI: It was one of the places they could come.  
11 There are other places they could have gone, and I presume  
12 they did. I don't really know.

13 MR. FOLIO: What are some of those other places?

14 MS. NOVELLI: They could have gone to the Assistant  
15 Secretary for Europe, Victoria Nuland. They could have gone  
16 to the Treasury Department. They could have gone to the  
17 White House. I mean, those are the sort of key places they  
18 could go.

19 MR. FOLIO: I'll ask Will to scroll to through the next  
20 page, the third page, which is still part of the email. Let  
21 us know if you'd like to stop.

22 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Keep going. Okay. Okay.

23 MR. FOLIO: This brings us back to the page that is  
24 Bates marked 873, which is the beginning of the memorandum  
25 to you about your meeting with Karen Tramontano and Sally

1 Painter from Blue Star Strategies on October 30, 2015 at  
2 2:30 p.m.

3 MS. NOVELLI: Mm-hmm.

4 MR. FOLIO: Starting with the beginning, the context  
5 paragraph says that the Open Society Foundation, led by  
6 George Soros, retained Blue Star Strategies to assist them  
7 in promoting greater economic aid for Ukraine. What is the  
8 Open Society Foundation?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I, you know, I only know what I've read  
10 in the paper. I don't know it otherwise.

11 MR. FOLIO: What was your understanding of Blue Star  
12 Strategies' relationship with the Open Society Foundation?

13 MS. NOVELLI: Well, my understanding--I mean, I should  
14 tell you I have no specific recollection independent of this  
15 paper of that meeting.

16 MR. FOLIO: Okay.

17 MS. NOVELLI: So just reading what's in the paper here  
18 it says that they retained Blue Star Strategies. So that's--  
19 -I have no independent memory of this meeting and I, you  
20 know, I read my briefing paper before the meeting occurred.  
21 And the only reason I know that is because of the memorandum  
22 of conversation that came after it, where I followed the  
23 talking points that were in this paper.

24 MR. FOLIO: And from your perspective, if Blue Star  
25 Strategies was asking for this meeting on behalf of Open



1 Society Foundation, would that be asking for a meeting in  
2 their official capacity as a representative of Open Society  
3 Foundation?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I'd presume so. I mean, that was very  
5 typical of firms to ask for meetings on behalf of their  
6 clients.

7 MR. FOLIO: What's your understanding of the Open  
8 Society Foundation and its goals for Ukraine?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I don't have any independent knowledge of  
10 the Open Society Foundation's goals for Ukraine.

11 MR. FOLIO: So we've reviewed this document before, but  
12 you're welcome to take some time to review it again. Based  
13 on this memorandum that was prepared for you, what was the  
14 purpose of meeting with representatives from the Open  
15 Society Foundation about Ukraine?

16 MS. NOVELLI: Would I be able to--could you please  
17 scroll down so that I can read the rest of it? Thank you.

18 [Pause.]

19 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Could you keep scrolling, please?

20 [Pause.]

21 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Keep scrolling, please.

22 [Pause.]

23 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

24 [Pause.]

25 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Keep scrolling.

1 [Pause.]

2 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. Could you go back up one more  
3 line? Thank you.

4 [Pause.]

5 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

6 [Pause.]

7 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Keep going.

8 [Pause.]

9 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Keep going.

10 [Pause.]

11 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Okay.

12 MR. FOLIO: I wasn't going to ask about the tabs.

13 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Okay. No, I don't need to review  
14 them if you're not asking about them.

15 MR. FOLIO: So having reviewed the memo, does the memo  
16 refresh your recollection about having this meeting with Ms.  
17 Tramontano and Ms. Painter about their client, the Open  
18 Society Foundation?

19 MS. NOVELLI: To be honest, I do not remember this  
20 meeting. I just don't have any specific recollections of  
21 this meeting.

22 MR. FOLIO: Can you help us understand, why would the  
23 Open Society Foundation hire someone like Blue Star to  
24 advocate on their behalf?

25 MR. NASH: I'm going to object to that question, Joe,

1 if you're asking why an entity, which doesn't have a mind of  
2 its own, but even if it was a person you are talking about,  
3 I don't think it would be appropriate to ask Kathy what  
4 their motivation would be.

5 MR. FOLIO: I'm sorry. I prefaced my question by  
6 asking, from her perspective, because it sounds like she  
7 takes, or took lots of meetings with attorneys or consulting  
8 firms that were advocating on behalf of clients. Every  
9 client is a little bit different, so I wanted to understand,  
10 from her perspective, what she thought an organization like  
11 the Open Society Foundation was hoping to achieve, as  
12 someone who was addressed in the background memo, you know,  
13 by hiring a consulting firm and then scheduling a meeting  
14 with her, in her role as Under Secretary.

15 MS. NOVELLI: You know, I can't really say why they  
16 would hire an outside consultant. Obviously, the memo talks  
17 about what their goals were, what they wanted to achieve.  
18 But I can't tell you why they hired an outside consultant.

19 MR. FOLIO: And when you would receive information  
20 about the position that an external entity like the Open  
21 Society Foundation was taking, what would you do with that  
22 information and how would you review it, I guess, in the  
23 context of U.S. foreign policy goals. Obviously this  
24 organization had its own goals, but what would you do with  
25 information that you learned in meetings like this?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I guess take it on board. I mean, listen  
2 to what they had to say.

3 If you notice, in that briefing memo, there was a  
4 question I asked, which was what are the winning arguments  
5 you think that are--you know, that would be here. So--and  
6 it--again, just from reading the memo, it sounded like there  
7 was a lot of--that the Open Society Foundation also wanted  
8 Ukraine to be economically viable as did the U.S.  
9 Government.

10 So it would be normal to meet with somebody who is  
11 talking about those kind of things, and I should say the  
12 meetings that were--that are held aren't just with me.  
13 There's all kinds of other people sitting there, including  
14 people from the Ukraine desk and elsewhere, and so it's  
15 helpful information for lots of people, not just me.

16 MR. FOLIO: So on page 875 of the document, it lists  
17 the participants as just being you, Ms. Tramontano and Ms.  
18 Painter. Does that indicate that it was only the three of  
19 you, or in light of what you just said, could others have  
20 participated in this meeting?

21 MS. NOVELLI: No, I would--and in fact, if you look at  
22 the--there's another document that is the memo, memorandum  
23 of conversation, and I don't remember who write it. But  
24 that person was there taking notes, and when I would have  
25 meetings like this, there would be somebody from my staff

1 plus other people who would have an interest in whatever the  
2 information is from other bureaus.

3 So that participant list on our side is not accurate.

4 MR. FOLIO: Looking at the first page of the memo,  
5 which is Bates No. 873, the top paragraph, header contact--

6 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. It's not there yet. Contacts.

7 Okay.

8 MR. FOLIO: So just for the bolded sentence, that  
9 sentence reads: "Blue Star Strategies is aware of your role  
10 in sovereign loan guarantees for Ukraine and would like to  
11 discuss the U.S. Government's capacity to provide greater  
12 economic aid to Ukraine."

13 MS. NOVELLI: Mm-hmm.

14 MR. FOLIO: We talked about this in the lead-up to the  
15 memo. Again, it sounds like you were one of the people for  
16 whom it would make sense to have that conversation with; is  
17 that right?

18 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

19 MR. FOLIO: On 874, the next page, under the sub-header  
20 2, U.S. support for Ukraine--

21 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. Keep going. Okay, I see it.

22 MR. FOLIO: It summarizes that the United States  
23 Government has provided approximately \$569 million in  
24 assistance since the crisis began to help Ukraine respond to  
25 the crisis, advance reforms, strengthen institutions. In

1 addition, President Obama intends to move forward with a  
2 third \$1 billion loan guarantee for Ukraine in the coming  
3 months.

4 So this is October 2015--

5 MS. NOVELLI: Mm-hmm.

6 MR. FOLIO: --when the President decides that the  
7 government is going to move forward with a third \$1 billion  
8 loan guarantee, especially if you've been through this at  
9 least once, if not twice, before. What does mean when the  
10 President makes that decision to move forward with a loan  
11 guarantee? What's the process that follows?

12 MS. NOVELLI: I think if you--if you scroll down a  
13 little bit to be under background--you can scroll down a  
14 little bit where it says "The United States and Ukraine must  
15 now negotiate the terms, including the conditions  
16 precedent," that's the process.

17 MR. FOLIO: And had you prior to this loan guarantee in  
18 October 2015--were you involved in the approval of either of  
19 the two previous sovereign loan guarantees?

20 MS. NOVELLI: I do not recall; however, if they were  
21 occurring while I was there, then, you know, I would have  
22 been involved.

23 I was not personally involved in coming up with the  
24 conditions precedent, however. That was not something that  
25 I personally did.

1 MR. FOLIO: Were you kept in the loop about the  
2 conditions that would have to be met before you could  
3 process them?

4 MS. NOVELLI: Not at a level of specificity. Now,  
5 someone might say--usually, you know, there would be--there  
6 would be a negotiation about the terms, and then, you know,  
7 what those terms were. And then--and somebody would say,  
8 "We're still negotiating terms," but they wouldn't  
9 necessarily go into the details of what those were to me.  
10 There were people underneath me who were working on the  
11 details of this.

12 And then similarly with the conditions precedent,  
13 somebody would say, "Okay. Ukraine has met these  
14 conditions." So, you know, now we can move ahead.

15 MR. FOLIO: How long would it take to negotiate the  
16 terms of the sovereign loan guarantee to Ukraine?

17 MS. NOVELLI: You know, I do not know precisely. It  
18 wasn't something that happened in a day or even a week. I  
19 mean, it was a lengthy process.

20 MR. FOLIO: It sounds like you may have seen a document  
21 about this, but were you aware that State Department  
22 officials created readouts of your meetings and provided  
23 them to others?

24 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. That was what they were supposed to  
25 do.

1 MR. FOLIO: And do you know the officials that  
2 typically received the readouts of your meetings?

3 MS. NOVELLI: It would depend on, you know, what the  
4 meeting was.

5 MR. FOLIO: So for this meeting with the Open Society  
6 Foundation representatives, Blue Star Strategies, did you  
7 know that Ambassador Pyatt received a readout of the  
8 meeting?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I know that because of the document and  
10 his email thanking them for sending it to him. I would say  
11 that's--that is a normal thing, though, because you're  
12 trying to make sure the ambassador to the country is kept  
13 informed about meetings that are occurring that would have--  
14 that where somebody is talking about their country.

15 MR. FOLIO: So it's typical that if the meeting touched  
16 on Ukraine issues that the meeting readout would be funneled  
17 to the ambassador for Ukraine?

18 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

19 MR. FOLIO: And who made the decision as to what  
20 should become aware?

21 MS. NOVELLI: It wasn't me. I honestly don't know. I  
22 presume the people--usually, there's somebody from the  
23 Country Desk who would come to meetings that were about a  
24 country, and that person was responsible for deciding, you  
25 know, who would see the readout, I believe.



1 MR. FOLIO: Bridget Brink--

2 MS. NOVELLI: I mean, I don't honestly--you know, I was  
3 not the person responsible for making those decisions.

4 MR. FOLIO: Bridget Brink, I believe Ambassador Bridget  
5 Brink also received the readout of this meeting. What was  
6 her role at this time, and why would she have received this?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. Her name was what?

8 MR. FOLIO: Ambassador Bridget Brink.

9 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know who she is.

10 MR. FOLIO: George Kent also received a readout of this  
11 meeting.

12 MS. NOVELLI: He worked on--in the Assistant Secretary  
13 for Europe, that chain.

14 MR. FOLIO: And then why would he have received a  
15 readout of this meeting?

16 MS. NOVELLI: Because he was--he was part of the--  
17 Ukraine was underneath the Assistant Secretary for Europe.  
18 So someone--whoever did the memo and sent it around decided  
19 it was something that he should see.

20 MR. FOLIO: And then the Assistant Secretary for Europe  
21 at this time, that was Victoria Nuland?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Correct.

23 MR. FOLIO: Did you receive copies of these readouts?

24 MS. NOVELLI: No.

25 MR. FOLIO: Why not?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I was a very busy person, and so people  
2 on my staff would look at them. But I didn't.

3 MR. FOLIO: I'm going to turn to a document we're going  
4 to mark as Exhibit 9.

5 [Novelli Exhibit No. 9 was  
6 marked for identification.]

7 MR. FOLIO: So just to orient you, the meeting that we  
8 just spoke about was an October 30th, 2015, meeting with  
9 Blue Star Strategies, Karen Tramontano, and Sally Painter,  
10 and their client--without the client, the Open Societies  
11 Foundation, and then this document which we've marked as  
12 Exhibit 9, Bates No. ending in 1347 is a November 6th, 2015,  
13 employee from Sally Painter to you, copying Karen  
14 Tramontano, subject line, "Thank You." Let us know when  
15 you've had the chance to read it.

16 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah, I've read it.

17 MR. FOLIO: So in this email, Ms. Painter thanks you  
18 again for taking the time to meet with her and Karen by  
19 phone on Ukraine: "Your insight and guidance were very  
20 helpful and much appreciated. We are following up with our  
21 team in Ukraine to better ascertain their reviews on funding  
22 and other issues. We will keep you posted if this  
23 develops."

24 Looking at this email, does this refresh your  
25 recollection as to what you discussed then during that

1 October 30th meeting?

2 MS. NOVELLI: I am really--I just don't remember this  
3 meeting. I know it happened. There's a briefing memo.  
4 There's a memorandum of conversation, but I do not--I didn't  
5 even remember this meeting at all until I saw the briefing  
6 memo and the memorandum of conversation.

7 MR. FOLIO: Well, at least you know that your insights  
8 and guidance were very helpful and appreciated, so--

9 MS. NOVELLI: That's nice to know.

10 MR. FOLIO: We're going to move to a document we'll  
11 introduce as Exhibit 10.

12 [Novelli Exhibit No. 10 was  
13 marked for identification.]

14 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

15 MR. FOLIO: This is an email with Bates Nos. ending in  
16 986 through 989. Turning to page 988, which is the first  
17 substantive email chain. Ms. Tramontano emails you on  
18 February 18th, 2016, and says that she has requested a  
19 meeting "to discuss a matter on which I need your advice. I  
20 spoke to"--redacted--"in your office yesterday to explain my  
21 reason for asking for a meeting. Essentially, the U.S.  
22 Government has taken a position in a commercial matter  
23 regarding a Ukrainian individual, and I believe the position  
24 is in error. I would like to give you a briefing and ask  
25 your advice in this matter."

1           You forward the email--I'm sorry. You respond and say,  
2 "Happy to meet with you," and you copy someone who can make  
3 it happen.

4           MS. NOVELLI: That's my administrative assistant.

5           MR. FOLIO: What was the commercial matter regarding  
6 the Ukrainian individual to which Ms. Tramontano was  
7 referring in this email?

8           MS. NOVELLI: Again, I do not have specific detailed  
9 recollections of this meeting. I didn't know what the  
10 matter was until, you know, the meeting occurred.

11          MR. FOLIO: And what is that recollection?

12          MS. NOVELLI: What is my recollection of what? The  
13 meeting?

14          MR. FOLIO: I'm sorry. Maybe I misunderstood what you  
15 said in response. So what the commercial matter was, you  
16 said you didn't recall--

17          MS. NOVELLI: I didn't--at the time I agreed to the  
18 meeting, I did not know what the matter was.

19          MR. FOLIO: So in this email, she's--Ms. Tramontano is  
20 saying that she wanted to give you a briefing and ask your  
21 advice in this matter.

22          MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

23          MR. FOLIO: Is the briefing, like her offering to  
24 provide you a briefing, is that typically the type of  
25 information she would bring to your attention as Under

1 Secretary?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Well, I--she was asking for a meeting.  
3 Usually, in a meeting, somebody would tell you whatever the  
4 information is. That's the briefing part of it, and then  
5 she said she wanted to ask my advice about what this was.  
6 But what this was was not specific.

7 MR. FOLIO: I guess I want to understand between  
8 offering you briefing and then asking you--asking for your  
9 advice. And was it typical for someone to email you, again,  
10 sort of in your official capacity and ask to come meet with  
11 you at the Department and ask for your advice about  
12 something?

13 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. Something that was related to  
14 business, yes. And companies would regularly do that.

15 MR. FOLIO: And what sort of advice were you in a  
16 position to provide?

17 MS. NOVELLI: About this, I don't know.

18 MR. FOLIO: I just mean in general.

19 MS. NOVELLI: I'm just trying to think of an example.  
20 Nothing is coming to mind, but normally, you know, they  
21 would ask about, you know, what is going on with the U.S.  
22 policy. And I could tell them--they might ask what official  
23 in a certain government was in charge of something. Like,  
24 in Europe, you know, they're worrying about--there was a lot  
25 of concern about what the Europeans were going to do, for

1 example, with regard to digital issues, and so a lot of  
2 companies that were concerned about that would come and say,  
3 "Hey, we're really worried about this. Like, who's the best  
4 people to talk to, and do you understand, like, what they're  
5 thinking? What can we say that would help--you know, help  
6 get us to a better space?" Those are the type of things.

7 MR. FOLIO: So, again, this email from Ms. Tramontano  
8 to you is on February 18th, 2016. Were you aware that a  
9 representative from Blue Star Strategies had reached out  
10 about a week prior on February 10th, 2016, trying to  
11 schedule a meeting between you and Ms. Tramontano?

12 MS. NOVELLI: No.

13 MR. FOLIO: So in the course of that email exchange,  
14 which did not involve you, it was reported that Ms.  
15 Tramontano requested 30 minutes of your time to ask for your  
16 personal thoughts on a client matter. It was further  
17 described that this is personal to Ms. Tramontano knowing  
18 you and is not a request to talk with subject-matter  
19 experts.

20 MR. SCHRAM: Joe, what are you reading from?

21 MR. FOLIO: I am reading from a document that Ms.  
22 Novelli is not copied on, Bates No. ending 7524 to 7525--I'm  
23 sorry--

24 MR. SCHRAM: Are you making it as an exhibit and  
25 introducing it into the record?

1 MR. FOLIO: I wasn't doing that at this time. We  
2 might, but not yet.

3 MR. SCHRAM: Well, I would ask if we're discussing a  
4 document that we all be allowed to see it. I'll raise again  
5 that you've not provided Minority with copies of these  
6 documents. So you're now asking questions about a document  
7 that neither the witness nor the Minority has in front of  
8 them.

9 MR. FOLIO: Well, I'll give you the--you have a copy of  
10 the document. If you need a second to find it, just let me  
11 know, but I was hesitating to provide Ms. Novelli because  
12 she's not copied on this email. So I'm asking whether or  
13 not she--

14 MR. SCHRAM: You've not made it whether or not you're  
15 entering it as an exhibit number. It is now an exhibit to a  
16 transcribed interview, and the witness has a right to review  
17 it if she's going to respond to it.

18 And we would--we would also--would have appreciated the  
19 opportunity to see it and to not have to now go fumble  
20 through our files and look for it.

21 MR. FOLIO: Well, let me know when you have it, Zack.

22 [Pause.]

23 MR. FOLIO: Do you have it, Zack, or are you still  
24 looking?

25 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. We've having a little technical

1 difficulty here. Stuart's screen is frozen. So just if you  
2 can hold on one second.

3 MR. FOLIO: Sure.

4 MR. SCHRAM: I don't have it yet, but I'd ask that if  
5 we discuss it that you put it on the screen and enter it as  
6 an exhibit.

7 [Pause.]

8 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. Stuart's computer was sitting in  
9 the sun and we think it might have overheated, so he's put  
10 it in the shade. So can we just wait a second so that he  
11 can get back online?

12 MR. FOLIO: Sure thing.

13 MS. NOVELLI: Thanks.

14 [Pause.]

15 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. He's in the shade. He's back.

16 MR. FOLIO: Outstanding.

17 MR. SCHRAM: Did he miss our conversation over this  
18 document?

19 MS. NOVELLI: Stuart, are you in? Okay. Did you hear  
20 the conversation over the document?

21 MR. NASH: [Inaudible.]

22 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah. I told him what you all were  
23 saying while his screen was frozen.

24 MR. FOLIO: Sure, and we just discussed--

25 MR. NASH: --expressed the interest in seeing the



1 document.

2 MR. FOLIO: Sure. We just discussed internally on our  
3 side, and although we typically don't--it's not our practice  
4 to show witnesses documents that they did not otherwise have  
5 access to, I think just this recording, as part of our  
6 question from this, we'll show you all the documents so we  
7 can make sure we're--

8 MR. SCHRAM: Joe, can I ask you to specify whose  
9 practice you're referring to?

10 MR. FOLIO: In general, it's just good legal practice  
11 not to show witnesses documents they're not on, to maintain  
12 the integrity of the investigation.

13 MR. SCHRAM: It's good legal practice not to quote from  
14 the material and then ask a witness to answer questions  
15 without an opportunity to see it. And the practice that  
16 you're referring to is not the practice of the Homeland  
17 Security and Governmental Affairs Committee. It might be  
18 the ad hoc practice that you've developed in this joint  
19 investigation.

20 MR. FOLIO: I think you're speaking about a very  
21 different legal practice.

22 But in any case we will enter into the record Exhibit  
23 11. And again, the Bates Nos. end in 7524 through 7526.  
24 But we can only show the first page, the 7524, this copy  
25 now. Again, this is an email that Ms. Novelli is not privy

1 to in her work.

2 [Novelli Exhibit No. 11 was  
3 marked for identification.]

4 MR. SCHRAM: Sorry. So it's your view now that there  
5 was an email chain but that you'll only ask--you'll only  
6 show the witness a single part of that chain. So you're  
7 showing her part of a record?

8 MR. FOLIO: I'm just going to ask her a question. I  
9 will repeat my question, which is quoting from the first  
10 part of the record, I think for everyone to use in  
11 reference. So we'll put it up on the screen, even though I  
12 don't think it's good practice to do so. Zack, you are more  
13 than welcome to ask her about things on your time.

14 So again, this is an email from February 27, 2016. You  
15 were not copied on this email, but two questions ago, Ms.  
16 Novelli, I had asked whether or not you were aware that Blue  
17 Star had reached out about a week prior, on February 10,  
18 2016, to set up a meeting that you all spoke about, you and  
19 Ms. Tramontano spoke about, on February 18th. I believe  
20 your response was no, you were not.

21 And then my question was quoting from this email,  
22 which, again, was written by other State Department  
23 officials who had contact with Ms. Tramontano. And my  
24 question to you, Ms. Novelli, was whether or not you were  
25 aware that when Ms. Tramontano requested the meeting with

1 you, through other officials in your office, she did so by  
2 saying that she knows you from both her time in the  
3 government and industry, and she, Ms. Tramontano, requests a  
4 meeting, 30 minutes of your time, to ask for your personal  
5 thoughts on a client matter.

6 At the bottom she writes a parenthetical, to clarify,  
7 this is personal to Ms. Tramontano knowing you, Ms. Novelli,  
8 and is not/not a request to talk with subject matter  
9 experts. Again, our question to you, Ms. Novelli, is  
10 whether or not you were aware that Ms. Tramontano requested  
11 this meeting apparently for your personal thoughts on a  
12 client matter?

13 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. Sorry. She wrote me an email,  
14 and that's what I responded to. That's what I responded to.  
15 So she asked for my advice about something.

16 I would just add that "it is not a request to talk with  
17 subject matter experts" is--usually, when people would ask  
18 for a meeting, often people at a much lower level would say,  
19 "Well, I can talk to you about that." And a lot of times  
20 people did not want to talk to somebody at a lower level,  
21 for whatever reason. So I wouldn't read too much into that  
22 phrase.

23 MR. FOLIO: So your understanding of Ms. Tramontano's  
24 request not to talk with subject matter experts is that she  
25 would prefer just to chat with you, the Under Secretary,

1 directly rather than a lower level staff person?

2 MS. NOVELLI: That's how I would interpret this. I  
3 can't say because I'm not Ms. Tramontano. And I only know  
4 the email that she sent to me, and the email she sent to me  
5 said she wanted my advice about something.

6 MR. FOLIO: What's your understanding of her asking to  
7 speak with you and ask for your personal thoughts on a  
8 matter?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I don't think that's what she said in the  
10 email she sent to me.

11 MR. FOLIO: No, I think that's right, which is why I'm  
12 pointing to this email, which reflects a conversation she  
13 had with other members of your staff. And I'm trying to  
14 understand the difference between the more formal meetings  
15 that we looked at, such as when Blue Star was representing  
16 International Labour Organization President Guy Ryder and  
17 this, in which Ms. Tramontano at least is telling your staff  
18 that she wants your personal thoughts on a client matter.

19 MR. NASH: Hold on. So, Joe, could you restate your  
20 question, because I'm not sure that Ms. Novelli is in a  
21 position to answer your question if you're asking her  
22 opinion as to why someone did something else.

23 MR. FOLIO: Yeah. So I was observing a difference  
24 between the formal meetings, such as the one that Blue Star  
25 scheduled with Ms. Novelli about ILO, Guy Ryder, and

1 contrasting that with this instance, in which Ms. Tramontano  
2 asked her staff to meet with you to get your personal  
3 thoughts on a client matter. And so that this was personal  
4 to knowing you and is not a request to talk to subject  
5 matter.

6       So the question is, from your perspective, Ms. Novelli,  
7 Ms. Tramontano seems to be making some sort of distinction  
8 between official business and something where she just wants  
9 personal thoughts on a client matter. Is that a distinction  
10 that you understand?

11       MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. I just want to talk to Stuart for  
12 a moment. Thanks.

13       [Pause.]

14       MS. NOVELLI: Okay. So she sent me a request, which  
15 you saw, asking to talk to me, and I can only tell you that  
16 she wanted to talk to me in my official position as Under  
17 Secretary. As I explained before, I can't say what was in  
18 her mind. That's between her and whoever this was addressed  
19 to. But I would interpret this as--and this isn't unique to  
20 her, but not wanting to talk to a lower-level person about  
21 whatever the issue is. And that is not unique to her. That  
22 would happen a lot.

23       [Pause.]

24       MS. NOVELLI: Hello? Are you there?

25       MR. FOLIO: Sorry. I was on mute.

1 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. It was so quite I just wasn't sure  
2 if I lost you.

3 MR. FOLIO: So I understand your response that from  
4 your perspective you were meeting with her in your official  
5 capacity.

6 MS. NOVELLI: Correct.

7 MR. FOLIO: I understand your response that the last  
8 part of this email, where it says that it was not a request  
9 to talk with a subject matter expert was something that was  
10 not unusual, from your perspective.

11 But the part that I just want to follow up on is that  
12 when she said that she wanted to get your personal thoughts  
13 on a client matter, that just seems a bit different than  
14 having a sort of formal meeting with the president of the  
15 ILO, that she seems to be asking you for, again, personal  
16 thoughts.

17 MS. NOVELLI: I don't think that's what her request  
18 said. Could we go back to her actual written request?

19 MR. FOLIO: Yes, which we have marked as Exhibit 10,  
20 Bates 988.

21 MR. NASH: I'd just like to make an observation, Joe.  
22 Your last question was, "That seems to me different than,"  
23 and I don't know that that poses a question to Ms. Novelli,  
24 and I'm going to ask her not to comment on your opinion as  
25 to whether it seems different or not. If you want to pose a

1 specific question to her, she would be happy to answer to  
2 it.

3 MR. FOLIO: I think I just got cut off. I think that  
4 was the question I'd asked previously, is that I was making  
5 the observation that it seemed different, and I was asking  
6 is Ms. Novelli viewed those as different types of requests.  
7 Or is this just all the same--

8 MR. NASH: Her testimony was that she believed this  
9 request was to meet with her in her official capacity, just  
10 as other of Karen Tramontano's requests were while she was  
11 in that role.

12 MR. FOLIO: So from your perspective, Ms. Novelli, was  
13 there any difference between this request by Ms. Tramontano  
14 to meet with you and her previous requests, for example, the  
15 meeting with the ILO, Guy Ryder, or the meeting with the  
16 Open Society Foundation, on behalf of the Open Society  
17 Foundation?

18 MS. NOVELLI: No. No. This is just a request for a  
19 meeting in my official capacity, and it came through a  
20 formal channel at the State Department.

21 MR. FOLIO: From your perspective, did Ms. Tramontano  
22 reach out to you, generally speaking, because she had the  
23 personal connection with you?

24 MR. NASH: I'm not sure how she can answer that, from  
25 her personal perspective. That is a request for her to

1 comment on Karen's motivation.

2 MR. FOLIO: Stuart, I'm sorry. We're really having a  
3 hard time hearing you.

4 MR. NASH: I'm sorry. I have my microphone turned down  
5 to avoid reverb as much as possible. But you asked from  
6 Cathy's perspective was Karen motivated by a particular  
7 motivation, and I don't think she can answer that, and  
8 saying from Cathy's perspective, preceding the question with  
9 that clause I don't think makes it any more answerable.

10 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, were there other individuals  
11 with whom you had personal relationships outside of the  
12 State Department that would seek to meet with you regularly,  
13 in an official capacity?

14 MS. NOVELLI: There were other people that I knew that  
15 would ask for meetings in my official capacity on subject  
16 matter under my jurisdiction. I would not characterize  
17 Karen's requests for meetings as frequent. You're seeing a  
18 subset here of thousands of meetings. So I would not  
19 characterize her requests as frequent.

20 MR. FOLIO: So when Ms. Tramontano asks to come in so  
21 she can get your advice on a matter, have you received, or  
22 in your position as Under Secretary, did you receive similar  
23 requests from people you knew from outside the Department?

24 MS. NOVELLI: I can't pinpoint an exact request from  
25 somebody asking for my advice on a specific matter. But



1 certainly there were people that I knew--I have worked in  
2 Washington for 30 years. It's hard to like work in a vacuum  
3 and never meet with people you don't know. And so there  
4 would be people I would know who would ask to come in and  
5 meet on issues that were underneath my purview, and they  
6 were people I knew. So yes, there were people I knew who  
7 would ask to come in and meet with me.

8 MR. FOLIO: And would they do it in this way, when they  
9 would say, not just we happen to know each other, we happen  
10 to have a client who has an issue in your area of  
11 responsibility, but there's something that's happened here  
12 in a commercial setting. I believe the position is in error  
13 and I really want to ask your advice on the matter. Is that  
14 a type of request that you've dealt with regularly, as Under  
15 Secretary?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I certainly have dealt with requests for  
17 people to meet with me, to ask my advice, people who felt  
18 that we need to have a different policy. Certainly that was  
19 part of my job and that's what I did.

20 MR. FOLIO: Did you meet with Ms. Tramontano in  
21 response to this request?

22 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. According to my schedule I did.

23 MR. FOLIO: And what was the meeting about?

24 MS. NOVELLI: I don't have a detailed recollection of  
25 the meeting.

1 MR. FOLIO: And what is the recollection you have?

2 MS. NOVELLI: The recollection I have is that she was  
3 concerned about either a company or a person, a Ukrainian,  
4 who was--I don't know if they were under sanction, because  
5 we had some individuals under sanction. I just really don't  
6 remember the details. But essentially that the U.S.  
7 Government was looking askance at this company or this  
8 person, and she thought that that was not correct, that was  
9 not right.

10 MR. FOLIO: And what did she want you to do?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Honestly, I do not remember what her  
12 specific request was, and I don't--I have asked for and was  
13 not given access to the briefing memo or any subsequent  
14 memos of conversations so I can't really even try to refresh  
15 my memory.

16 MR. FOLIO: Other than this request, did you ever have  
17 any other meetings at State Department where someone was  
18 trying to discuss with you they thought was the U.S.  
19 Government's mistaken view about either an individual or a  
20 company?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember specific meetings.  
22 There certainly were meetings where people thought we should  
23 have a different policy than we had about things. That was  
24 not unusual.

25 MR. FOLIO: As opposed to a policy such as, you know,

1 like Open Society Foundation thought that the U.S.  
2 Government should give more money to Ukraine, specifically  
3 here it seems to be that they have taken a position in a  
4 commercial matter regarding a Ukrainian individual, that you  
5 said you thought was potentially sanctioned. So someone in  
6 that position, or a company in that position, that is on the  
7 wrong side of a U.S. sanction, did you ever take any  
8 meetings with people who wanted you to change, or the U.S.  
9 Government to change its perspective on that company or that  
10 person?

11 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember any specific meetings,  
12 but as I said, there were certainly companies or their  
13 representatives who would come in and say, "We think you  
14 need to be doing something different than you are doing."

15 MR. FOLIO: Will, will you please scroll to the top of  
16 this document, Bates No. 986? That first sentence says,  
17 "Under Secretary Novelli is going to meet with them next  
18 Monday at 2 p.m." This email is dated February 18, 2016, so  
19 Monday would be February 22, 2016.

20 Did you meet with them on February 22, 2016?

21 MS. NOVELLI: The only time I met with them was that  
22 one time, which I think was March 1, according to the  
23 schedule. I didn't have more than one meeting about this  
24 issue.

25 MR. FOLIO: Just one meeting. Okay. That's helpful.

1 We're trying to disaggregate.

2       So then turning to, I guess what we will introduce now  
3 as Exhibit 12.

4                               [Novelli Exhibit No. 12 was  
5                               marked for identification.]

6       MR. FOLIO: Tab 13. Scrolling down to the bottom of  
7 the second page.

8       So, Ms. Novelli, this is an email dated February 24th,  
9 2016. It's been made publicly available via FOIA. Chairman  
10 Johnson and Chairman Grassley quoted this matter in their  
11 November 6th, 2019, letter to the State Department.

12       I'd like to focus your attention on the substance of  
13 that email. If you have a chance to read it, please let us  
14 know when you're done.

15       [Pause.]

16       MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

17       MR. FOLIO: So this is about a week after the previous  
18 email exchange that we just reviewed, and the State  
19 Department official emailing with the subject line  
20 "Burisma," wrote, "Per our conversation, Chairman Tramontano  
21 of Blue Star Strategies requested a meeting to discuss with  
22 Under Secretary Novelli, U.S. Government remarks alleging  
23 Burisma," parenthetical, "(Ukrainian energy company)," end  
24 parenthetical, "of corruption. She noted that two high-  
25 profile U.S. citizens are affiliated with it, including

1 Hunter Biden as board member," end parenthetical.  
2 Tramontano would like to talk with Under Secretary Novelli  
3 about getting a better understanding of how the U.S. came to  
4 the determination that the company is corrupt. According to  
5 Tramontano, there is no evidence of corruption, has been no  
6 hearing or process, and evidence to the contrary has not  
7 been considered."

8 Ms. Novelli, were you aware that in requesting this  
9 meeting that Ms. Tramontano had mentioned that the company  
10 she's representing, Burisma, has two high-profile U.S.  
11 citizens affiliated with it, including Hunter Biden as a  
12 board member?

13 MS. NOVELLI: At the time, I was--I was not copied on  
14 this email. At the time the email came in, there was no  
15 mention of any people or any company or any anything when I  
16 said that I would have the meeting, and what is typical when  
17 a meeting is requested and I've agreed to it is that my  
18 staff then takes the ball from there and contacts whoever  
19 the appropriate people are in the State Department and says,  
20 "Under Secretary is having this meeting. We need to get  
21 talking points for her and a briefing paper." And that was  
22 typical for every meeting that I had.

23 So--and I was not privy--I was not privy to that whole  
24 apparatus of getting the talking points and briefing memo  
25 together for meetings that I had. That was something the

1 staff just did on their own, and I just saw the finished  
2 product.

3 MR. FOLIO: Why was it relevant that the company Blue  
4 Star represented had two high-profile U.S. citizens on its  
5 board, including Hunter Biden?

6 MS. NOVELLI: I didn't write that email, so I can't--I  
7 can't answer that.

8 MR. FOLIO: Do you think that--do you think that  
9 information was included for effect?

10 MS. NOVELLI: I really can't tell you. I didn't write  
11 that email. You would have to ask the author.

12 MR. FOLIO: The email is just a summary of what Ms.  
13 Tramontano was telling the author. In general, the U.S.--  
14 does the State Department view things differently when U.S.  
15 persons are involved when talking about foreign countries or  
16 foreign companies?

17 MS. NOVELLI: Do we view things differently? Not  
18 necessarily, no. It would depend--it would totally depend  
19 on what the issue was and what the subject was.

20 Sorry. I'm just going to have to move my table a  
21 little bit because the sun is right in my eyes. So just  
22 give me one second.

23 MR. FOLIO: Go ahead.

24 [Pause.]

25 MS. NOVELLI: I'm hoping I don't unplug myself.



1 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember him. I don't know him.  
2 I don't remember that he was there. I don't remember him.  
3 He's not someone I know.

4 MR. FOLIO: Did Ms. Tramontano explain to you why she  
5 thought the U.S. Government remarks about Burisma were in  
6 error?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember details of that meeting  
8 or that--you know, the conversation, if that occurred during  
9 that meeting. I do remember vaguely that she had some  
10 reason why she thought things were in error. I don't even  
11 remember what the reasons are.

12 MR. FOLIO: I think you said before that it was about a  
13 company or a person. Which was it? Was it a company or a  
14 person?

15 MS. NOVELLI: I don't even remember that. I just don't  
16 remember.

17 MR. FOLIO: During the meeting, did you commit to do or  
18 provide anything for Ms. Tramontano?

19 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember what I said that I  
20 would do or provide.

21 MR. FOLIO: Did Ms. Tramontano provide you with any  
22 materials during the meeting?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember.

24 MR. FOLIO: So as we saw in the previous exhibit, Ms.  
25 Tramontano wanted to discuss U.S. Government remarks



1 alleging that Burisma, a Ukrainian energy company, was  
2 corrupt. Were you aware of Ambassador Pyatt in the fall of  
3 2015 giving a speech in which he identified Burisma and  
4 specifically its owner, Mykola Zlochevsky, as being corrupt?

5 MS. NOVELLI: No.

6 MR. FOLIO: Prior to this meeting with Ms. Tramontano,  
7 were you aware of the company, Burisma?

8 MS. NOVELLI: No.

9 MR. FOLIO: Were you--prior to this meeting, were you  
10 aware of the company's owner, Mr. Zlochevsky?

11 MS. NOVELLI: No.

12 MR. FOLIO: Now having walked through these documents  
13 and discuss this, does it refresh your recollection that  
14 either Burisma or Mr. Zlochevsky were the subject matter of  
15 your meeting with Ms. Tramontano?

16 MS. NOVELLI: As I said, I don't remember anything  
17 about Mr., whatever, Zlochevsky.

18 I do remember vaguely something to do with Burisma, but  
19 I really do not have specific memory of this meeting. It  
20 just--

21 MR. FOLIO: After the meeting, did you learn any  
22 additional information while you were Under Secretary? So  
23 between this meeting and your time concluding as Under  
24 Secretary, did you learn any additional information about  
25 Burisma?

1 MS. NOVELLI: I had a conversation with Ambassador  
2 Pyatt after this meeting, and I do not remember if it was in  
3 person or on the phone. I just know that I had a  
4 conversation with Ambassador Pyatt and said that Karen had  
5 come in complaining. I don't even remember the specifics,  
6 just that she had come in complaining and asked him, you  
7 know, "Hey, this happened. What do you think?" And again,  
8 this is not quoting verbatim because I do not have a  
9 detailed memory, but basically, he said, "She is not  
10 correct. This is being handled. We're"--you know, "We're  
11 doing the right thing. What we need to do"--and I said,  
12 "Fine." And that was the end of it.

13 MR. FOLIO: Was this soon after your meeting with Ms.  
14 Tramontano?

15 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know what you mean by soon, but--

16 MR. FOLIO: Relatively close in time. I don't want to  
17 pion you--

18 MS. NOVELLI: Relatively close in time? I don't know.  
19 You know, again, I don't know, remember if it was on the  
20 phone or in person because when he would come back to D.C.,  
21 you know, for consultations or visits, I usually would--he  
22 would stop in, and so I just don't remember the context of  
23 it. But I did ask him about it. He said that she was not  
24 correct, that the thing was being handled, and that was the  
25 end of it.

1 MR. FOLIO: So you mentioned before that there was a  
2 briefing memo. Are you saying do you recall that there was  
3 a briefing memo leading up to the meeting with Ms.  
4 Tramontano?

5 MS. NOVELLI: I assume there was a briefing memo  
6 because there were briefing memos for every meeting that I  
7 did in my official capacity. So I assumed that there was,  
8 and we asked the State Department for it when we didn't see  
9 it. And we have not received it.

10 MR. FOLIO: Sorry. Double back to your conversation  
11 with Ambassador Pyatt. Why did you--why did you go to  
12 Ambassador Pyatt?

13 MS. NOVELLI: Because he was the person responsible for  
14 Ukraine, and so I was following--I mean, Karen came in.  
15 Whatever specifics she said related to what was happening in  
16 Ukraine. So that's why I asked Geoff Pyatt, you know,  
17 what's going on with this. He told me, and I was like,  
18 "Okay." End of story.

19 MR. FOLIO: Did you speak with anyone else about this  
20 meeting other than Ambassador Pyatt?

21 MS. NOVELLI: Whomever was present taking notes from  
22 the meeting. I mean, they took notes. We went on to the  
23 next meeting, but no. I only talked to Geoff about it, and  
24 when he told me it was being handled, then that was fine  
25 with me. I mean, it was being handled. It was being

1 handled appropriately. What we were doing was appropriate.

2 I went on to all the other things that I was working on.

3 MR. FOLIO: Why did you not raise the meeting with

4 Victoria Nuland?

5 MS. NOVELLI: I can't tell you.

6 MR. FOLIO: How about why did you not raise the meeting

7 with George Kent?

8 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know. I talked to Geoff. He

9 said he was being handled. There's really no reason to

10 raise it if--I mean, as soon as I knew that it was being

11 handled, I didn't really need to take any further action or

12 any other steps.

13 MR. FOLIO: So one of the previous Blue Star instances

14 we looked at, there was someone from your staff who created

15 notes of the meeting or a readout, and it was emailed around

16 to, among other people, Ambassador Pyatt, Ambassador Bridget

17 Brink, and George Kent. We don't have such a readout for

18 this one. That's not to say it doesn't necessarily exist,

19 but if one did exist, presumably, it would have gone to the

20 same people. Why did you feel the need to raise this issue

21 directly with Ambassador Pyatt as opposed to just relying on

22 the normal course of readout he would have received?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I just don't have a good recollection.

24 Like I said, I could have been talking to Ambassador Pyatt

25 about something else and raised this. I don't remember the

1 context of my conversation with him, but I had a  
2 conversation with him when I sort of said this has happened  
3 and--or this has been said. And he said, "There's nothing  
4 to this. You know, she's not correct," and that was the end  
5 of it.

6 So I don't--I don't know if I called him or he called  
7 me about something else. I just--I just really don't  
8 remember the details.

9 MR. FOLIO: When Ambassador Pyatt said that Ms.  
10 Tramontano was not correct, not correct about what?

11 MS. NOVELLI: That whatever we were doing that she was  
12 unhappy about was in error.

13 MR. FOLIO: You said that Ambassador Pyatt also said  
14 that it was being handled. What did that mean, that it was  
15 being handled?

16 MS. NOVELLI: As I--I just want to be clear. This is  
17 not a direct quote.

18 MR. FOLIO: Sure.

19 MS. NOVELLI: I'm just giving you the gist, right, that  
20 this is that people were on top of this issue, and the way  
21 that I worked, if other people were on top of something,  
22 responsible people, I didn't need to pile on. I had other  
23 stuff that I was spending my time on.

24 MR. FOLIO: Were you made aware by Ambassador Pyatt  
25 that Burisma and its owner, Mr. Zlochevsky, had corruption

1 problems?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Again, I don't remember the details of my  
3 conversation with Geoff Pyatt, but--so I don't remember the  
4 details, but obviously, if he said there is--this is--she's  
5 not correct and what we're doing is correct, I'm sure he  
6 said something that would--you know, why that's the case. I  
7 didn't--as I said, I didn't really spend a lot of time on  
8 this because other people were working on it, and they were  
9 taking care of it. So I went off to do other things.

10 MR. FOLIO: Were you aware that Ms. Tramontano, Blue  
11 Star in general, to include Ms. Painter, were reaching out  
12 to George Kent about this same issue?

13 MS. NOVELLI: No. I did not know that.

14 MR. FOLIO: Were you aware that in the course of Ms.  
15 Painter's and Ms. Tramontano's conversations with George  
16 Kent about this issue that they told him that if--they  
17 basically--I use the word lightly, but I'd say threatened,  
18 but told him that they would go to the Under Secretary?

19 MS. NOVELLI: I had no idea.

20 MR. SCHRAM: Joe, are you characterizing a  
21 communication that's not an exhibit?

22 MR. FOLIO: No. I'm quoting, which is what I asked you  
23 to do.

24 MR. SCHRAM: I'm sorry. You said "threatened" or "go  
25 to"? Is that a quote or not? Because you changed the

1 wording. If you have a quote, can you put it up?

2 MR. FOLIO: Well, you didn't, so I'm not going to. And  
3 again, it's a document she's not on.

4 So, Ms. Novelli--

5 MR. GOSHORN: Joe, actually, you guys are over your  
6 time. It seems like a good opportunity to take a break.

7 MR. FOLIO: Let me check--

8 MR. SCHRAM: Just before--

9 MR. FOLIO: We are winding down on this exhibit. So we  
10 can finish up, I think, pretty quickly, and then we can take  
11 a break, if that's all right.

12 MR. SCHRAM: I just want to be clear. You're  
13 characterizing the contents of a communication that we are  
14 not showing us or the witness, and you've now changed the  
15 characterization over the course of offering it. So if you  
16 could just either put a document in evidence and quote from  
17 it or ask the question again so that we can understand what  
18 your characterization is.

19 MR. FOLIO: Well, I'm not going to do that because it's  
20 not a document she's copied on. You're conflating my  
21 objection to your characterization of Chairman Johnson, a  
22 non-witness in this investigation, was saying.

23 My question simply to Ms. Novelli--and I think she  
24 answered it, but just to be clear.

25 Ms. Novelli, it's whether or not you were aware that in

1 the course of discussing--

2 [Telephone rings.]

3 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry.

4 MR. FOLIO: No problem.

5 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry about that. Go ahead.

6 MR. FOLIO: Whether you were aware that in the course  
7 of Ms. Sally Painter from Blue Star Strategies discussing  
8 this matter with George Kent that they said that if they  
9 didn't get an adequate response from him, they would go to  
10 the, quote/unquote, "Under Secretary."

11 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. No. I was not aware.

12 MR. FOLIO: Is there any chance that this meeting was  
13 not treated like a normal meeting and that other people did  
14 not participate, such that, for example, call notes were  
15 generated or--sorry--a meeting summary was generated?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know why that would be.

17 MR. FOLIO: In your experience as Under Secretary, were  
18 there ever meetings where someone would say something that  
19 they--along the lines of wanting to meet with you in a  
20 personal capacity or on a personal issue, and you wouldn't  
21 have staff there to generate meeting summary notes?

22 MS. NOVELLI: If I was meeting in my official capacity,  
23 which this was a meeting in my official capacity, there was  
24 somebody there taking notes.

25 MR. FOLIO: So you would expect for this meeting with



1 Ms. Tramontano about Burisma--you would expect there to have  
2 been some product of notes, however?

3 MS. NOVELLI: I would have expected that, yes.

4 I will say that some staff were better about taking  
5 notes than others. So, you know--but generally speaking,  
6 there would be somebody there taking notes.

7 MR. FOLIO: This was a meeting that Ms. Tramontano  
8 requested to have with you a few different ways, but  
9 ultimately, that day it was about a company that she  
10 represented, that the U.S. Government believed was corrupt,  
11 and Ms. Tramontano thought that belief was in error.

12 Was there any State Department policy or other  
13 considerations that you made about when choosing to take  
14 meetings with representatives of people? For example, if it  
15 was a corrupt company wanting to meet with you, was there an  
16 analysis or a regulation that you followed to determine  
17 whether you should or should not take that meeting?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I'm sorry. I'm just trying to--I'm  
19 sorry. Was there a policy about whether to take meetings or  
20 not take meetings? Is that the question?

21 MR. FOLIO: Yeah, especially in a situation in which,  
22 you know, for example, a representative of a company who has  
23 legal issues, whether with the United States or a foreign  
24 country where it resides. Is there any analysis that you  
25 would do either because of policy or anything else that you

1 would--an analysis that you would perform before you decided  
2 whether or not to take the meeting?

3 MS. NOVELLI: Well, with respect to this meeting, there  
4 was nothing--the request was very general. So there was  
5 nothing--there was nothing--nothing for me to do an analysis  
6 of.

7 MR. FOLIO: I think this is a good spot for us to  
8 transition to the Minority.

9 Ms. Novelli, would you like to take a break before we  
10 do that?

11 MS. NOVELLI: Yes, please. Thank you.

12 MR. FOLIO: Ten minutes?

13 MR. NASH: I'd just like to interject here.

14 I do have a hard stop at 3:30. I'm hoping that we'll  
15 be winding up, but it's still an hour and 20 minutes from  
16 now. We can take a very short break now, but I'm going to  
17 have to end this at 3:30 because I have another obligation.

18 MR. FOLIO: All right. Stuart, I understand that you  
19 have a hard stop at 3:30. We're going to use our 10 minutes  
20 here to regroup, but I think we are, at least from our side,  
21 winding things down.

22 MR. NASH: Great. Thank you.

23 MR. FOLIO: All right. Does 2:20 work for you, Zack  
24 and Dave?

25 MR. SCHRAM: Yes.

1 MR. FOLIO: Okay. We'll see you all at 2:20.

2 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

3 [Recess.]

4 MR. SCHRAM: Ms. Novelli, thank you again for your time  
5 and for your patience.

6 Why do you meet with lobbyists?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I meet with people who represent issues,  
8 and that is--lobbyists are one of those groups of people.  
9 They represent companies whose interests are, or sometimes  
10 countries, you know, whose interests intersect with those of  
11 the United States.

12 MR. SCHRAM: In your role as Under Secretary, how often  
13 did you meet with lobbyists?

14 MS. NOVELLI: Well, if you mean by "lobbyists" people  
15 who did government affairs for their companies as well as  
16 people at firms, I would say relatively frequently. Maybe  
17 not every day but certainly every week.

18 MR. SCHRAM: Is there something nefarious about the  
19 fact that you would frequently take meetings with government  
20 affairs officials, of countries or companies?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I never thought so.

22 MR. SCHRAM: Until it became the subject of the  
23 Chairmen's investigation, did your meeting with Ms.  
24 Tramontano, with respect to Burisma, did it stand out in  
25 your mind?

1 MS. NOVELLI: No.

2 MR. SCHRAM: Why not?

3 MS. NOVELLI: It was one of thousands of meetings that  
4 I had, and we were just discussing offline that when you  
5 have that many meetings you just can't keep all those things  
6 in your brain. It would explode.

7 MR. SCHRAM: Did your meeting with Ms. Tramontano  
8 influence matters at the State Department in a manner that  
9 impacted U.S. foreign policy towards Ukraine?

10 MS. NOVELLI: No.

11 MR. SCHRAM: Did Hunter Biden's position on the board  
12 of Burisma influence matters at the State Department in any  
13 way?

14 MS. NOVELLI: It did not influence anything with  
15 respect to this meeting or my conversation with Ambassador  
16 Pyatt.

17 MR. SCHRAM: Did Hunter Biden's position on the board  
18 of Burisma provide Burisma representatives, or provide Blue  
19 Star Strategies special access to you?

20 MS. NOVELLI: I agreed to the meeting, as you saw,  
21 without knowing what it was about, what company, or anything  
22 of the sort. So the meeting was agreed to be held without  
23 any mention of Hunter Biden.

24 MR. SCHRAM: So then to the question did his position  
25 on the board of Burisma provide its representatives, or Blue

1 Star special access to you, the answer is--

2 MS. NOVELLI: No.

3 MR. SCHRAM: Did Hunter Biden's position on the board  
4 of Burisma provide Mr. Zlochevsky with special access to  
5 you?

6 MS. NOVELLI: No.

7 MR. SCHRAM: As far as you know, did it provide him  
8 with special access to any other U.S. official?

9 MS. NOVELLI: I have no knowledge of that.

10 MR. SCHRAM: The majority has now spent more time  
11 asking you questions about your meeting with Ms. Tramontano  
12 than you spent in that meeting, or subsequently thinking  
13 about it. In the majority theory of events, that meeting  
14 was the key moment in the maneuvering of U.S. policy to  
15 serve Hunter Biden's interest. Is that what happened?

16 MS. NOVELLI: In the meeting there was not--I certainly  
17 didn't take any action in the meeting to serve Hunter  
18 Biden's interest.

19 MR. FOLIO: Zack, again, I ask you to refrain from  
20 characterizing our investigation. You can talk about the  
21 facts and documents all you want, but please stop referring  
22 to our investigation unless you're doing direct quotes.

23 MR. SCHRAM: I think my characterization was an  
24 accurate summary of how you have spent today.

25 MR. FOLIO: Based on--

1 MR. SCHRAM: And the record can speak for itself.

2 MR. FOLIO: I agree that the record should speak for  
3 itself. We will speak for ourselves and we ask that you  
4 speak for yourself.

5 MR. SCHRAM: Again, Ms. Novelli, was your meeting with  
6 Ms. Tramontano a key moment in the maneuvering of U.S.  
7 policy to serve Hunter Biden's interest?

8 MR. NASH: I'm not sure Ms. Novelli understands that  
9 question. If you want to rephrase it, Zack, she would be  
10 happy to try to answer it.

11 MR. SCHRAM: As a result of that meeting, did you take  
12 any action to serve Hunter Biden's interest?

13 MS. NOVELLI: No.

14 MR. SCHRAM: That's all. Dan, did you have anything?

15 MR. GOSHORN: Nothing further. Thank you for your  
16 time, Ms. Novelli.

17 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, I'm going to turn it over to  
18 my colleague, Scott Wittmann.

19 MR. WITTMANN: Hi, Ms. Novelli. Thank you for your  
20 time today. I just want to go back to comments that you  
21 made towards the beginning of the interview today, regarding  
22 your preparation for the March 2016 meeting with Ms.  
23 Tramontano. I believe you mentioned earlier that the first  
24 time that you were made aware Hunter Biden was on the board  
25 of Burisma was in March of 2016, and I think you said it was

1 part of the preparation for this meeting. Could you talk  
2 about that again and when you first found out about Hunter  
3 Biden being on Burisma's board?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember the exact moment when I  
5 found out about that, so I don't know what I can really add.  
6 I knew about it in the meeting, but I really can't--I just  
7 don't have any memory of precisely when, before March 1, you  
8 know, between the meeting request and between the time that  
9 people knew what the meeting was about and March 1, I would  
10 have been made aware.

11 What I can say is that typically, because I had so many  
12 meetings, one after the other, day after day after day, I  
13 didn't really focus on meetings I was going to have until  
14 either the night before or sometimes like the five minutes  
15 before I was going to have the meeting, because there was  
16 just too much to digest.

17 MR. WITTMANN: Sure. So is it fair to say that you  
18 found out about Hunter Biden's board membership as part of  
19 the preparation for this meeting?

20 MS. NOVELLI: Well, it depends on what "preparation"  
21 means. You know, if it means somebody handed me a briefing  
22 paper and I read it, you know, I just don't remember  
23 precisely, you know, whether it was in the briefing paper or  
24 I found out in the meeting itself. I don't remember.

25 MR. WITTMANN: So just to be clear, it was either--I

1 could have been part of preparation but it also could have  
2 been brought up in the meeting?

3 MS. NOVELLI: Honestly, I just don't remember. I'm  
4 sorry. I don't remember.

5 MR. WITTMANN: Okay. I want to turn to the next  
6 exhibit that we're going to enter in. I believe it's  
7 Exhibit 14, Tab 16.

8 [Novelli Exhibit No. 14 was  
9 marked for identification.]

10 MR. WITTMANN: Ms. Novelli, this is a copy of a  
11 schedule dated September 29, 2016.

12 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. I can only see the blank page.

13 MR. WITTMANN: I'm sorry. We'll scroll down.

14 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

15 MR. WITTMANN: And, Will, can you keep scrolling down  
16 to the next page? On the next page there is a meeting  
17 listed there with Karen Tramontano and Sharon Waxman, the  
18 President and CEO of the Fair Labor Association.

19 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

20 MR. WITTMANN: Do you remember if this meeting occurred  
21 on September 29, 2016?

22 MS. NOVELLI: I remember that the meeting occurred. I  
23 don't remember details of it, and I don't--I mean, that the  
24 schedule says it occurred on this date.

25 MR. WITTMANN: Do you remember if anyone else attended



1 this meeting besides the people listed and yourself?

2 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember, but it would be typical  
3 because that's a--you know, for somebody else to have  
4 attended that meeting. I don't know who that would have  
5 been.

6 MR. WITTMANN: And would that have been the notetaker?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Yeah, somebody on my staff.

8 MR. WITTMANN: Okay. I want to move on to what we'll  
9 enter in as Exhibit 15.

10 [Novelli Exhibit No. 15 was  
11 marked for identification.]

12 MR. WITTMANN: Ms. Novelli--Will, scroll down--this is  
13 a schedule, your schedule dated October 13, 2016, and on  
14 this schedule there is a listed meeting with Karen  
15 Tramontano at a specific address. Do you remember if this  
16 meeting occurred with Ms. Tramontano on October 13, 2016?

17 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember specifically. You  
18 know, I don't remember a specific meeting at that date. I  
19 just don't remember dates.

20 MR. WITTMANN: Okay. In this general time frame of  
21 early to mid-October, do you remember any meeting with Ms.  
22 Tramontano?

23 MS. NOVELLI: I remember a meeting with Karen not in my  
24 office, a personal meeting, to ask--I was meeting with other  
25 people because the administration was ending, to ask about

1 corporate boards. And I was interested in that and just  
2 wondered if she had any thoughts about it.

3 MR. WITTMANN: And where did that meeting occur?

4 MS. NOVELLI: Probably at that address. I mean, that  
5 was a meeting in her office.

6 MR. WITTMANN: So that address is Blue Star's office?

7 MS. NOVELLI: I don't know. I don't know their  
8 address, but I remember a meeting not in my office, and it  
9 was a personal meeting, just to ask for her advice. And I  
10 asked for lots of people's advice, not just her.

11 MR. WITTMANN: Did anyone else attend this particular  
12 meeting that you mentioned?

13 MS. NOVELLI: Certainly nobody from my staff would be  
14 attending a meeting like that.

15 MR. WITTMANN: Okay. I want to move on to what we will  
16 enter in as Exhibit 16.

17 [Novelli Exhibit No. 16 was  
18 marked for identification.]

19 MR. WITTMANN: And this exhibit contains an attachment  
20 that we're happy to scroll through, Ms. Novelli. But my  
21 question is only on the email that's on the very first page.  
22 But please let us know if you'd like us to scroll through  
23 the attachment as well.

24 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. Sure. Can you scroll through the  
25 attachment?

1 MR. WITTMANN: Yes.

2 MR. GOSHORN: Scott, what's the Bates on this?

3 MR. WITTMANN: Sure. It is ending in 2083.

4 MR. GOSHORN: Okay. Thank you.

5 MR. WITTMANN: Sure.

6 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

7 [Pause.]

8 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

9 [Pause.]

10 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

11 [Pause.]

12 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

13 [Pause.]

14 MR. WITTMANN: So I think that's the end of the  
15 document, but I want to go back to the first page, where you  
16 can see the email from Ms. Tramontano to you on October 21,  
17 2016. Ms. Tramontano wrote, "Based on our discussion about  
18 Ukraine, attached is a two-pager outlining the work we did  
19 in Cambodia."

20 What was Ms. Tramontano referring to regarding the  
21 discussion about Ukraine?

22 MS. NOVELLI: I don't have a specific recollection of  
23 that, but I do know that at that time we were meeting with a  
24 number of Ukrainian officials to talk to them about how to  
25 take their economy forward and how to look at questions of

1 making themselves more appealing for foreign investment.  
2 Again, this was part of stabilizing their economy.  
3 Secretary Pritzger took many trips where she would bring  
4 businesses to Ukraine, trying to get them interested. And  
5 so I am presuming that that is what we were talking about.  
6 Based on the attachment that she gave, it would fit in with  
7 what we were doing.

8 MR. GOSHORN: Scott, I'm sorry to interrupt, but there  
9 is another document in the record, a reply to this email,  
10 that is a response from Karen to Ms. Novelli, and it says,  
11 "Should have said based on our discussions about Pakistan.  
12 Sorry about that. Too many balls in the air."

13 So I think the reference to Ukraine in this document is  
14 an error. I can forward you this follow-up email if you  
15 want to put it in the record.

16 MS. NOVELLI: That actually would make a lot of sense,  
17 because we were having actual discussions with the  
18 Pakistanis, who were looking at trying to do more textiles,  
19 and the Cambodia document is about textiles. So that would  
20 make a lot of sense.

21 MR. WITTMANN: Thank you, Dan. If you wouldn't mind  
22 forwarding that. And, Dan, does that document contain the  
23 attachment?

24 MR. GOSHORN: No, but it starts--it has everything--it  
25 starts with the email that's on the bottom of the screen

1 right now, "Based on our discussion." I'll send it to you  
2 right now.

3 MR. WITTMANN: Okay. Thank you.

4 So, Ms. Novelli, just so we can be clear on the record,  
5 and we can wait for Dan to send us the updated one. But  
6 your understanding is that Ms. Tramontano was referring to a  
7 discussion about Pakistan and not Ukraine?

8 MS. NOVELLI: I would--again, I don't remember this  
9 specific discussion. We were talking to Pakistan at that  
10 time about how to look at their gray economy and how to look  
11 at their textile sector, because Pakistan's economy was in a  
12 terrible situation and we were very worried about Pakistan,  
13 because of its strategic position.

14 MR. WITTMANN: I understand. Thank you, and thank you,  
15 Dan.

16 I am curious about what you did say regarding meetings  
17 with Ukrainian officials at this time. Could you expand on  
18 that? What Ukrainian officials were you talking to?

19 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember the exact date of these  
20 meetings, but we did gather the Ukrainian Finance Minister,  
21 the Ukrainian Minister of the Economy, and a couple of other  
22 Ukrainian officials who were trying to help the economy of  
23 Ukraine. And we had some folks from other agencies, and we  
24 talked to them about things that they were doing. And not  
25 remembering any of this specifically, that's the only thing

1 I can think of that would be relevant. But it seems that,  
2 in any case, it was an error and it was about Pakistan,  
3 which makes a lot more sense, given what was going on with  
4 Pakistan at the time.

5 MR. WITTMANN: Understood, and thank you for that  
6 clarification.

7 I want to turn it over now to my colleague, Josh.

8 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Thanks, Scott. Will can you pull up  
9 Tab 20? I guess it's Exhibit 17 at this point.

10 [Novelli Exhibit No. 17 was  
11 marked for identification.]

12 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Yes, it's correct.

13 And scroll down for Ms. Novelli.

14 Ms. Novelli, please let me know when you've reviewed.

15 MS. NOVELLI: Yep.

16 [Pause.]

17 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

18 [Pause.]

19 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. I've reviewed.

20 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Ms. Novelli, have you reviewed?

21 MS. NOVELLI: Yes, yes. I'm sorry. Can you hear me  
22 okay?

23 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: I think you might be muted. You  
24 can't--

25 MS. NOVELLI: I'm not muted.

1 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Okay.

2 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry. Can you hear me? Hello?

3 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Can you hear me okay?

4 MS. NOVELLI: I can hear you, but it seems like you  
5 can't hear me. Can you hear me?

6 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: I can hear you now. Thank you.

7 MS. NOVELLI: Oh, okay. Sorry. I don't know what  
8 happened, but yes, I've reviewed.

9 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So on March 30th, 2016, Ambassador  
10 Pyatt applied to an email chain regarding Ms. Tramontano  
11 writing to Dennis McDonough requesting a meeting between him  
12 and Boris Lozhkin. Ambassador Pyatt wrote, quote, "So I see  
13 below, Ukraine hired a new lobbyist, same firm that saw  
14 Kathy Novelli, complaining about my pressure on the PGO's  
15 coverup of the case against the disgraced Yanukovich-era  
16 Environment Minister."

17 Why did you complain about Pyatt's pressure on the PGO  
18 coverup?

19 MS. NOVELLI: Okay. That is not what the email says.  
20 The email says that Karen Tramontano complained to me about  
21 hit.

22 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Stand by. Are you there?

23 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

24 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Can you repeat that one more time?  
25 I'm sorry.

1 MS. NOVELLI: The email, if you want to scroll back up  
2 to it, says that the firm saw me, complaining--the firm was  
3 complaining about Ambassador Pyatt's pressure, not that I  
4 complained. I did not complain.

5 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: To what extent were you made aware of  
6 Blue Star Strategies' reaction to Ambassador Pyatt's  
7 pressure on the PGO coverup?

8 MS. NOVELLI: As I explained, I wasn't really involved  
9 in these issues. Karen came to see me. I didn't even know  
10 what PGO stands for, and she was saying the U.S. Government  
11 was in error. I talked to Ambassador Pyatt. He said they  
12 weren't--we were not in error, and that Karen was incorrect.  
13 And that was the end of the matter.

14 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And Blue Star specifically raised  
15 concerns to you about Ambassador Pyatt's position?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember the details of that  
17 meeting.

18 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Did Blue Star Strategies' officials  
19 ever raise concerns to you about other State Department  
20 employees taking positions that affected their work?

21 MS. NOVELLI: As I said, I don't remember the details  
22 of that meeting. I don't know who they talked about. I  
23 don't remember.

24 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So the extent of your conversation  
25 with Ambassador Pyatt, it was a quick discussion after the



1 meeting with Tramontano, and your recollection is what  
2 exactly? That they complained about the government's  
3 position at that time, and Pyatt basically said what exactly  
4 with respect to Tramontano's position?

5 MS. NOVELLI: As I think I already answered this  
6 question, Ambassador Pyatt said Karen was incorrect, that  
7 the U.S. Government was doing what it needed to do, and  
8 that--and the matter was being handled. And I said okay,  
9 and that was the end of it. I do not remember the details  
10 of that conversation. I don't remember whether the  
11 conversation was only about that or other issues. I don't  
12 remember. I don't remember. I just--

13 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: So after your interaction with  
14 Ambassador Pyatt, did you circle back to Karen Tramontano?

15 MS. NOVELLI: I do not remember circling back to her.

16 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: And your meeting, your exchange with  
17 Ambassador Pyatt, based on this email from March 30th, 2016,  
18 it's fair to say that they were in fact--Blue Star  
19 Strategies was in fact complaining about Pyatt's pressure on  
20 the PGO's coverup. Is that an accurate representation?

21 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember. I'm sorry.

22 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Okay. Thank you.

23 Scott, Brian, or Joe? I don't know who's next.

24 MR. DOWNEY: Hi, Ms. Novelli.

25 So we're going to move up on the timeline to January of

1 2017, and as a table setter, by around January 12, 2017,  
2 Burisma announced that any investigations into Mr.  
3 Zlochevsky or the company had been--those had ended.

4 According to a January 18, 2017, communication, a Blue  
5 Star Strategies employee and an individual at the State  
6 Department discussed you and Ms. Tramontano spoke by phone.  
7 Do you remember speaking to Ms. Tramontano in January 2017?

8 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember the date of speaking to  
9 Karen. There are certainly emails between my administrative  
10 assistant and hers trying to find a time for us to talk.

11 MR. DOWNEY: Why did Ms. Tramontano want to speak to  
12 you in January of 2017?

13 MS. NOVELLI: I don't have a specific recollection of  
14 it other than she had a client who might have been  
15 interested in having somebody on their board.

16 If you recall the date of that, it was the very end of  
17 the administration. The administration was ending, like,  
18 within a couple weeks after that, and she was going to put  
19 me in touch with that person.

20 MR. DOWNEY: Did the topic of Burisma come up on that  
21 phone call?

22 MS. NOVELLI: I am quite certain it did not.

23 MR. DOWNEY: Did you discuss with Karen Tramontano or  
24 Sally Painter or other people in the State Department about  
25 the case, the Ukrainian case against Zlochevsky and Burisma

1 being ended in January of 2017?

2 MS. NOVELLI: No.

3 MR. DOWNEY: Thank you.

4 MR. WITTMANN: Hi, Ms. Novelli. I wanted to introduce  
5 in the record the document that the Minority referenced, and  
6 I just wanted to have that in the record, just so we're  
7 clear and also give you the opportunity to see the email for  
8 yourself. So we'll do that right now, and we'll enter it in  
9 as Exhibit 17.

10 MS. NOVELLI: Thank you. This is the Pakistan thing?

11 MR. WITTMANN: Correct.

12 MS. NOVELLI: Thank you.

13 MR. WITTMANN: I'm sorry. Exhibit 18.

14 [Novelli Exhibit No. 18 was  
15 marked for identification.]

16 MS. NOVELLI: Thank you.

17 MR. WITTMANN: Yeah, absolutely.

18 SO just rounding out this conversation, the reference  
19 is clearly--in this email, it says it was discussions about  
20 Pakistan. Do you remember when those--you had discussions  
21 about Pakistan with Ms. Tramontano?

22 MS. NOVELLI: No, I'm sorry. I do not.

23 MR. WITTMANN: We talked earlier about a meeting that  
24 was on your schedule on October 13, 2016, with Ms.  
25 Tramontano. Do you remember if in that meeting, you had

1 discussions about Pakistan?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Honestly, I just do not remember. I  
3 don't remember the substance.

4 MR. WITTMANN: Would there be instances of meetings or  
5 phone calls with Ms. Tramontano that would not appear on  
6 your schedule?

7 MS. NOVELLI: Not during, like, my working hours,  
8 certainly, and I don't remember meeting her outside of my  
9 working hours when I was Under Secretary.

10 MR. WITTMANN: Okay. Thank you.

11 I'm going to turn it back over to--

12 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Ms. Novelli, can you hear me okay?

13 MS. NOVELLI: Yes, yes.

14 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Great. Thank you.

15 A quick follow-up on our earlier exchange regarding  
16 your interactions with banks. So I'm just curious. In your  
17 position as Under Secretary, did you ever come into contact  
18 with the Financial Crimes Enforcement Network, FinCEN?

19 MS. NOVELLI: I don't remember that, no.

20 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Do you know what that is? Do you  
21 know what FinCEN is?

22 MS. NOVELLI: You would have to--you would have to  
23 enlighten me.

24 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Well, in regards to your interactions  
25 with Treasury, I believe you said earlier in the interview

1 process, that's--during some of the interagency meetings,  
2 Treasury was a partner in those meetings. Do you recall  
3 that?

4 MS. NOVELLI: Treasury attended interagency meetings,  
5 yes.

6 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Right. So FinCEN, Financial Crimes  
7 Enforcement Network, tracks suspicious financial  
8 transactions, which you and I discussed earlier today. So  
9 it's curious if in your interactions with the banks with  
10 respect to Russia or Ukraine and you said, I believe, that  
11 they tried to get a--I think your term was "scene of the  
12 people in Russia," I'm trying to figure out whether or not  
13 you had any communications with FinCEN during the course of  
14 your communications with the banks.

15 MS. NOVELLI: No.

16 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Did anyone below you have  
17 communications with FinCEN?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I have no idea.

19 MR. FLYNN-BROWN: Okay. Thank you for your time today.  
20 I appreciate it.

21 MS. NOVELLI: Sure.

22 [Pause.]

23 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, just adjusting all my  
24 microphones.

25 All right. So just a few more questions for you, Ms.



1 emailed Karen Tramontano at her Blue Star Strategies email  
2 address and said, "Hi, Karen. Just forwarding you an  
3 updated bio in case it's useful. My fingers are crossed for  
4 tomorrow. Thanks a million for all of your help. Best,  
5 Kathy."

6 Why were you forwarding Ms. Tramontano an updated bio?

7 [No response.]

8 MR. FOLIO: I think you're muted, Ms. Novelli.

9 MS. NOVELLI: Sorry.

10 As I explained, she--I was looking to see what I could  
11 do at the end--after the administration was over. One of  
12 the things that I was considering was going on corporate  
13 boards, and Karen had a client who was interested in  
14 expanding internationally and was interested in possibly  
15 talking to me about what his board was about.

16 MR. FOLIO: So this was about a possible employment  
17 opportunity after your work at the Department?

18 MS. NOVELLI: I guess you could call it that. It was  
19 being on a board of directors.

20 MR. FOLIO: Is there any other way to describe it?

21 MS. NOVELLI: No. I guess not.

22 MR. FOLIO: I'd actually like to turn to a document  
23 we'll mark as Exhibit 20. So this is your Bates No. CN0003,  
24 and it's an email exchange between you and Ms. Tramontano on  
25 December 2nd, 2019, subject line, "Looking Forward to

1 Lunch," and you write, "See you soon at Equinox." Ms.

2 Tramontano responds, "Ditto."

3 [Novelli Exhibit No. 20 was  
4 marked for identification.]

5 MR. FOLIO: And then we'll introduce the next document  
6 as Exhibit 21. It's a longer email exchange, and at the top,  
7 you write, "Ms. Tramontano, wonderful to see you yesterday."

8 [Novelli Exhibit No. 21 was  
9 marked for identification.]

10 MR. FOLIO: So I guess the first question--and then  
11 we'll spend a little more time on the longer email  
12 exchanges--did you have lunch with Karen Tramontano at  
13 Equinox on December 2nd, 2019?

14 MS. NOVELLI: Yes.

15 MR. FOLIO: And what was the purpose of that lunch?

16 MS. NOVELLI: I was talking to her about the--I started  
17 a nonprofit after I left the State Department, after I tried  
18 to think about what I wanted to do, and I was doing  
19 listening sessions around the U.S. to talk to people about--  
20 talk to regular people about their views on international  
21 trade and globalization. And so I was trying to think about  
22 what to do for, like, maybe publishing something--Karen had  
23 published some articles about this--and also thinking about,  
24 you know, was there a think tank or something that might be  
25 interested that I could hook up with to sort of--to kind of



1 do this. So that was what I--the main purpose of my having  
2 lunch with her.

3 MR. FOLIO: So in the course of this email exchange,  
4 Ms. Tramontano sent you the first email on December 3, 2019,  
5 and if we can scroll down you can read through the entire  
6 email if you'd like. But the part I'd like to focus on is  
7 the third article which she sent you. Right there, that  
8 sentence--sorry, stop for a second, please, Will. She says,  
9 "Finally, the link to my quote in the Wall Street Journal  
10 article which followed the first smaller article." And if  
11 you could scroll down, please, Will, you'll see the three  
12 links that Ms. Tramontano included.

13 MS. NOVELLI: Okay.

14 MR. FOLIO: Did you and Ms. Tramontano discuss this  
15 Wall Street Journal article during your lunch?

16 MS. NOVELLI: Not in detail, but we discussed that we  
17 had both been called by a Wall Street Journal reporter.

18 MR. FOLIO: And why were you called by a Wall Street  
19 Journal reporter?

20 MS. NOVELLI: For the same article. For the same  
21 article, or an article that a Wall Street Journal reporter  
22 was working on about this whole question of Burisma and  
23 Hunter Biden and the email that was released under FOIA.

24 MR. FOLIO: And when you say "the email that was  
25 released under FOIA," was that the email that we looked at

1 previously during this interview?

2 MS. NOVELLI: Yes. It was the email from the personal  
3 on my staff that I never saw, asking for input from the  
4 Ukraine desk about Burisma, and saying Hunter Biden is on  
5 the board.

6 MR. FOLIO: And just for reference, this is the email  
7 that we introduced previously as Exhibit 12.

8 What did you and Ms. Tramontano discuss about this  
9 issue?

10 MS. NOVELLI: We did not spend much time discussing  
11 this issue at all, but this quote that Ms. Tramontano said  
12 that she gave them, saying she had known and worked with me  
13 for years, and didn't mention his name to secure the  
14 meeting, and I--we both agreed that she would not need to  
15 mention Hunter Biden's name to secure a meeting with me  
16 because I knew her and I had worked with her.

17 MR. FOLIO: The email, however, does show, at least as  
18 drafted by the State Department official, that in the course  
19 of that official's conversation with Ms. Tramontano she did  
20 mention Mr. Biden's position on the board of Burisma. So if  
21 she didn't need to mention that to secure the meeting with  
22 you, given your preexisting relationship, then did she  
23 discuss why she mentioned it at all?

24 MS. NOVELLI: No. We didn't discuss that.

25 MR. FOLIO: So looking at her quote, which she emailed

1 to you and where she said that she didn't mention Mr.  
2 Biden's name in order to secure the meeting, do you have any  
3 understanding as to, based on either what you talked about  
4 or what she emailed you, the purpose for which she didn't  
5 seem to mention Mr. Biden's name?

6 MS. NOVELLI: I have no--I do not know, but it wasn't  
7 in the email she sent to me asking for a meeting, and I  
8 agreed to it, based on the email she sent to me, so I don't  
9 know.

10 MR. FOLIO: During that lunch, did you all discuss that  
11 the email--did you discuss the investigation that Chairman  
12 Johnson and Chairman Grassley had started into this issue,  
13 specifically with regard to a request to the State  
14 Department on November 6, 2019, that quoted that email?

15 MS. NOVELLI: No, actually, we didn't. The only thing  
16 we talked about was this Wall Street Journal reporter  
17 writing an article. I don't think I even knew that an  
18 investigation had started.

19 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, do you know David Leiter?

20 MS. NOVELLI: David Leiter?

21 MR. FOLIO: The last name is spelled, or, I guess, also  
22 potentially pronounced "Leeter" [phonetic], spelled L-e-i-t-  
23 e-r, David "Leeter" [phonetic] or Leiter.

24 MS. NOVELLI: That name doesn't ring a bell.

25 MR. FOLIO: Mr. Leiter is a registered lobbyist for

1 Burisma. Have you ever met with Mr. Leiter to discuss  
2 Burisma?

3 MS. NOVELLI: No.

4 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, I think we're just about to  
5 end, if you can just indulge me for one second while I check  
6 with my colleagues to make sure there's nothing else. Thank  
7 you.

8 [Pause.]

9 MR. FOLIO: All right, Ms. Novelli, from Chairman  
10 Johnson's and Chairman Grassley's side I think we've  
11 concluded all the questions we have for you today. I'm not  
12 sure if the minority has any questions. Before we formally  
13 wrap up I'll ask Zack and David if they would like to take  
14 some more time.

15 MR. SCHRAM: Nothing from me. Dan?

16 MR. GOSHORN: Nothing from me.

17 MR. BERICK: No, I have nothing.

18 MR. FOLIO: Ms. Novelli, thank you very much. You have  
19 been very generous with your time. Thank you, Stuart and  
20 Chris, as well, for participating, and we appreciate you  
21 voluntarily appearing before the Committees, for answering  
22 our questions, and we will wish you the best.

23 MS. NOVELLI: Thanks.

24 MR. FOLIO: Goodbye, everyone.

25 [Whereupon, at 3:10 p.m., the Interview was concluded.]

# Washington Examiner

## Joe Biden emerges as Obama's trusty sidekick

By Susan Crabtree, Senior Congressional Reporter | | April 25, 2014 12:00 AM

Vice President Joe Biden has become the public face of the administration's handling of Ukraine, working to reassure Kiev and trying to talk tough with Russia.

During a whirlwind two-day visit to Ukraine, Biden met with the country's leaders and announced an additional \$50 million in aid. At a press conference, he delivered a lecture to Russian President Vladimir Putin, telling him to “stop talking and start acting” to defuse the crisis.

With no diplomatic end in sight, it's a high-stakes role for a vice president whose foreign policy chops were publicly mocked by former Defense Secretary Robert Gates, who wrote in a memoir published in January that Biden was “wrong on nearly every major foreign policy and national security issue over the past four decades.”

Any missteps or another Russian land grab could prove fatal to Biden's political ambitions as he weighs a 2016 presidential bid. Critics say it will be hard for the vice president, a former chairman of the Senate Foreign Relations Committee, to separate himself from the administration's policy on Ukraine.

After his trip, late-night comics took aim at the vice president's tendency to run at the mouth and make gaffes, joking that Putin — and everyone else — had long stopped listening to Biden.

Republican lawmakers were also unimpressed by his calls for the Kremlin to stop backing Russian separatists.

“Or else what?” asked Sen. John McCain, painting the vice president as the front man for an administration unwilling to take tough action against Russia.

Indeed, after Biden left Ukraine, it seemed that nothing had changed. Tensions with Moscow remain high, and Russian militants show no signs of backing down in eastern Ukraine.

But Biden's raising of the American flag in Kiev wasn't without benefit for President Obama, who was able to carry on with a week-long trip to Asia. And Biden's public diplomacy revealed Obama's new trust in his No. 2.

“So Biden talks a lot -- so what?” said James Goldgeier, dean of American University's School of International Service and a veteran of the Clinton White House's national security team. “The vice president has been extremely valuable to Obama --he's done everything the president could have asked for and more.”

The relationship between Obama and Biden is on the upswing following their 2012 low when the undisciplined -- but authentic -- vice president publicly supported gay marriage before the White House was ready to make the leap. Biden so angered the president's team that they reportedly froze him out of key meetings.

Since then, Obama has often turned to Biden to help in foreign policy binds — even if the assist only involves dispatching him to hot spots to repeat the administration's line.

Despite giving his vice president a chance to raise his foreign policy credentials, Obama has stayed neutral about Biden's political future.

“He has been, as I said earlier, a great partner in everything that I do,” Obama said, as he sat next to Biden in an interview.

“I suspect that there may be other potential candidates for 2016 who have been great friends and allies,” he added -- an awkward reference to former Secretary of State Hillary Clinton, who vastly outpolls other Democrats and whose presumed candidacy has frozen Biden in place.

At the same time, Clinton has political vulnerabilities. Her own foreign policy record is under scrutiny, especially now that her much-touted “reset” with Russia is in tatters. Clinton's “what difference does it make” remark during the Benghazi hearings cemented Republican views that the administration mishandled the terror attack that killed four Americans.

Still, Obama's relationship with Biden appears to be on the mend, possibly out of sheer necessity or long-term loyalty. The president has shown a new warmth in their relationship, posing for a selfie with Biden and joking that the two were on a “guys' trip” when they visited Pennsylvania.

Biden for his part has expressed comfort with acting publicly on Obama's behalf even as the president's poll numbers droop and his policies face tough criticism.

“There is nothing I would do differently,” Biden said about carrying out his job as he weighs future plans.

Many insiders believe Biden is keeping his name in the presidential mix because it's better to keep people guessing than declare the end of his long career while still in office. But Biden has made it clear he'll enjoy the ride while it lasts.

**From:**Karen Tramontano  
**Sent:**Fri, 16 May 2014 17:36:19 -0400  
**To:**Novelli, Catherine A  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:**RE: Thank You  
**Attachments:**BISE Ghana Summary.pdf

Dear Cathy,

It is so great to see you in your new gig and to have such a delightful and wide-ranging discussion. I'm going to put some thoughts down on paper about supply chain/Africa/garments. It may take a couple of pre-meetings to get it in the right place for a "summit" discussion even an along the sidelines discussion – but I'll reach out quietly to a couple of brands to see if there's some traction. On the "deliverable" front, attached is a short concept note on our work in Ghana. As a stand-alone project with funding it could work – but I think it's more in line with the Summit goals if we can find a US investor in processing. I'll think about what else is out there that may be ready for a "next stage" and could be a good economic deliverable.

Have a good weekend – hope the vacuum cleaner purchase works out well ☺

Thank you so much for your time—

Warm regards,  
Karen

Karen A. Tramontano  
President  
Global Fairness Initiative  
2122 P Street, NW  
Suite 302  
Washington, DC 20037

202-898-9023 (main)  
[REDACTED] (mobile)

[www.globalfairness.org](http://www.globalfairness.org)  
[www.fairnessaward.org](http://www.fairnessaward.org)  
[www.befaircampaign.org](http://www.befaircampaign.org)

---

**From:** Novelli, Catherine A [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Friday, March 21, 2014 2:06 PM  
**To:** Karen Tramontano  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Wonderful to see you

Hi Karen,

It was such a pleasant surprise to see you at the Advisory Committee meeting on Wednesday! I would love to get together and am copying my assistant, [REDACTED] who can work with yours to make it happen as soon as humanly possible.

Can't wait to catch up.

Cathy

---

**From:** Karen Tramontano [<mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 19, 2014 3:23 PM  
**To:** Novelli, Catherine A  
**Subject:** Wonderful to see you

Dear Cathy,  
It was so great to see you yesterday –an unexpected pleasure! I know how busy you are and don't want to impinge on your time but if you have a moment in the upcoming weeks to grab a coffee or whatever I'm available. I'm thrilled about your appointment – it's wonderful when good people like you – get recognized for their hard work, dedication and positive contribution. I wish you the very best,  
My warmest regards,  
Karen

Karen A. Tramontano  
Blue Star Strategies

(+1) 202-833-1265 direct  
(+1) [REDACTED]  
(+1) 202-822-9088 fax  
[karen.tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:karen.tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com)

888 17th Street NW, Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20006

[www.bluestarstrategies.com](http://www.bluestarstrategies.com)

The information in this transmittal is privileged and confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are not the intended recipient(s) for the delivery of this transmittal, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify me at (+1) 202-833-1281





## BUILDING INCLUSIVE SHEA ECONOMIES

...local solutions for a global economy

*The Building Inclusive Shea Economies (BISE) is a joint program of the Global Fairness Initiative (GFI), Shea Nut Pickers and Shea Butter Processors Association (Pagsung), Africa 2000 Network Ghana (A2N-Ghana), EcoVentures, International Development Enterprises (IDE), and the Synapse Market Access Fund (Synapse Fund). Designed to scale up agricultural activity and ag-business models for women Shea nut pickers and processors in Northern Ghana, BISE will work to empower these workers by establishing greater control over the local economy, with emphasis on the Shea nut supply chain, building capacity among producers, and improving production practice and quality to facilitate and improve access to Shea nut markets so they too can benefit from a global economy.*

### Executive Summary

For centuries Africans have harvested the Shea fruit, a tropical commodity enmeshed within the history and culture of the West African savanna belt. In the past few decades Shea-derived products have seen increasing worldwide demand; however, for the majority of Shea nut pickers and processors this has not translated into improved livelihoods. In countries such as Ghana, millions of women Shea nut pickers and processors register among the poorest of the poor. Along with limited access to formal market structures and opportunities, women Shea nut pickers face myriad barriers including inaccessible government agencies and restrictions on land ownership, financial services, inheritance, and more. Despite meaningful advances in the past decade, the Shea industry as a whole as well as the national government and the existing market structures have been slow to promote the integration of the majority of the grassroots Shea industry in any meaningful way.

In 2010, GFI started working with Pagsung, an association of women Shea pickers and processors in Tamale, Ghana, to help them build a women-led business that can compete nationally and internationally. Building Inclusive Shea Economies (BISE) seeks to empower women Shea nut pickers and processors in the following 5 districts of Northern Ghana: 1. West Mumprusi District, 2. Tamale Metro, 3. Karaga District, 4. Tolon-Kumbungu District, 5. Savulgu-Nantong District

To strengthen their overarching livelihood goals, GFI is also addressing market diversification as well as strengthening decision-making mechanisms, thus building the foundation for a resilient local economy that can sustain a profitable and stable Shea production industry. Through this model GFI is providing women producers the tools, training, and connections they have long demanded to realize both their economic and social empowerment goals.

### BISE: Integrating Women Producers to Global Markets

The BISE program has been designed in consultation with multiple local and international partners and responds to their concerns about the lack of integration of the Shea Value Chain. The model will seek to build on the expertise of the BISE partnership with rural agricultural practices, optimizing supply chains, and organizing sales and distribution networks. This process enhances the quality, tractability, capacity, and efficiency of production through the use of technology, information, and support.

Scaling up production to achieve sustainable poverty reduction for grassroots entrepreneurs requires addressing many barriers – many that are deeply entrenched in social and market norms. Because of this, BISE will take the following steps:

**As a result of the BISE program, women throughout the five selected Districts in Northern Ghana will be well positioned to lead innovation through a grassroots, women-led business model.**

### **Component 1: Building the Foundation of the Shea Economy**

*Market Assessment:* GFI will launch the program by conducting a market assessment that provides a comprehensive understanding of real vs. perceived supply and demand, operational improvements, new market channels for raw and processed Shea nut, and maps opportunities for new livelihood enhancing enterprises.

*Life Cycle Assessment:* In order to identify a more complete set of business options, a life cycle assessment of Shea production will help audit resource use and waste so that efficiency improvements and profit opportunity can be extracted. This will facilitate the identification of new enterprise opportunities resulting from improved technologies or materials such as more efficient water or energy use, more sustainable materials and packaging, and effective waste utilization.

*Institution Building:* Through BISE's leadership, Pagsung will receive management trainings to strengthen its internal governance practices and improve resource management and transparency. Capacity building will focus on establishing clear governance, accounting, and revenue structures to ensure management sustainability upon program exit.

### **Component 2: Scaling up Production**

*Improve Production Capacity:* BISE will oversee the creation of a Trade Facilitation Center (TFC) integrated into the existing Pagsung organizational structure. The trade facilitation mechanism will not only improve collection, logistics and management but will also provide a central facility for storage, processing, sorting, packaging, and whatever else is necessary to drive the economic empowerment objectives of the BISE program.

*Improve Product Quality:* After collection logistics, the next barrier along the value-chain for Pagsung is rooted in the lack of equipment and infrastructure necessary to make Shea production competitive internationally. Introduction of equipment and infrastructure will be done gradually and directed by the needs of the growing business. Initially, pots, containers, sieves, and other basic equipment such as packaging material for transport will be upgraded. The larger infrastructure needs that support the TFC will require a more robust investment, and BISE will draw on the debt financing support of the Synapse Market Access Fund to raise the necessary capital.

*Leadership Development and Multi-Stakeholder Engagement:* GFI will utilize its experience in leading multi-stakeholder engagements to create linkages between the Northern Region communities, civil society organizations, government representatives, and the private sector. Being exposed to government agencies, buyers, national associations, and other related stakeholders will round the practical business trainings and strengthen the confidence and knowledge of women so they can participate as equals in the Shea Value Chain.

*Financial Literacy and Access to Financing:* While the Synapse Access Fund will provide expertise on successful loan management, the Pagsung women producers must learn to access other financial sources to ensure their long-term economic growth. Accounting and financial management skills are mandatory, but equally important are trainings to understand bank requirements, including loan application processes, and how to respond to market trends.

### **Component 3: Accessing Competitive Markets**

*Product Competitiveness:* BISE will implement the market analysis recommendations, which will identify the best markets for selected products and set a schedule of trainings so that new skills go hand in hand with new opportunities (including organically certified Shea).

*Value Chain Linkages:* Creating a connection between international structures and local producers is of significant importance, as it would mean that the women Shea pickers, the bottom of the pyramid, can access the highest paying structures of the Shea value chain.

## BISE Partnership Structure

**The Global Fairness Initiative (GFI)** was founded in 2002, with the aim to change the global poverty cycle and enable market-based solutions that benefit the world's poorest workers and producers. For BISE, GFI will be responsible for managing program activities and will ensure they meet participants' needs. GFI has worked extensively connecting producers with global markets, building successful direct relations with buyers, as well as establishing Trade Facilitation Centers, and will use this expertise throughout the program to link the Shea value chain from input suppliers to global markets.

**EcoVentures (EVI)** is a non-profit organization launched in 2002 to support the growth of sustainable local economies by linking enterprise development with environmental stewardship. EcoVentures will conduct a market analysis and life cycle assessment that will guide potential employment and self-employment opportunities in Shea processing. Building on EcoVentures' creative work in finding opportunities for bottom-of-the-pyramid workers, the market analysis will include personal development, interpersonal communication, leadership, and added value activities.

**Africa 2000 Network (A2N-Ghana)** was conceived in 1986 through a Canadian initiative during a special session of the United Nations General Assembly with the aim of giving support to grassroots initiatives. Africa 2000 Network will continue working with Pagsung in three districts of Northern Region on improving internal best practices for sustainable growth with a focus on women's leadership and environmental sustainability.

**Concern Universal** is a UK international NGO working in 12 countries, five of which are in West Africa. The organization works to fight poverty and inequality and support practical actions that enable the poor to improve their lives and shape their own futures. Concern Universal has been operating in Ghana since 1999 in the areas of Sustainable Livelihoods, Water, Sanitation & Hygiene (WASH), Microfinance, and Disaster Risk Reduction among the rural poor. Concern Universal will replicate and expand the work of Pagsung and A2N-Ghana to two additional districts of the Northern Region, enhancing livelihoods through market development and enabling access to local financial mechanisms.

**Synapse Market Access Fund** is a registered institution with a 501(C)(3) status under the fiscal and administrative sponsorship of GFI. Synapse is committed to creating economic opportunity for the working poor by catalyzing the growth of inclusive financial markets and mechanisms in developing economies. Synapse will provide access to debt financing structured at interest rates and repayment schedules that consider livelihood impact, farming cycles, and prospects for business growth.

**International Development Enterprises (iDE)** does extensive work in Central America and has fifteen years of experience in affordable irrigation and water management technologies. IDE will lead the Research and Development (R&D) needed to produce and promote affordable production, irrigation, and water management technologies needed to improve production and reduce costs.

### **Pagsung Shea Butter Processors and Shea Nut Pickers Association**

Registered in 2009, Pagsung is an association of eighteen women's groups working in Shea nut collecting and Shea butter processing. Located in Tamale, Ghana, Pagsung has a total membership of 754. Pagsung was established through the Africa 2000 Network as a vehicle for women from various communities to share best practices and pool their resources in order to meet bigger and more lucrative market opportunities.

**From:**Jenkins, Yvette Y  
**Sent:**Thu, 17 Apr 2014 14:25:37 -0400  
**To:** [REDACTED];Duncan, John D;Heidt, William A; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:**Paper Status for U/S Novelli's - Friday, April 18

Please provide paper status concerning U/S Novelli's meetings **highlighted** below. Thank you. Yvette

## U/S Catherine Novelli's Schedule for Friday, April 18

- 8:30 AM – 9:00 AM E Staff Meeting  
Room 7256
- 9:15 AM – 9:45 AM (S) Deputies Senior Staff Meeting  
D Conference Room
- **10:00 AM – 11:30 AM** **(T) G-7 Meeting**  
**Room 7250**
- **12:00 PM – 2:00 PM** **Lunch with Chairman Fred Hochberg**  
**Martin Van Buren Dining Room**
- 2:00 PM – 3:00 PM Coffee with Karen Tramontano  
tbd
- 3:00 PM – 6:00 PM Block

[REDACTED] - ☺ | Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment|  
Department of State| Washington, DC 20520| Room 7256| 202/647-8854| [REDACTED]

**From:** Malik, Sabeen

**Sent:** Wed, 20 Aug 2014 22:39:54 +0000

**To:** 'Karen Tramontano'

**Subject:** RE: Would You be on an Award Committee?

**Attachments:** Briefing Notes for Selection Committee Members on sharePoint 2 2014.docx, Charles E Cobb award.doc, Charles E. Cobb Award for Initiative and Success in Trade Development Scoresheet.doc, Cobb Award Selection Committee Members.docx, 2014 Charles E Cobb Award Sung Kim Korea.pdf, Douglas Griffiths for Charles Cobb.pdf, Ford Hart - Cobb Nomination 2014.pdf, Michael H. Corbin for Charles Cobb.pdf, Norland Cobb.pdf

Dear Karen,

On behalf of the Cobb Award Selection Committee, thank you again for taking the time to serve on the selection committee. As per your email to U/S Cathy Novelli, I wanted to send you an update on the time of the Committee meeting and email you a copy of the nomination packet. You mentioned that you will be calling in and the conference line number is: **202-647-8923**. The committee will be meeting at **10am (EST) on 8/26**.

The nomination packet should include:

- A briefing note for committee members
- Cobb Award Eligibility criteria
- Score sheet
- Cobb Award Selection Committee members and bios
- 5 Candidate nominations

If you have any questions on the nomination packets or any logistical questions, please feel free to send me a note or call.

Sincerely,

SABEEN MALIK | SENIOR ADVISOR | U.S. DEPARTMENT OF STATE

O:202-647-9333 | BB: [REDACTED] | EMAIL: [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Karen Tramontano [mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com]

**Sent:** Thursday, July 03, 2014 3:32 PM

**To:** Novelli, Catherine A

**Cc:** Heidt, William A; Malik, Sabeen; Caleb Shreve

**Subject:** RE: Would You be on an Award Committee?

Dear Cathy

I am thrilled that you are holding a supply chain event for the summit. It will be a key ingredient to getting the metrics right on these issues. Most unfortunately, I will be out of town with my niece and nephew on our annual summer vacation -- I would however love to have GFI represented if that were at all possible. Caleb Shreve who you probably know from your and his White House days has been GFI's Executive Director for many years and frankly knows more about supply chain issues than I ever will. So if substitutes are possible he would be my choice! On the Cobb Selection Committee - I would be honored to serve. If I could call into the meeting

on the 26th that would be great ..since I'm away that week as well. Sorry about my absence, August is the only time I'm able to get away given my commitments to Blue Star and GFI. Let me know if my by phone participation would be acceptable and whether Caleb could be with you on the 6th. I'm also scheduled in two weeks to have a follow on discussion with US AID along the lines of our discussion e.g. putting employment back into the poverty alleviation program. Thanks again for everything good luck in your work and travels,  
warmest regards  
Karen

---

**From:** Novelli, Catherine A [REDACTED] >  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 3, 2014 3:10 PM  
**To:** Karen Tramontano  
**Cc:** Heidt, William A; Malik, Sabeen  
**Subject:** Would You be on an Award Committee?

Hi Karen,

It was so fun to talk with you last month. Based on our discussion, we are moving ahead with a supply chain event in conjunction with the African Leaders' summit. We would love for you to be a part of it. GE has agreed to host and we are looking at getting the Ops folks who direct supply chains for a variety of companies to discuss the issues that they look at in making decisions—including labor and environment issues. Don't know if there are any textile brands who you think we should reach out to, but would love to have them. The idea would be to follow up this discussion with AID assistance to fill in the gaps to help countries get where they need to go in terms of rules of the road and enforcement. We are planning to hold this on Aug. 6 in the afternoon.

Lest one request is not enough, I am in charge of constituting the Committee who selects the winner of the Department of State's Cobb Award. The Cobb Award was developed in conjunction with Ambassador Cobb, (<http://www.secureenergy.org/diplomatic-council-energy-security/ambassador-charles-e-cobb-jr>), as an award for career ambassadors in trade development. This award is presented to career members of the Foreign Service serving in an ambassadorial appointment for noteworthy success in developing trade between other nations and the United States, and consists of a certificate signed by the Secretary of State and \$10,000.

Given all you have been doing in the development area, I thought you would be a great addition to the Cobb Selection Committee. The commitment is one meeting for about an hour and 30 minutes to review the nominees (usually between 5-7), and attending the Awards ceremony (if you choose) sometime in mid-November. Currently, the selection committee is tentatively scheduled to meet on August 26th at 3:00pm at the State Department. Let me know if this is something you would be willing to do.

I am off to Japan and then China for the S&ED and then on vacation for a week, but reachable by email. Look forward to catching up when I am back in DC. Hope all is well with you. Happy Fourth!

Best,  
Cathy



**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Mon, 17 Nov 2014 12:12:35 -0500  
**To:** [REDACTED]; Duncan, John D.; [REDACTED]; Heidt, William A.; [REDACTED], Malik, Sabeen  
**Subject:** Paper status for U/S Novelli - Tuesday, November 18

Please let me know paper status for Cathy's meetings **highlighted** below. Thank you! [REDACTED]

## U/S Catherine A. Novelli Tuesday, November 18

- 8:30 AM – 9:10 AM E Staff Meeting  
Room 7256
- 9:15 AM – 9:45 AM (S) Deputies Senior Staff Meeting  
D Conference Room
- **10:45 AM – 11:45 AM** *WHA DCM Conference  
Marshall Conference Center*
- 12:00 PM – 1:30 PM Lunch
- **2:00 PM – 2:30 PM** *Félix Braz, Luxembourg's  
Minister of Justice  
Room 7256*
- **3:00 PM – 3:30 PM** *ILO Director General Guy Ryder  
and Karen Tramontano, CEO of  
Blue Star Strategies  
Room 7256*
- **4:00 PM – 4:30 PM** *Professor Michael Posner, NYU  
Stern School of Business  
Room 7256*
- 5:00 PM – 5:45 PM STAFF TIME



■ 6:00 PM – 7:00 PM READING BLOCK

██████████ - ☺ | Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment |  
Department of State | Washington, DC 20520 | Room 7256 | 202/647-8854 | ██████████

**From:** [REDACTED] on behalf of Novelli, Catherine A  
**Sent:** Wed, 21 Oct 2015 19:13:30 -0400  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** USGLC Global Initiative  
**Attachments:** FW: Following up on USGLC Invitation to U/S Novelli, USGLC October 23 Luncheon\_Background Memo\_Updated.pdf



## MEMORANDUM

To: Under Secretary Cathy Novelli, U.S. Department of State  
From: Liz Schraye, USGLC President & CEO  
Re: USGLC Luncheon  
Date: October 20, 2015

We are honored you are joining us as our special guest on Friday, October 23rd. I have enclosed background information for the meeting and information on logistics. If you or your staff has any questions, please contact Emily Benovitz at (202) 730-4169 or [ebenovitz@usglc.org](mailto:ebenovitz@usglc.org). We look forward to a lively and engaging discussion with you and our leadership.

### 1. BACKGROUND AND LOGISTICS

- The luncheon provides an opportunity to engage you on your leadership on economic statecraft, on engaging and partnering with the private sector, and on the impact of science and technology in the fight to end extreme poverty.
- Please arrive at the *Top of the Hay*, on the top level of The Hay Adams Hotel (800 16th Street NW) at 11:45 a.m.**
- The luncheon will begin promptly at 12:00 p.m. and conclude by 1:30 p.m.
- Participants include approximately 25-30 of the USGLC's senior leadership as well as other business and NGO leaders (*full participant list below*).
- The conversation is off-the-record and not for attribution. All remarks will be delivered informally from the table.

### 2. LUNCH FORMAT & DISCUSSION TOPICS

The lunch will begin with a brief introduction of the USGLC and its advocacy to strengthen diplomacy and development. You will be invited to deliver 10 minutes of remarks about the State Department's Economic Statecraft agenda and efforts to promote economic prosperity to address global challenges. We would especially welcome examples that highlight your efforts to build partnerships with the private sector, to foster innovation through science and technology, and to address the economic conditions that underlie countering violent extremism. This will be followed by a moderated conversation. Some questions may include:

- Partnerships.** Many of us have seen a number of terrific partnerships at State. Yet these partnerships can sometimes seem a bit "one off." How are you working to integrate them into how you do business and make them more sustainable?
- Economic Growth in Africa.** At the Africa Leaders Summit, you hosted an event with American business, such as Coca-Cola, UPS, Walmart, and Procter and Gamble that focused on promoting their participation in global supply chains in Africa. Where are you seeing results in this area?

□ **Commercial Diplomacy.** Secretary Rice used to say that there were 200 of the fastest growing cities around the world with more than a million people where the United States did not even have a diplomatic presence. How far have we come to address this challenge (and opportunity for American businesses) and what still needs to be done?

□ **Technology and Global Development.** At the UN last month, you announced the launch of the “Global Connect” initiative, which aims to bring 1.5 billion people online by 2020. Can you tell us more and how this initiative promotes both sustainable global economic development and U.S. economic prosperity?

□ **Wildlife Trafficking.** You traveled to Africa and highlighted the national security implications of terrorist groups like al-Shabaab drawing 40% of their funding from the illicit sales of endangered animals. How can State’s tools of economic statecraft contribute to countering this national security problem?

□ **Trade and the Enabling Environment.** You work with Ambassador Rivkin on trade policy and programs at State. The link between trade and aid seems to be stronger than ever before. How can U.S. be more effective in promoting rule of law, fighting corruption, and strengthening local institutions to unlock trade with American businesses?

□ **Power Africa.** You oversee the Energy Resources Bureau, which advances the necessary reforms for increasing foreign investment relating to the Power Africa initiative in the energy sector. What impact are you seeing from these efforts? How are you working with other government agencies like USAID on Power Africa?

□ **Economy & Competitive Playing Field.** Foreign Policy magazine released its list of best countries for foreign investment, and 7 of top 10 are in developing world, where we also see enormous competition from countries like China. How are you strengthening the capacity of America’s diplomats to maintain a competitive edge in these countries?

### 3. LUNCHEON TIMELINE

**11:45 a.m. Guests Arrive**

**12:00 p.m. Program Begins**

**12:05 p.m. Welcome Remarks**

**12:15 p.m. USGLC Update**

**12:22 p.m. Introduction of Under Secretary Cathy Novelli**

**12:25 p.m. Opening Remarks – Under Secretary Cathy Novelli**

**12:35 p.m. Interactive Discussion – facilitated by Liz Schrayner, USGLC**

**1:25 p.m. Closing Remarks**

**1:30 p.m. Lunch Concludes**

### 4. ABOUT THE U.S. GLOBAL LEADERSHIP COALITION

□ The **U.S. Global Leadership Coalition** is a broad-based influential network of 400 businesses and NGOs; national security and foreign policy experts; and business, faith-based, and community leaders in all 50 states who support a smart power approach of elevating diplomacy and development alongside defense in order to build a better, safer world.

□ The USGLC is supported by an **Advisory Council** of prominent foreign policy and national security experts including all of the former Secretaries of State and former Cabinet officials, as

well as former Members of Congress. Former Secretary of State Colin Powell serves as the Honorary Chair.

□ The USGLC's **National Security Advisory Council** is comprised of over 160 retired three- and four-star generals and flag officers committed to strengthening America's national security strategy with the increased use of our non-military tools. Members of the National Security Advisory Council have sent letters to Congress in support of a strong and effective International Affairs Budget, met with senior lawmakers on Capitol Hill, and authored opinion pieces around the country.

□ **Veterans for Smart Power** is a group of veterans of all ages and ranks who share a commitment to elevating and strengthening our non-military tools of global engagement. Launched in 2010, there are currently nearly 30,000 supporters of Veterans for Smart Power with active groups in 15 states across the country.

Dear [REDACTED]

I hope your week has been going well! It was good to touch base earlier this week about U/S Novelli coming to USGLC. I have attached the original invitation we sent her in case. I wanted to check in again about her availability during the week of October 19<sup>th</sup> on Tuesday October 20<sup>th</sup>, Wednesday October 21<sup>st</sup> or Thursday October 22<sup>nd</sup> for either a lunch or breakfast event. Please let me know which works best so we can begin to move forward scheduling what is sure to be a great event. Thank you for your help thus far! Feel free to give me a call if you have any other questions I can answer.



**From:**Leah Goldman  
**Sent:**Fri, 18 Sep 2015 15:53:27 -0400  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:**FW: Following up on USGLC Invitation to U/S Novelli  
**Attachments:**USGLC Invitation to Under Secretary Cathy Novelli Invite.pdf

Dear [REDACTED],

I hope your week has been going well! It was good to touch base earlier this week about U/S Novelli coming to USGLC. I have attached the original invitation we sent her in case. I wanted to check in again about her availability during the week of October 19<sup>th</sup> on Tuesday October 20<sup>th</sup>, Wednesday October 21<sup>st</sup> or Thursday October 22<sup>nd</sup> for either a lunch or breakfast event. Please let me know which works best so we can begin to move forward scheduling what is sure to be a great event. Thank you for your help thus far! Feel free to give me a call if you have any other questions I can answer.

Best,  
Leah Goldman

**Leah Goldman** | National Events Associate | p: (202) 730-4141 | f: (202) 689-8910  
[U.S. Global Leadership Coalition](#) | 1129 20th Street NW, Suite 600, Washington, DC 20036 | [@USGLC](#)



September 18, 2015

The Honorable Catherine Novelli  
Under Secretary of State  
U.S. Department of State  
2201 C Street, NW  
Room 7256  
Washington, DC 20520

Dear Under-Secretary Novelli,

On behalf of the U.S. Global Leadership Coalition (USGLC), we are writing to **invite you to be our honored guest and featured speaker at a small, private breakfast or lunch in Washington, D.C. this fall.** We know our community would welcome the opportunity to hear your insights on the unique contribution civilian programs are making to advance our national security and economic interests. Our leadership would welcome the opportunity to hear your insights on these issues, drawing on your experience as Under Secretary of State for Economic Growth, Energy and the Environment.

The event will bring together foreign policy thought leaders and senior business and NGO leaders from the USGLC's diverse coalition for an off-the-record discussion on the importance of multilateral actors in advancing America's global interests. Over the past several years, the USGLC has held similar events with Deputy Secretaries Heather Higginbottom and Tony Blinken, along with General Colin Powell, Secretary Larry Summers, Secretary Madeleine Albright, General Martin Dempsey, and many more.

As you may know, the USGLC is a broad-based, influential network of 400 businesses and NGOs; national security and foreign policy experts; and business, military, and civic leaders who support a smart power approach of elevating diplomacy and development alongside defense. Our Advisory Council includes all of the former Secretaries of State and our National Security Advisory Council, includes over 150 four- and three-star retired generals and flag officers, complemented by a nationwide network of over 30,000 veterans. *A complete list of our Board of Directors is attached.*

Our colleague, Emily Benovitz, will follow up with your office regarding a date that may work with your schedule. In the meantime, please feel free to have your staff contact her at [ebenovitz@usglc.org](mailto:ebenovitz@usglc.org) or 202-730-4169 with any questions.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Dan Glickman".

Honorable Dan Glickman  
Chairman of the Board

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Liz Schroyer".

Liz Schroyer  
President & CEO



## Board of Directors

**Secretary Dan Glickman**, *Chairman*

**William Lane**, *Co-Chair*

**Carolyn Miles**, *Co-Chair*

**Hunter Biden**

**Jeffrey Colman**

**Michael Crow**

**Michael Deich**

**Matt Echols**

**Joann Emerson**

**Mike Fernandez**

**Helene Gayle**

**Michael Gerson**

**Anne Goddard**

**Ambassador Mark Green**

**Leslie Griffin**

**Ambassador Karl Hofmann**

**James Horner**

**Bill Inglee**

**George Ingram**

**Andrea Koppel**

**Jessica Krivant**

**Craig Lasher**

**Ann Lewis**

**Kristin Lord**

**Greta Lundeborg**

**Lisa Malloy**

**John Murphy**

**Bill O'Keefe**

**Norman Ornstein**

**Linda Padon**

**Chris Policinski**

**Eric Reading**

**Geralyn Ritter**

**Nancy Ziuzin Schlegel**

**Ed Scott**

**Ritu Sharma**

**Andrew Tisch**

**Sarah Thorn**

**Sharon Waxman**

**Sherrie Westin**

**Aaron Williams**

**Samuel Worthington**

**Peter Yeo**

**Robert Zachritz**

Executive Director, **Aspen Institute Congressional Program**; Senior Fellow, **Bipartisan Policy Center**

Director of International Governmental Affairs, **Caterpillar, Inc.**

President & CEO, **Save the Children**

Managing Partner, **Rosemont Seneca**

Deputy Director, Policy & Government Affairs, **AIPAC**

President, **Arizona State University**

Director of Government Relations, United States, Canada, & Asia Pacific, **Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation**

Vice President, **The Coca-Cola Company**

CEO, **National Rural Electric Cooperative Association**

Corporate Vice President, Corporate Affairs, **Cargill**

President and CEO, **CARE**

Senior Fellow, **ONE**

President and CEO, **ChildFund International**

President & CEO, **International Republican Institute**

Senior Vice President, International Public Policy, **UPS**

President & CEO, **PSI**

Principal, **Deloitte Consulting LLP**

Senior Partner, **Inglee Sauer Moseley Strategies, LLC**

Senior Fellow, **The Brookings Institution**

Vice President of Global Engagement and Policy, **Mercy Corps**

Director of External Affairs, **Creative Associates**

Senior Policy Analyst, **PAI**

Former White House Communications Director

President & CEO, **IREX**

Senior Director for Intentional Operations and Policy, **Boeing**

Director of Policy Communication, **Intel**

Vice President, International Affairs, **U.S. Chamber of Commerce**

Senior Director, Advocacy, **Catholic Relief Services**

Resident Scholar, **American Enterprise Institute**

General Manager, Global Corporate Public Policy, **Chevron**

President & CEO, **Land O'Lakes, Inc.**

Senior Vice President, Afghanistan and Pakistan, **Chemonics**

Senior Vice President, **Merck**

Vice President, Washington International Business Development, **Lockheed**

**Martin Corporation**

Co-Founder & Chairman, **Center for Global Development**

Co-Founder & President, **Women Thrive Worldwide**

Co-Chairman of the Board and Chairman, **Loews Corporation**

Senior Director, Federal Government Relations, **Wal-Mart**

Vice President, Public Policy and Advocacy, **International**

**Rescue Committee**

Executive Vice President, **Sesame Workshop**

Executive Vice President, **RTI International**

President & CEO, **InterAction**

Vice President, Public Policy, **UN Foundation**

Director, Advocacy & Government Relations, **World Vision**



## MEMORANDUM

To: Under Secretary Cathy Novelli, U.S. Department of State  
From: Liz Schroyer, USGLC President & CEO  
Re: USGLC Luncheon  
Date: October 20, 2015

We are honored you are joining us as our special guest on Friday, October 23rd. I have enclosed background information for the meeting and information on logistics. If you or your staff has any questions, please contact Emily Benovitz at (202) 730-4169 or ebenovitz@usglc.org. We look forward to a lively and engaging discussion with you and our leadership.

### 1. BACKGROUND AND LOGISTICS

---

- The luncheon provides an opportunity to engage you on your leadership on economic statecraft, on engaging and partnering with the private sector, and on the impact of science and technology in the fight to end extreme poverty.
- **Please arrive at the *Top of the Hay*, on the top level of The Hay Adams Hotel (800 16<sup>th</sup> Street NW) at 11:45 a.m.**
- The luncheon will begin promptly at 12:00 p.m. and conclude by 1:30 p.m.
- Participants include approximately 25-30 of the USGLC's senior leadership as well as other business and NGO leaders (*full participant list below*).
- The conversation is off-the-record and not for attribution. All remarks will be delivered informally from the table.

### 2. LUNCH FORMAT & DISCUSSION TOPICS

---

The lunch will begin with a brief introduction of the USGLC and its advocacy to strengthen diplomacy and development. You will be invited to deliver 10 minutes of remarks about the State Department's Economic Statecraft agenda and efforts to promote economic prosperity to address global challenges. We would especially welcome examples that highlight your efforts to build partnerships with the private sector, to foster innovation through science and technology, and to address the economic conditions that underlie countering violent extremism. This will be followed by a moderated conversation. Some questions may include:

- **Partnerships.** Many of us have seen a number of terrific partnerships at State. Yet these partnerships can sometimes seem a bit "one off." How are you working to integrate them into how you do business and make them more sustainable?
- **Economic Growth in Africa.** At the Africa Leaders Summit, you hosted an event with American business, such as Coca-Cola, UPS, Walmart, and Procter and Gamble that focused on promoting their participation in global supply chains in Africa. Where are you seeing results in this area?
- **Commercial Diplomacy.** Secretary Rice used to say that there were 200 of the fastest growing cities around the world with more than a million people where the United States



did not even have a diplomatic presence. How far have we come to address this challenge (and opportunity for American businesses) and what still needs to be done?

- **Technology and Global Development.** At the UN last month, you announced the launch of the “Global Connect” initiative, which aims to bring 1.5 billion people online by 2020. Can you tell us more and how this initiative promotes both sustainable global economic development and U.S. economic prosperity?
- **Wildlife Trafficking.** You traveled to Africa and highlighted the national security implications of terrorist groups like al-Shabaab drawing 40% of their funding from the illicit sales of endangered animals. How can State’s tools of economic statecraft contribute to countering this national security problem?
- **Trade and the Enabling Environment.** You work with Ambassador Rivkin on trade policy and programs at State. The link between trade and aid seems to be stronger than ever before. How can U.S. be more effective in promoting rule of law, fighting corruption, and strengthening local institutions to unlock trade with American businesses?
- **Power Africa.** You oversee the Energy Resources Bureau, which advances the necessary reforms for increasing foreign investment relating to the Power Africa initiative in the energy sector. What impact are you seeing from these efforts? How are you working with other government agencies like USAID on Power Africa?
- **Economy & Competitive Playing Field.** Foreign Policy magazine released its list of best countries for foreign investment, and 7 of top 10 are in developing world, where we also see enormous competition from countries like China. How are you strengthening the capacity of America’s diplomats to maintain a competitive edge in these countries?

### 3. LUNCHEON TIMELINE

---

- 11:45 a.m.      Guests Arrive**
- 12:00 p.m.      Program Begins**
- 12:05 p.m.      Welcome Remarks**
- 12:15 p.m.      USGLC Update**
- 12:22 p.m.      Introduction of Under Secretary Cathy Novelli**
- 12:25 p.m.      Opening Remarks – Under Secretary Cathy Novelli**
- 12:35 p.m.      Interactive Discussion – facilitated by Liz Schrayner, USGLC**
- 1:25 p.m.        Closing Remarks**
- 1:30 p.m.        Lunch Concludes**

### 4. ABOUT THE U.S. GLOBAL LEADERSHIP COALITION

---

- The **U.S. Global Leadership Coalition** is a broad-based influential network of 400 businesses and NGOs; national security and foreign policy experts; and business, faith-based, and community leaders in all 50 states who support a smart power approach of elevating diplomacy and development alongside defense in order to build a better, safer world.
- The USGLC is supported by an [Advisory Council](#) of prominent foreign policy and national security experts including all of the former Secretaries of State and former Cabinet officials, as well as former Members of Congress. Former Secretary of State Colin Powell serves as the Honorary Chair.
- The USGLC’s [National Security Advisory Council](#) is comprised of over 160 retired three- and four-star generals and flag officers committed to strengthening America’s national security strategy with the increased use of our non-military tools. Members of the National Security Advisory Council have sent letters to Congress in support of a strong and effective International Affairs Budget, met with senior lawmakers on Capitol Hill, and authored opinion pieces around the country.
- [Veterans for Smart Power](#) is a group of veterans of all ages and ranks who share a commitment to elevating and strengthening our non-military tools of global engagement. Launched in 2010, there are currently nearly 30,000 supporters of Veterans for Smart Power with active groups in 15 states across the country.

## 5. PARTICIPANT LIST

---

- Benjamin Bartlett, Manager, Global Policy Development, Facebook
- Tom Callahan, Vice President Government Affairs, PAE
- Stephanie Childs, Vice President, Federal Government Affairs and Head of Washington, D.C. Office, Pepsi Co
- Thomas Eldridge, Senior Vice President, Government Affairs, SAIC
- Kate Friedrich, Vice President, Global Government Affairs, Thomson Reuters
- Leslie Griffin, Senior Vice President, International Public Policy, UPS
- Jodi Hanson Bond, Vice President for the Americas, U.S. Chamber of Commerce
- Tara Hogan Charles, Senior Manager, Global Government Relations and Public Policy, Procter & Gamble
- Kate Irvin, Group Director Diplomatic Relations, Coca- Cola Company
- Martin Lowery, Executive Vice President of Member and Association Relations, NRECA
- Greta Lundeberg, Vice President, Strategy and Advocacy, The Boeing Company
- Lisa Malloy, Director of Policy Communications and Government Relations, Intel Corporation
- Todd Menotti, Senior Director, International Corporate Affairs, Tyson
- Paul Neureiter, Executive Director for International Affairs, AMGEN
- Nora O'Connell, Associate Vice President Public Policy and Advocacy, Save the Children
- Orion Poulin, Business Development Manager, Planson International
- Federica Rabiolo, Manager, External Affairs, eBay
- Ignacio Rodriguez, Marketing and Communications Director, Tetra Tech
- Kate Thompson, Principal, Deloitte Services LP
- Sarah Thorn, Senior Director, Federal Government Relations, Walmart
- Liz Schrayner, President & CEO, USGLC
- John Glenn, Policy Director, USGLC

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wed, 28 Oct 2015 11:22:40 -0400  
**To:** Brink, Bridget A  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]; EUR-Staff-Assistants-DL  
**Subject:** FW: for EUR FO clearance: S/ES 201515318 due 28-OCT-2015 12:00 PM: BCL for Novelli meeting with Blue Star Strategies re macro financial assistance for Ukraine  
**Attachments:** E Tasker Blue Star.pdf, 151027 Novelli Blue Star BCL.docx

Bridget, please see attached for your clearance. Thanks!

[REDACTED]  
EUR Staff Assistant  
(202) 736-7928

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 27, 2015 3:55 PM  
**To:** EUR-Staff-Assistants-DL  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** for EUR FO clearance: S/ES 201515318 due 28-OCT-2015 12:00 PM: BCL for Novelli meeting with Blue Star Strategies re macro financial assistance for Ukraine

Colleagues,

I just received Ukraine desk clearance on this and I'm moving it forward to the FO for clearance. The Tasker due date is tomorrow at 12 PM.

Thanks for your help, and please let me know if you have any questions.

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
U.S. Department of State  
Office of the Coordinator for Assistance to Europe and Eurasia (EUR/ACE)  
Tel: [202-647-6878](tel:202-647-6878)

SBU  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

SBU  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 26, 2015 10:56 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: E meeting with Blue Star Strategies

E has met with them before. They've indicated that they want to discuss Ukraine and noted the following:

- Blue Star has been engaged by the Open Society Foundation to work on economic aid for Ukraine
- Knowing of U/S Novelli's critical role in Ukraine loan agreement we would like to learn more about US capacity to grant greater economic aid to Ukraine
- We would like to brainstorm with the U/S on where more aid could be found from within the USG and learn how we could helpful

Best,

[REDACTED]

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 4:32 PM  
**To:** EUR-ERA-DL  
**Cc:** EUR-Staff Assistants-DL  
**Subject:** FW: New S/ES 201515318 Principal Tasker for E by EUR due on 28-Oct-2015 12:00:00 PM

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

See tasker due to staffers 10 am for DAS approval on 10/27, many thanks

**From:** EverestMail  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 4:28 PM  
**To:** Everest\_EUR  
**Cc:** Everest\_EB; Everest\_ENR; Everest\_EUR; Everest E-Mail  
**Subject:** New S/ES 201515318 Principal Tasker for E by EUR due on 28-Oct-2015 12:00:00 PM

A new E Tasker has been issued.

**CLASSIFICATION:** U – Unclassified  
**FOR:** E  
**ORGANIZATION:** EUR  
**CO-DRAFTER BUREAU:**  
**COPY TO:** E  
**SUBJECT:** U/S Novelli's Meeting with Karen Tramantano and Sally Painter  
**REQUESTED ACTION:** Briefing Checklist  
**CLEARANCES:** E;EB;ENR;EUR  
**DUE DATE:** 28-Oct-2015 12:00:00 PM  
**EVENT DATE:** 30-Oct-2015 02:30:00 PM  
**NOTES:**

**DESCRIPTION:** Please provide a fully-cleared BCL for U/S Novelli's meeting with Karen Tramantano and Sally Painter of Blue Star Strategies regarding their project with Open Society Foundation to work on economic aid for Ukraine. They would like to discuss the loan guarantee for Ukraine and the possibility for more assistance from the USG. Please include relevant TPs and background, including stats on our current assistance for Ukraine.

Bureaus and offices wishing to clear on this memo should contact the drafting bureau as soon as possible.

**CREATED BY:** E

**LINK:** [201515318 Tasker](#)

*Please note that this link will expire 2 weeks after the e-mail is sent, for security reasons. If this link is expired, please use the **Advanced Search** to find the package by typing in the S/ES ID number.*

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED

**Under Secretary Novelli's Meeting with Karen Tramontano and Sally Painter  
of Blue Star Strategies  
Friday, October 30, 2:30pm**

**CONTEXT**

(SBU) The Open Society Foundation (OSF), led by George Soros, retained Blue Star Strategies to assist them in promoting greater economic aid for Ukraine. Soros is a vocal proponent of greater macro financial assistance to Ukraine from Europe and the United States and is a frequent interlocutor with U.S. government principals on Ukraine issues. Blue Star Strategies is aware of your role in our sovereign loan guarantees for Ukraine, and would like to discuss the U.S. government's capacity to provide greater economic aid to Ukraine. **You should ask Blue Star Strategies for Soros' latest thinking and advocacy goals for Ukraine economic aid and convey that Ukraine assistance remains a top policy and assistance priority for the U.S. government.** You last met with Karen Tramontano from Blue Star Strategies on February 2, 2015.

**1. (SBU) New OSF Advocacy Effort for Ukraine: We are grateful to Mr. Soros and the Open Society Foundation for their continued engagement in Ukraine—I think we share many of the same goals. What is your current project with the Open Society Foundation?**

- Ask them about OSF's advocacy efforts with the Europeans.

**(SBU) Background:** Since the Ukraine crisis began in 2014, Soros has repeatedly emphasized the importance of the “new Ukraine” to Europe's future and argued that supporting Ukraine should be Europe's top priority, ahead of Greece, migration, and other challenges. Soros has articulated a strategy for Ukraine founded on strong political pressure on Russia; high levels of financial assistance for Ukraine, including large-scale budgetary support and political risk insurance; and radical economic and political reforms in Ukraine. Soros believes that the EU has not provided sufficient macro financial assistance to Ukraine. He recently published an updated “winning strategy for Ukraine” and again called on the EU to provide substantial macro financial assistance to Ukraine through its Macro-Financial Assistance mechanism (a tool allowing EU members to borrow funds from financial markets using the EU's AAA credit rating; the EU would need to modify the mechanism to use it on behalf of non-EU member Ukraine). He wants Ukraine's allies, by the end of 2015, to declare their commitment to do “whatever it takes” to enable Ukraine to survive and pursue far-reaching economic and political reforms. Among other things, this commitment would require

SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED

SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED

- 2 -

significantly more macro financial assistance to Ukraine. In the past, Soros has expressed general satisfaction with the level of U.S. support for Ukraine. He has directed his most vocal criticism at the EU, and his latest publication on Ukraine did not identify a new expectation of support from the U.S. government.

Nonetheless, OSF has enlisted Blue Star Strategies to help advocate for increased economic assistance for Ukraine, and they may have new requests, including for more advocacy with our European allies.

**2. (SBU) U.S. Support for Ukraine: Ukraine is a top policy and assistance priority for the United States. We have provided approximately \$569 million in assistance since the crisis began, to help Ukraine respond to the crisis, advance reforms, and strengthen institutions. In addition, President Obama intends to move forward with a third \$1 billion loan guarantee for Ukraine in the coming months.**

- We have also focused on reforms to improve the investment climate and promote growth in Ukraine's economy. It is critical for the Ukrainians to make progress on reforms and fight corruption, and our assistance is helping them implement these reforms.

**(SBU) Background:** The United States targets support to advance key reforms and promote security and stability (see the attached Ukraine assistance overview). The United States provided the Ukrainian government with \$1 billion loan guarantees in May 2014 and May 2015, and Secretary Pritzker announced, during a visit to Ukraine on October 26, that the President, working with Congress, intends to move forward with a third \$1 billion loan guarantee in the coming months. The United States and Ukraine must now negotiate the terms, including the conditions precedent.

**WATCH OUT FOR/IF RAISED**

**1. (SBU) Will the United States provide more macrofinancial assistance to Ukraine?: We are committed to Ukraine's success, and we are watching Ukraine's economic situation very closely. We will continue to consult with Congress as we make further assessments. Any determination of additional external financing needs beyond the loan guarantees we have already provided, or are working to provide, would depend on further IMF review.**

- We agree that Europe should do more to help Ukraine meet its financing needs, though this is a difficult task at the moment given Europe's other challenges. What are the winning arguments, in your view?

SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED



SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED

- 3 -

**(SBU) Background:** The United States has not made any macro financial commitments to Ukraine beyond the third \$1 billion loan guarantee. Further macro financial support commitments will require significant interagency and Congressional consultation, and would be contingent on IMF review.

(SBU) In the first half of 2015, Ukraine's economy contracted at a 15 percent annualized rate. Inflation exceeded 47 percent for the period year-on-year. Both the World Bank and the IMF believe the worst is over and anticipate GDP to stabilize in 2016, with potential growth at 1-2 percent thereafter as reforms continue. Fifty-nine banks have failed since the onset of the crisis, and the sector as a whole remains very fragile.

(SBU) So far in 2015, the IMF has disbursed \$6.7 billion of its \$17.5 billion Extended Fund Facility (EFF) for Ukraine. The first tranche of \$5 billion was disbursed on March 13, and a second tranche of \$1.7 billion was disbursed on July 31. Ukraine's next IMF review is scheduled in December 2015. Ukraine has also received over \$5 billion in financing commitments from bilateral donors, including a 1.8 billion Euro loan from the EU and a 500 million Euro loan from Germany.

(SBU) On August 27, Ukraine agreed in principle to a debt restructuring deal with private creditors to write off 20 percent of \$18 billion in debt, establish a four-year grace period for repayment, and restructure the remaining debt to mature over 2019-27 at a slightly higher rate and with a GDP growth-linked upside for creditors. The Rada approved and the creditors accepted the terms. Ukraine's \$3 billion Eurobond to Russia matures in December, and Russia has demanded payment in full, while Ukraine has indicated it intends to treat the Russian Eurobond on the same terms reached with its private creditors.

**PARTICIPANTS**

United States

Under Secretary Novelli

Other Country/Organization

Karen Tramontano, CEO, Blue Star Strategies  
Sally Painter, COO, Blue Star Strategies

Attachments:

- Tab 1 – Biographic Information for Blue Star Strategies
- Tab 2 – Ukraine Assistance Overview

SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED

Approved: EUR FO \_\_\_\_\_

Drafted: EUR/ACE, [REDACTED] ext. 7-6878, cell: [REDACTED]

Cleared:	E – Special Assistant	[REDACTED]	ok
	EUR/FO	[REDACTED]	info
	EUR/EE	[REDACTED]	ok
	EUR/ACE	[REDACTED]	ok
	EUR/ERA	[REDACTED]	ok
	ENR	[REDACTED]	ok
	EB/IFD/OMA	[REDACTED]	ok
	F/EUR	[REDACTED]	ok
	H	[REDACTED]	ok
	Treasury	[REDACTED]	info

## **Tab 1: Biographic Information**

**Karen A. Tramontano** is the Chief Executive Officer at Blue Star Strategies, LLC and provides corporate, institutional and public sector clients with results-oriented strategies. In her previous work experience Ms. Tramontano has played a critical role in shaping some of the most important global policy issues of our time, including China Permanent Normal Trade Relations, environmental and labor standards in multilateral, regional and bilateral trade agreements, world-wide poverty reduction strategies that focus on creating jobs and employing the Decent Work Agenda and global market expansion strategies for U.S. businesses.

From 1997 to 2001, Ms. Tramontano served as Deputy Chief of Staff to President Clinton and as counselor to two Chiefs of Staff, Erskine Bowles and John Podesta. Ms. Tramontano's White House portfolio encompassed a wide range of issues, including international trade and transatlantic relations, as well as economic and financial issues involving the U.S. Treasury and Department of Commerce. She played a major role in shaping policy concerning the World Trade Organization, the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development and other multilateral institutions, while handling public policy issues involving the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

**Sally A. Painter** is Co-Founder and Chief Operating Officer at Blue Star Strategies, LLC. Ms. Painter's work experience includes time spent at both the highest level of the U.S. government and at major corporations in the private sector. Given this diverse background, she provides corporate, institutional and public sector clients with results-oriented external affairs, foreign/security policy and business development strategies. In particular, Ms. Painter has an extensive track record working with Central Europe on security and policy issues, including representing many of these countries on their NATO and EU bids, as well as an historic Visa Equity Coalition of seven countries where legislation was passed in the U.S. Congress which allowed their citizens to enter the US visa-free.

Ms. Painter has also managed large-scale public-private projects, including as senior advisor on the global NATO Summits including: Washington, DC--1999, Prague -- 2002, Istanbul -- 2004 and Riga -- 2006. In this capacity, she worked directly with the leadership of the host country, CEOs of global corporations, the U.S. Congress, NATO Headquarters and the Bush and Clinton White Houses to promote and educate transatlantic leaders on the importance of the NATO Alliance. Ms. Painter is also a member of the Board of the US Committee on NATO.

**Tab 2: U.S. Assistance to Ukraine since February 2014**

As of October 16, 2015

The U.S. government has committed over \$569 million in assistance to Ukraine to respond to the crisis, advance reforms, and strengthen institutions. In addition, the U.S. government provided Ukraine with \$2 billion in loan guarantees.

Loan Guarantees (\$2 billion)

The United States provided the Ukrainian Government with a \$1 billion loan guarantee in May 2014 and followed this with a second \$1 billion loan guarantee in May 2015. The proceeds of these loan guarantees enable Ukraine to stabilize its economy and protect the most vulnerable households from the impact of needed economic adjustment.

Other Crisis-Response Assistance (approximately \$486 million)

Since Ukraine's change in government in February 2014, the United States has targeted additional assistance to advance key reforms and to promote security and stability. This assistance is focused in the following areas:

- **Senior Advisors** (\$5 million): Help Ukrainian ministries implement critical reforms.
- **Security** (approx. \$266 million): Provide training and non-lethal equipment and materiel to the Armed Forces, National Guard, and State Border Guard Service. This includes \$75 million in equipment to the Armed Forces through the European Reassurance Initiative.
- **Humanitarian** (approx. \$84 million): Support international and NGO efforts to meet the basic humanitarian needs of conflict victims and internally displaced persons.
- **Anti-Corruption and Rule of Law** (approx. \$40 million): Fight corruption, recover stolen assets, and advance justice sector and police reforms.
- **National Unity and Monitoring** (approx. \$23 million): Support constitutional reforms, decentralization, peace-building measures, and the OSCE Special Monitoring Mission.
- **Trade and Energy** (approx. \$17 million): Help diversify trade and enhance energy security.
- **Economic Stabilization, Reform, and Growth** (approx. \$16 million): Stabilize the economy, implement economic reforms, and build a foundation for sustainable growth.
- **Catalyze Early Recovery** (approx. \$19 million): Assist with economic recovery, small infrastructure repair, civilian counseling and rehabilitation in conflict affected areas in the east.
- **Democracy and Human Rights** (approx. \$12 million): Support democratic elections, independent media, access to information, and civil society support for human rights.
- **Other** (approx. \$3 million): Support for polio vaccinations, monitoring and evaluations of programs, and grants to support reform in a variety of sectors.

Previously Planned Assistance (nearly \$83 million)

U.S. crisis-response assistance complements long-term U.S. programs that support systemic reforms and build institutional capacity across a range of sectors, and help remediate the Chornobyl nuclear facility to a safe and secure condition.

**From:** E Duty Secretary  
**Sent:** Thu, 29 Oct 2015 15:11:22 -0400  
**To:** [REDACTED]; Duncan, John D; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Update - RE: Paper status for U/S Novelli - Friday, October 30, 2015

Thanks [REDACTED]!

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 29, 2015 3:11 PM  
**To:** E Duty Secretary; Duncan, John D; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Update - RE: Paper status for U/S Novelli - Friday, October 30, 2015

To All,

I have all papers except for the 11am. [REDACTED] will be provide later today (please make sure the paper is uploaded to the iPad). **All items are printed w/ Tabs.**

Per conversation with [REDACTED] - she will e-mail Cathy's Friday schedule tonight.

Thank you for your assistance!

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 29, 2015 12:16 PM  
**To:** E  
**Subject:** Paper status for U/S Novelli - Friday, October 30, 2015  
**Importance:** High

**\*\*\*I will be departing at 3pm. \*\*\***

--Please *see* Cathy's  
October 30<sup>th</sup> schedule  
below. **\*\*Note: Schedule  
may change. ☺\*\***  
--Note look ahead for  
**Monday, November 2<sup>nd</sup>**

**Thank you!**

## Catherine Novelli's Schedule Friday, October 30<sup>th</sup>

- 10:30 AM 2015 TechWomen Program Location:  
Dean Acheson Auditorium  
**Paper received**
- 11:00 AM Car reserved
- 11:45 AM **Trade Cabinet Principals Meeting**  
**White House Situation Room**
- 12:30 PM Car reserved
- 1:30 PM Lunch
- 2:00 PM **Amb. Nominee to Mozambique Dean**  
**Pittman**  
**Room 7256**
- 3:00 PM Blue Star Strategies- Karen  
Tramontano and Sally Painter  
Room 7256  
**Paper received**
- 4:00 PM Meeting with STAS Vaughan Turekian  
Room 7256
- 4:30 PM Weekly Meeting Amos Hochstein  
Room 7256
- 5:45 PM STAFF TIME

## U/S Catherine Novelli's Monday, November

- 8:30 AM – 9:05 AM E Family Assistant  
Meeting Room 7256  
**Agenda received**
- 9:15 AM – 9:45 AM (S) Senior Staff Meeting  
PCR - Room 7516
- 10:00 AM – 10:15 AM Call with Jennifer
- 12:30 PM – 2:00 PM **TENT** - Lunch with  
701 Penn Ave.
- 3:00 PM – 3:45 PM Bi-Weekly Meeting  
Room 7256
- **4:00 PM – 4:30 PM** **Bruce Stokes (Pev)**  
**7256**
- 5:00 PM – 5:45 PM STAFF TIME

☺ | Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment |  
Department of State | Washington, DC 20520 | Room 7256 | 202/647-8854 |

**From:**Sally Painter  
**Sent:**Fri, 6 Nov 2015 16:36:52 +0000  
**To:**Novelli, Catherine A  
**Cc:**Karen Tramontano  
**Subject:**Thank you

Dear Cathy,

Thank you again for taking the time to meet with me – and Karen by phone -- on Ukraine. Your insights and guidance were very helpful and much appreciated.

We are following-up with our team in Ukraine to better ascertain their views on funding, among other issues. Will keep you posted as this develops.

with warmest personal regards,

sally

Sally Painter  
Co-Founder and COO  
Blue Star Strategies

(+1) 202-833-1268 direct  
(+1) 202-822-9088 fax  
[sally.painter@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:sally.painter@bluestarstrategies.com)

888 17th Street NW, Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20006

[www.bluestarstrategies.com](http://www.bluestarstrategies.com)

**The information in this transmittal is privileged and confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are not the intended recipient(s) for the delivery of this transmittal, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify me at (+1) 202-833-1281**

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thu, 18 Feb 2016 11:58:56 -0500  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Duncan, John D; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Need your advice

Thanks! U/S Novelli is going to meet with them next Monday, 2pm. We're trying to find out more information directly from Blue Star Strategies – but wanted to check in to see if you all knew anything about it in the meantime. Would be great if you could sit in on the meeting if you are available.

Best regards,

[REDACTED]  
Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment  
Office: 202-647-4092  
[REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 18, 2016 11:57 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED] Montgomery, Molly C  
**Cc:** Duncan, John D; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Need your advice

[REDACTED]:

I am trying to figure out what this is about, but don't have a clear idea what they are referring to. We'd be happy to meet with them (or you) if that would be helpful. Let us know.

Thanks, [REDACTED]

SBU  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 18, 2016 11:47 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Duncan, John D; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Need your advice

Hi [REDACTED]  
No, but am looping in Ukraine desk colleagues, who may be familiar?  
Best.



SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 18, 2016 11:34 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Duncan, John D; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Need your advice

[REDACTED]

Do you know anything about this issue?

Best,

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 18, 2016 8:30 AM  
**To:** Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Duncan, John D  
**Subject:** RE: Need your advice

This originally came in as a call back request to me, it looked like an investment dispute, so I sent it to OIA. The original caller was a gentleman named Pero.

Per [REDACTED] Karen told him the same thing as written below, and then declined to say more, expressing a desire to brief Cathy personally. As Ukraine is known for colorful biznizmen, I can imagine some of the possible allegations. I'll ask [REDACTED] to inquire about the individual's name, so we can try and get some background prior to the meeting.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]  
Special Assistant  
Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment  
U.S. Department of State | Room 7256  
202-647-7448 | [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Dodman, Michael J  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 18, 2016 7:57 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Duncan, John D  
**Subject:** FW: Need your advice

█  
Please check with OIA and see what this is about.

---

**From:** Novelli, Catherine A  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 18, 2016 07:48  
**To:** Karen Tramontano  
**Cc:** Dodman, Michael J; █  
**Subject:** Re: Need your advice

Hi Karen,

Happy to meet with you. Copying █ who can make it happen on my schedule

Best,  
Cathy

Sent from my iPhone

On Feb 18, 2016, at 7:42 AM, Karen Tramontano <[Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com)> wrote:

<image001.gif>

Dear Undersecretary Novelli:

I have requested a meeting to discuss a matter on which I need your advice. I spoke to █ in your office yesterday to explain my reason for asking for a meeting. Essentially, the U.S. government has taken a position in a commercial matter regarding a Ukrainian individual and I believe the position is in error. I would like to give you a briefing and ask your advice in this matter. We are reaching out to your office and hopefully we could arrange a meeting in the upcoming week. Thank you in advance for your time.

Best regards  
Karen

Karen A. Tramontano  
Blue Star Strategies

<image002.png>

(+1) 202-833-1265 direct  
(+1) █  
(+1) 202-822-9088 fax

[karen.tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:karen.tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com)

888 17th Street NW, Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20006

[www.bluestarstrategies.com](http://www.bluestarstrategies.com)

The information in this transmittal is privileged and confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are not the intended recipient(s) for the delivery of this transmittal, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify me at (+1) 202-833-1281

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wed, 17 Feb 2016 16:54:24 -0500  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Follow up

[REDACTED] Ms. Karen Tramontano joined the call. She said that she knows CN from both her time in government and industry, and she requests a meeting (30 minutes of CN's time) to ask for her personal thoughts on a client matter. I have just a bit more facts, and could relay to you via phone.

(To clarify, this is personal to her knowing CN and is not / not a request to talk with subject matter experts.)

Thanks,

[REDACTED]

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 11, 2016 5:16 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Follow up

Sorry, all I know is that he works for someone Cathy knows, but the background is completely unknown. But it sounded like a likely OIA issue to me. Figured as the SMEs OIA was a better place to start.

Cheers-

[REDACTED]  
Special Assistant  
Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment  
U.S. Department of State | Room 7256  
202-647-7448 | [REDACTED]

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 11, 2016 4:52 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Follow up

[REDACTED] Just one initial question, do we know who this person is, or is it a cold call with no background on the incoming? Thanks, [REDACTED]

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 11, 2016 2:17 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** FW: Follow up

Hi [REDACTED],

Would you be kind enough to reach out to this guy and follow up with his request. You can also call him to get more details of the issues, if needed.

[REDACTED] suggested that I contact you since this would be more in your area of expertise.

Thanks,  
[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Pero Jolevski [<mailto:Pero.Jolevski@bluestarstrategies.com>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 10, 2016 10:16 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Follow up

Dear [REDACTED]

To follow up on our conversation, I was wondering if the office of the Undersecretary Novelli coordinates with the Justice Department. We would like to brief her on a case that involves a US investors in an international company (not a US company) on which we will file a case with the Justice Department.

Thank you  
Pero

Pero Jolevski  
Blue Star Strategies

(+1)-202-833-1281  
(+1)-202-822-9088 fax

[pero.jolevski@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:pero.jolevski@bluestarstrategies.com)

888 17th Street NW, Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20006

[www.bluestarstrategies.com](http://www.bluestarstrategies.com)

The information in this transmittal is privileged and confidential and is intended only for the

recipient(s) listed above. If you are not the intended recipient(s) for the delivery of this transmittal, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify me at (202) 833-1281

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Mon, 29 Feb 2016 12:43:18 -0500  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Burisma

RELEASE IN  
PART B6

CLEARED  
WITH EUR

B6  
B6  
B6

Appreciate it. U/S Novelli's meeting is tomorrow afternoon – so would be great to get something today if at all possible.

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Friday, February 26, 2016 5:58 PM  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Burisma

B6  
B6  
B6

Not yet. I will ask again. [redacted]

Declassified  
by Donald K.  
Holm, Senior  
Reviewer,  
October 9,  
2019

B6

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Friday, February 26, 2016 3:07 PM  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Burisma

B6  
B6  
B6

Patrick,

Checking in with you as to whether you have anything back from Post on this.

Thanks!

Best,

[redacted]

B6

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 24, 2016 5:18 PM  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Burisma

B6  
B6  
B6

[redacted] We will send it to Post overnight. My goal is to have an answer for you by Friday morning our time. In the meantime, please let me know if you have any questions or need further information.

B6

Cheers, [redacted]

B6

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 24, 2016 5:09 PM  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Burisma

B6

B6

B6

Appreciate it – just to flag, the meeting is on Tuesday, March 1 at 4pm.

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 24, 2016 5:07 PM  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Burisma

B6

B6

B6

Thanks [redacted] Give me a day or say and we'll check with Post. Cheers, [redacted]

B6

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 24, 2016 5:03 PM  
**To:** [redacted]  
**Cc:** [redacted]  
**Subject:** Burisma

B6

B6

B6

~~(C)~~ Per our conversation, Karen Tramontano of Blue Star Strategies requested a meeting to discuss with U/S Novelli USG remarks alleging Burisma (Ukrainian energy company) of corruption. She noted that two high profile U.S. citizens are affiliated with the company (including Hunter Biden as a board member). Tramontano would like to talk with U/S Novelli about getting a better understanding of how the U.S. came to the determination that the company is corrupt. According to Tramontano, there is no evidence of corruption, has been no hearing or process, and evidence to the contrary has not been considered. Would appreciate any background you may be able to provide on this issue and suggested TPs for U/S Novelli's meeting.

Thanks!

Best regards,



[Redacted]

Special Assistant

Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment

Office: 202-647-4092

Cell: [Redacted]

Email: [Redacted]

B6

B6

B6

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Mon, 29 Feb 2016 12:39:21 -0500  
**To:** [REDACTED] Bhardwaj, Manu; Dodman, Michael J; [REDACTED]; Duncan, John D; [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]; Haverkamp, Jennifer A; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Paper Status for U/S Novelli: Tuesday - March 1, 2016

**\*\*\*\* I will be departing today at  
3:15pm \*\*\*\***

--Please *see* Cathy's **March 1, 2016**  
schedule below. **\*\*Note: Schedule may  
change. 😊\*\***

--Please note look ahead for  
**Wednesday, March 2<sup>nd</sup>.**

*Thank you*

## Catherine Novelli's Schedule Tuesday, March 1

- 10:30 AM ACE Awards Ceremony  
Ben Franklin room on the 8th floor  
**Papers received**
- 9:45 AM (S) Deputies Senior Staff Meeting  
D Conference Room
- 12:00 PM E-Regional DAS Meeting  
Room 7356  
**Agenda received**
- 1:30 PM Lunch
- 2:30 PM **Hold for EU Commissioner for  
Transport - Bulc  
Room 7256**
- 3:30 PM **Hold for call with Kent Walker at  
Google**
- 4:30 PM **Karen Tramontano & John Buretta  
Blue Star Strategies  
Room 7256**
- 5:45 PM STAFF TIME

## U/S Catherine Novelli's Wednesday, March 2

- 9:15 AM – 10:15 AM **Brett Jenks, Pres  
Brett Jenks  
Room 7256**
- 10:30 AM – 12:30 PM **D3 Innovation F  
Competition  
Dean Acheson A**
- 12:30 PM – 2:00 PM E Staff Meeting  
Room 7256
- 2:30 PM – 4:45 PM **Voices for the W  
Action  
Dean Acheson A  
Agenda?**
- 5:00 PM – 6:00 PM **Voices for the W  
Action  
Benjamin Frankl  
Agenda?**
- 6:15 PM – 6:45 PM Screening on C S
- 8:30 PM – 9:00 PM **Media call on W  
Cathy will call fr  
be provided**

██████████ - ☺ | Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment |  
Department of State | Washington, DC 20520 | Room 7256 | 202/647-8854 | ██████████

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wed, 28 Sep 2016 13:31:38 -0400  
**To:** [REDACTED] Bhardwaj, Manu; Dodman, Michael J; Duncan, John D; [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] Haverkamp, Jennifer [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Paper Status for U/S Novelli: Thursday - September 29

--Please *see below* Cathy's **September 29<sup>th</sup>** schedule.

**\*\*Note: Schedule may change. 😊\*\***

--Please note look ahead for **Friday - September 30<sup>th</sup>**

## SCHEDULE FOR SECRETARY CATHERINE A. NOVELLI Thursday - September 29, 2016

8:30 AM – 9:45 AM (S) Deputies Senior Staff Meeting  
D Conference Room

9:45 AM – 10:45 AM Sir Michael Rake ,Chairman of BT  
Group  
Room 7256  
**Paper received**

10:45 AM – 11:30 AM Hold for John Habjan  
Room 7256

11:30 AM – 1:00 PM Lunch

1:00 PM – 1:30 PM Prep for Digital Life in Americas Event  
Room 7256  
**Agenda?**

1:30 PM – 2:00 PM **Ambassador Rena Bitter**  
**(New Amb to Laos)**  
**room 7256**

2:00 PM – 2:30 PM **Meeting with Karen Tramontano,**  
**Blue Star Strategies and Sharon**  
**Waxman- President & CEO of Fair**  
**Labor Association**  
**Room 7256**

2:30 PM – 3:30 PM Update on Ross Sea discussion with  
Titushkin  
Room 7256

3:30 PM – 4:00 PM Ocean Follow up meeting  
Room 7256

## SCHEDULE FOR UNDER SECRETARY CATHERINE A. Friday - September 30, 2016

8:30 AM – 9:00 AM Hold for Car

9:15 AM – 10:00 AM **Digital Life in the Americas**  
**(9:15am Start)**  
**Carnegie Endowment**  
**International Peace**  
**Massachusetts Avenue**  
**Washington, DC 20004**

10:30 AM – 11:00 AM Hold for Car

11:00 AM – 12:00 PM E-Staff Meeting  
Room 7256

12:00 PM – 1:00 PM Lunch

1:00 PM – 1:30 PM Shots for Africa Trip  
HST- Room B846

1:30 PM – 2:00 PM **Meeting with Ray M**  
**Moody's**  
**Room 7256**

2:00 PM – 3:00 PM **Principals Meeting t**  
**WHSR - JFK**

3:00 PM – 3:30 PM Remarks for Ambassador  
Clune's Retirement  
5th Floor reception  
**Remarks received**

4:00 PM – 4:45 PM STAFF TIME

PM – 4:30 PM

*Call with Ambassador Susan Levine*

+1-877-336-1829/ ACCESS CODE:

4724852

██████████ - ☺ | Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment |  
Department of State | Washington, DC 20520 | Room 7256 | 202/647-8854 | ██████████

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wed, 12 Oct 2016 13:16:05 -0400  
**To:** [REDACTED] Bhardwaj, Manu; Dodman, Michael J; Duncan, John D [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] Haverkamp, Jennifer A [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
Y  
**Subject:** Paper Status for U/S Novelli : Thursday - October 13, 2016

--Please see below Cathy's **October 13<sup>th</sup>** schedule.  
--Please note look ahead for **Friday - October 14<sup>th</sup>**.

***\*\*Note: Schedule may change. 😊\*\* Thank you!***

**SCHEDULE FOR  
SECRETARY CATHERINE A. NOVELLI  
Thursday - October 13, 2016**

8:00 AM - 9:30 AM *Hold* for possible call with  
Pakistan Minister  
**Paper received**

9:00 AM – 9:45 AM *Hold* for USTR TPP Interagency  
Meeting  
at USTR

9:15 AM – 9:45 AM (S) Deputies Senior Staff  
Meeting  
D Conference Room

10:00 AM – 10:00 AM Hold for Car

10:00 AM – 11:00 AM Karen Tramontano ( Blue Star  
Strategies)  
888 17th St NW Suite 800

11:00 AM – 11:30 AM Hold for Car

11:55 AM – 1:30 PM Lunch with Kathy Hadda

12:30 PM – 2:00 PM Marybeth Turner  
Room 7256

2:00 PM – 3:00 PM **TechWomen Emerging Leaders  
and Mentors**  
**Loy Henderson Auditorium**

3:30 PM – 4:15 PM Ed Wytkind, AFL-CIO President,  
and Larry Willis, AFL-CIO  
Secretary-Treasurer  
Room 7256  
**Paper received**

4:15 PM – 4:45 PM **Call w/ New Zealand Deputy**

**SCHEDULE FOR  
UNDER SECRETARY CATHERINE A. NOVELLI  
Friday - October 14, 2016**

8:30 AM – 9:00 AM Hold for Car

9:00 AM – 10:00 AM **NAM's Trade Forum**  
**733 10th NW**

10:00 AM – 10:30 AM Hold for Car

11:00 AM – 11:45 AM Meeting with Christi  
Sepulveda  
Room 7256

12:00 PM – 1:30 PM E-Staff Meeting  
Room 7256

1:30 PM – 2:30 PM **Meeting with AfD**  
**Room 7256**

3:00 PM – 3:30 PM **The Aluminum Assn**  
**Room 7256**

5:00 PM – 5:45 PM STAFF TIME



**Secretary Lucy Duncan**

**Room 7256**

00 PM – 5:30 PM Mandatory Email Interface  
Training

30 PM – 5:45 PM STAFF TIME

██████████ - ☺ | Office of the Under Secretary for Economic Growth, Energy, and the Environment |  
Department of State | Washington, DC 20520 | Room 7256 | 202/647-8854 | ██████████

**From:**Novelli, Catherine A  
**Sent:**Mon, 24 Oct 2016 14:34:14 -0400  
**To:**[REDACTED]  
**Cc:**[REDACTED];Duncan, John D  
**Subject:**FW: Cambodia  
**Attachments:**Cambodia Description.pdf, ATT00001.txt

FYI -- We could use this as a jumping off point for Pakistan labor, perhaps.

Cathy

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Karen Tramontano [<mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com>]  
**Sent:** Friday, October 21, 2016 5:47 PM  
**To:** Novelli, Catherine A  
**Subject:** Cambodia

Based on our discussion about Ukraine attached is a 2-pager outlining the work we did in Cambodia This model may be helpful to Pakistan all the best karen



## Cambodia

*local solutions for a global economy*

Our Work

### Growth Strategy in an Era of Free Trade



For poor nations highly dependent on textile and garment exports, the 2005 expiration of the textile quota system (the Multi-Fiber Agreement or MFA) had the potential to be devastating to their national economies. Nowhere is this fear more genuine than in Cambodia, whose economy is more dependent on textiles and garment manufacturing than any other in the world. However, unlike most textile producing countries, Cambodia has a unique advantage in the post-quota environment; a labor rights verification system administered by the International Labor Organization that provides rights protection to Cambodians and brand security to buyers.

#### The Challenge

**Can Cambodia's success story be sustained as its preferential access to lucrative markets is eliminated?**

Can its approach to promoting business and labor interests be reproduced in other countries?

With support from the World Bank Group and the US-ASEAN Business Council, in 2004 GFI designed and implemented an engagement process to explore ways to use this uniquely just, innovative advantage to protect and expand Cambodia's textile exports. Joined by the European Commission, Australia AID, and

the United Nations Development Program, in February 2005 we organized a 2-day conference of leading CEOs, government officials, and other trade and development experts to discuss Cambodia's unique opportunities in the global marketplace. Hosted by the Royal Government of Cambodia, the conference highlighted Cambodia's leadership potential in defining new best practices in global trade and investment, and the many reforms aimed at making Cambodia a premier destination for business.

#### How GFI Addressed the Challenge

In July 2005, GFI collaborated with the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace and Oxfam America to bring the discussion to American policymakers. More than 200 experts from government, industry, and civil society joined us for a wide-ranging discussion of the fate of textile workers and industries in the 21st century.

2122 P St. NW, Suite 302  
Washington, DC 20037  
Tel. 202-898-9022  
info@globalfairness.org  
www.globalfairness.org

In 2006, GFI began to extend its work on textiles to other regions of the world, focusing first on the countries participating in the US-Central America Free Trade Agreement. Our efforts to make the global economy work for poor producers is helping bridge the gap between Central American industry, labor, and government, thereby increasing the prospects of better lives for workers and healthier profits for industry (see our hand-out on the Central America Work Program).

In 2006, GFI began to extend its work on textiles to other regions of the world, focusing first on the countries participating in the US-Central America Free Trade Agreement. Our efforts to make the global economy work for poor producers is helping bridge the gap between Central American industry, labor, and government, thereby increasing the prospects of better lives for workers and healthier profits for industry (see our hand-out on the Central America Work Program)



---

To learn more about this project please contact  
Caleb Shreve [caleb@globalfairness.org](mailto:caleb@globalfairness.org)

Sent from my iPhone

**From:**Nuland, Victoria J  
**Sent:**Wed, 30 Mar 2016 16:28:04 -0400  
**To:**Pyatt, Geoffrey R [REDACTED]  
**Subject:**RE: UA lobbyist

And they can't spell the President's name

---

**From:** Pyatt, Geoffrey R  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 30, 2016 12:18 AM  
**To:** Nuland, Victoria J; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** UA lobbyist

So I see below Ukraine hired a new lobbyist – same firm that saw Kathy Novelli complaining about my pressure on the PGO's cover-up of the case against the disgraced Yanukovich era environment minister....

From: Karen Tramontano [<http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com>]  
Sent: Monday, March 28, 2016 11:21 AM  
To: McDonough, Denis R. EOP/WHO <[REDACTED]>  
Subject: Possible meeting

Dear Dennis,

I know you are extraordinarily busy – so I hesitate to even write. I am assisting the Office of the President (Ukraine) with his upcoming visit to the US. His Chief of Staff, Boris Lozhkin has asked whether it would be possible to meet you. While Lozhkin will be with President Porachenko throughout the visit, he will not be attending the dinner President Obama is hosting on 3/31 and wondered whether it would be possible to meet you during that time or if there is another time that would be more convenient for you ?Currently, Lozhkin arrives with the President on 3/30 and leaves with him on 4/1. Thank you Dennis for your consideration. I do hope you are doing well.

My best regards

Karen

Karen A. Tramontano

Blue Star Strategies

(+1) 202-833-1265 direct

 mobile

(+1) 202-822-9088 fax

[karen.tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:karen.tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com)  
<<http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=mailto:patrick.boland@bluestarstrategies.com>>

888 17th Street NW, Suite 800

Washington, DC 20006

>[www.bluestarstrategies.com](http://www.bluestarstrategies.com)<

The information in this transmittal is privileged and confidential and is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are not the intended recipient(s) for the delivery of this transmittal, you are hereby notified that any unauthorized distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify me at (+1) 202-833-1281

SBU  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:**Karen Tramontano  
**Sent:**Mon, 24 Oct 2016 19:14:19 +0000  
**To:**Novelli, Catherine A  
**Subject:**RE: Cambodia

Should have said based on our discussions about Pakistan ....sorry about that ... too many balls in the air.

-----Original Message-----

From: Novelli, Catherine A [REDACTED]  
Sent: Monday, October 24, 2016 2:34 PM  
To: Karen Tramontano <Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com>  
Subject: RE: Cambodia

Thanks a million, Karen. This is very helpful.

Cathy

-----Original Message-----

From: Karen Tramontano [<mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com>]  
Sent: Friday, October 21, 2016 5:47 PM  
To: Novelli, Catherine A  
Subject: Cambodia

Based on our discussion about Ukraine attached is a 2-pager outlining the work we did in Cambodia This model may be helpful to Pakistan all the best karen



**From:** Karen Tramontano Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com  
**Subject:** Re: Updated Bio  
**Date:** November 7, 2016 at 4:58 PM  
**To:** C Novelli cnovelli@mac.com



in Iowa !

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 7, 2016, at 3:51 PM, C Novelli <[cnovelli@mac.com](mailto:cnovelli@mac.com)> wrote:

Hi Karen,

Just forwarding you an updated bio in case it is useful. My fingers are crossed for tomorrow! Thanks a million for all of your help and insight.

Best,  
Cathy

Sent from my iPad

 <Cathy's bio (personal).docx>

**From:** Karen Tramontano Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com  
**Subject:** Re: Looking forward to Lunch  
**Date:** December 2, 2019 at 8:06 AM  
**To:** Catherine Novelli cnovelli@mac.com

---



Ditto

Sent from my iPhone

On Dec 2, 2019, at 7:58 AM, Catherine Novelli <[cnovelli@mac.com](mailto:cnovelli@mac.com)> wrote:

See you soon at Equinox.

Best,  
Cathy

Sent from my iPad

**From:** Catherine Novelli cnovelli@mac.com  
**Subject:** Re: Great to see you !  
**Date:** December 3, 2019 at 11:38 AM  
**To:** Karen Tramontano Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com



Dear Karen,

Wonderful to see you yesterday! Thanks for the article. I'm looking forward to reading it and discussing. I am very interested in potentially doing some joint work. Like you, I just want to work with people I like.

Thanks too for the potential introduction to the think tanks. I want to give it some thought before I approach any organization/s and do my due diligence to see where the best fit would be.

My Georgetown class ends tomorrow so I should have some time to research after that.

Merry Christmas! Looking forward to staying in touch and finding opportunities to collaborate.

Best,  
Cathy

Sent from my iPhone

On Dec 3, 2019, at 10:20 AM, Karen Tramontano <[Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com](mailto:Karen.Tramontano@bluestarstrategies.com)> wrote:

Dear Cathy:

It was great to see you! Thank you again for reaching out – I cannot express how much it meant to me. I'm including the link to the Atlantic Council issues. AC received a \$30million grant from Rockefeller for "resilient cities". I remembered it wrong – its focus is on climate change and security – but there may be a fit with your work in that "issue" block or in the business and economy issue block. I used to be on AC's Board – Sally is now on the Board – so we have fairly good access at least for an introduction. We also were with CSIS, German Marshall Fund and a little with Brookings and Carnegie. We did more with Brookings when Strobe was Chair – I don't know the new leadership as well. Please let me know after you've given it some thought whether introductions would be helpful.

Below is a link to my trade article – the 3<sup>rd</sup> section may be of most interest although the 2<sup>nd</sup> section on development may also be relevant.

Finally – the link to my "quote" in the WSJ article which followed the first smaller article.

Thanks again ...have a wonderful Christmas holiday. Let's talk again soon – especially as you are thinking through your next steps. We will also be on the "look out" for some joint "pitches" where we could have an opportunity to work together. If you have any ideas – please let me know.

All the very best  
Karen

<https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/issues/>

Trade Article: <https://pellcenter.org/tearing-up-trade-agreements-wont-help-workers-a-more-responsible-approach-just-may/>

WSJ Article: <https://www.wsj.com/articles/ukraine-companys-campaign-to-burnish-its-image-stretched-beyond-hunter-biden-11573154199>

- *“Ms. Tramontano said she has known and worked with Ms. Novelli for years, and didn’t mention Mr. Biden’s name in order to secure the meeting.”*